

ITEM NO.17

COURT NO.7

SECTION XI -A,  
XVI, XVI-A, XVII,  
X, XII

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Civil Appeal Nos. 3381-3400/1998

STATE OF KERALA AND OTHERS

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

FR.WILLIAM FERNANDEZ ETC ETC

Respondent(s)

(With appln(s) for intervention)

WITH

C.A. No. 9505/2017 (XVI)  
T.C. (C) No. 149/2013 (XVI-A)  
T.C. (C) No. 13/2004 (XVI -A)  
C.A. No. 3592/1998 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 4651/1998 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 918/1999 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 5385/2002 (XVI)  
C.A. NOS. 3720-3722/2003 (XI-A)  
C.A. No. 6331/2003 (XVI)  
W.P. (C) No. 574/2003 (X)  
W.P. (C) No. 66/2004 (X)  
SLP(C) No. 1101/2007 (XVII)  
SLP(C) No. 10694/2007 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 9054/2007 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 12959/2007 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 13806/2007 (XVI)  
C.A. No. 6177/2010 (XI-A)  
C.A. No. 6178/2010 (XI-A)  
C.A. No. 6179/2010 (XI-A)  
SLP(C) No. 18088/2007 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 6180/2010 (XI-A)  
SLP(C) No. 18044/2007 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 15082-15085/2007 (XII)  
SLP(C) No. 746/2008 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 747/2008 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 742/2008 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 5407/2008 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 5408/2008 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 6831/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 7914/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 8204/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 9227/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 12424-12425/2008 (XI -A)

SLP (C) No. 15161/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15540/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15369/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15551/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17204/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 19030/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15579/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15357/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15700/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16772/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17865/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15623/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15495/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15934/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15647/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16930/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15496/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15491/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16865/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18346/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15356/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15492/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15845/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16926/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15405/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15684/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16832/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15666/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15636/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15498/2008 (XVI)  
SLP (C) No. 15493/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16754/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16733/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16689/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17193/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18379/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18344/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16667/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18354/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17233/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17203/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15711/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15618/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16664/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16885/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17892/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17192/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15179/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 20795/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 15643/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 19141/2008 (XI -A)

C. A. Nos. 3381-3400/1998 etc.

SLP (C) No. 18857/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 19849/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 19847/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 19867/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18360-18364/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18865/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 22083/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 22735/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 22086/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 21819/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18405/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 23075/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 23609/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 22707/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 21107/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 22931/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 23623/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 20766/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 20165/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 22081/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 23277/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 22084/2008 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 5041-5042/2008 (XVI)  
SLP (C) No. 22100-22101/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 23270/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 26750/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 19986/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 23077/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 26377/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 26593/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 27442-27444/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 17394-17396/2009 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 29764/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 29763/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 26543/2008 (XVI)  
SLP (C) No. 3276/2009 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 29194/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 29196/2008 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 9548/2009 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 11646/2009 (XVI)  
SLP (C) No. 25390/2009 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 25467/2009 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 23990/2009 (IV-A)  
SLP (C) No. 33663-33665/2009 (IV-A)  
SLP (C) No. 35038/2009 (IV-A)  
SLP (C) No. 1820/2010 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 2042/2011 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 6762/2010 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 2041/2011 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 4387/2010 (XVI)  
SLP (C) No. 2459/2010 (XI -A)

C. A. Nos. 3381-3400/1998 etc.

SLP (C) No. 12690/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 4390/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 4389/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 4388/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 6763/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 6765/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 4362/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 5309/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 4511/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 3387/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 4572/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 7929/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 7356/2010 (XVI)  
SLP (C) No. 19194/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 9022/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 9077/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 9723/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 11419/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 9702/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 10361/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 14886/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16694/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 16720/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 18318/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 19199/2010 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 13526/2011 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8239/2017 (XII-A)  
SLP (C) No. 36486/2010 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 5860/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 5861/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 3267/2012 (III-A)  
C.A. No. 4210/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 3268-3270/2012 (III-A)  
C.A. No. 3266/2012 (III-A)  
C.A. No. 8734/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 33923/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 33954/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8738/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8737/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8736/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8740/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8739/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8735/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8741/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8744/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 9292/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 37712/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 8745/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 40147/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 36187/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP (C) No. 40146/2012 (XI -A)

C. A. Nos. 3381-3400/1998 etc.

SLP(C) No. 37455/2012 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 9293/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 37728/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 37708-37709/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 38304/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 38919/2012 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 449/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 1426/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 9693-9695/2013 (XVI)  
SLP(C) No. 8939/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 9844/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 16867/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 16869/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 16870/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 11060/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 10516/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 16744-16746/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 17156-17157/2013 (XII-A)  
SLP(C) No. 27001-27002/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 32256/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 30986/2013 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 33600/2013 (XI -A)  
C.A. No. 9214/2014 (IV-A)  
SLP(C) No. 29119/2014 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 8231/2015 (XIV)  
SLP(C) No. 22349/2015 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 72/2016 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 2057/2016 (XI -A)  
SLP(C) No. 86/2016 (XI -A)  
  
SLP(C) No. 16820/2016 (XI -A)

Date : 26-07-2017 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ASHOK BHUSHAN

For Parties

Mr. Dinesh Kumar Garg, AOR

Mr. Kanchan Kaur Dhodi, AOR

Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR

Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR

Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Vanita Bhargava, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Bhargava, Adv.  
Ms. Abhisaar Bairagi, Adv.  
M/s. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Mr. P. S. Sudheer, Adv.  
Mr. Rishi Maheshwari, Adv.  
Ms. Anne Mathew, Adv.  
Ms. Shruti Jose, Adv.  
Ms. Subhoshree Sil, Adv.

Mr. A. K. Panda, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. R. K. Rathor, Adv.  
Mr. Vikas Bansal, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Bahadur, Adv.  
Mr. B. Krishna Prasad, AOR

Mr. K. C. Kaushik, Adv.  
Ms. Bhuvneshwari Pathak, Adv.  
Ms. Shilpi Satyapriya Satyam, Adv.  
Mr. Rahul Kaushik, Adv.

Mr. Shreekant N. Terdal, AOR

Mr. G. Prakash, AOR  
Mr. Jishnu M. L., Adv.  
Ms. Priyanka Prakash, Adv.  
Ms. Beena Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Aditya K. Dubey, Adv.  
Mr. Vinay Garg, Adv.

Mr. A. P. Datar, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. U. A. Rana, Adv.  
Mr. Himanshu Mehta, Adv.  
Mr. Avirat Kumar, Adv.  
M/s. Gagrat And Co, AOR

Mr. Sibho Sankar Mishra, AOR

M/s Mitter & Mitter Co., AOR

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR  
Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR  
Mr. M. Paikaray, Adv.

Mr. P. K. Manohar, AOR

Mr. Rahul Sateerja, Adv.  
Ms. B. Vijayalakshmi Menon, AOR  
Ms. Anuradha Dutt, Adv.  
Ms. Ameya Pant, Adv.

Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR

Mr. Vikash Singh, AOR

Mr. D. K. Singh, Adv.

Ms. Komal Mundhra, Adv.

Mr. Saurabh Agrawal, Adv.

Mr. Abhijit Sengupta, AOR

Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR

Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR

Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR

Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR

Mr. Merusagar Samantaray, AOR

Dr. G. C. Bharuka, Sr. Adv.

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Kumar Ajit Singh, Adv.

Mr. Praveen Kumar, AOR

Ms. Babita Sant, Adv.

Mr. Ramesh Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Rajiv Agnihotri, Adv.

Ms. Bina Gupta, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Ms. Anil Katiyar, AOR

M/s. Venkat Palwai Law Associates, AOR

Mr. Devashish Bharuka, AOR

Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR

M/s. Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR

Mr. Kedar Nath Tripathy, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Gupta II, AOR

Mr. Ashok Panigrahi, AOR

Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR

Mr. K. K. Mani, AOR

Mr. Ajay Choudhary, AOR

M/s. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, AOR

Mr. Shishir Deshpande, AOR

Mr. B. Balaji, AOR

Mr. Romy Chacko, AOR

Mr. Pramit Saxena, AOR

Mr. Gopal Prasad, AOR

Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR

Mr. C. D. Singh, AOR

Mr. C. K. Sucharita, AOR

Mr. Arvind P. Datar, Sr. Adv.

Mr. M. P. Devanath, AOR

Mr. Vivek Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Anand, Adv.

Mr. Udit Jain, Adv.

Mr. Somnath Shukla, Adv.

Ms. Ashwini Chandrasekaran, Adv.

Mr. Praveen Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Harish Pandey, Adv.

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR

Ms. Akriti Chaubey, Adv.

Ms. Tanya Shree, Adv.

Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, Adv.

Dr. Rajeev Sharma, AOR

Mr. M. Paikaray, Adv.

Mr. R. Chandrachud, AOR

Mr. Sudarsh Menon, AOR

Mr. Kishore Kunal, AOR

Mr. A. Venayagam Balan, AOR

Ms. Suruchii Aggarwal, AOR

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR  
Mr. N. A. Usmani, Adv.

Mrs. Kirti Renu Mishra, AOR

Mr. Bijoy Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR

Mr. K. V. Bharathi Upadhyaya, AOR

Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR

Mr. C. K. Sucharita, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR  
Ms. Vimla Sinha, Adv.  
Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.  
Mr. Manish Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Pranab Prakash, Adv.  
Mr. Shivam Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Raina, Adv.  
Mr. Shreyas Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Kumar Milind, Adv.  
Ms. Ambika Gautam, Adv.

Mr. C. N. Sree Kumar, AOR

Mr. Praveen Kumar, AOR

Mr. C. S. N. Mohan Rao, AOR

Mr. Rabin Majumder, AOR

Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR

Mr. M. P. Vinod, AOR

Mr. Baby Krishnan, AOR

Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR  
Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR  
Mr. R. Sathish, AOR  
Mr. Rajiv Mehta, AOR  
Mr. M. T. George, AOR  
Mr. Suwendu Suvasis Dash, AOR  
Mr. A. V. Rangam, AOR  
Mr. Abhijat P. Medh, AOR  
Mr. Punit Dutt Tyagi, AOR  
Mr. Y. Raja Gopala Rao, AOR  
Mr. Prem Prakash, AOR  
Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR  
Mr. Y. Prabhakara Rao, AOR  
Ms. Meera Mathur, AOR  
M/s. Lawyer S Knit & Co, AOR  
Mrs. Shally Bhasin, AOR  
Mr. Sanjeeb Panigrahi, AOR  
Mr. Jagjit Singh Chhabra, AOR  
Mr. T. G. Narayanan Nair, AOR  
Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR  
Mr. Atul Jha, Adv.  
Mr. Sandeep Jha, Adv.  
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR  
Mr. Deba Prasad Mukherjee, AOR  
Mr. R. V. Kameshwaran, AOR  
Mr. Prabha Swami, AOR

Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR

Mr. Krishnayan Sen, AOR

Mr. Asiya Khan, Adv.

Mr. Uddyam Mukherjee, Adv.

Mr. B. S. Banthia, AOR

Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR

Mr. A. Radhakrishnan, AOR

Mr. M. K. Dua, AOR

Mr. G. N. Reddy, AOR

Mr. D. S. Chauhan, AOR

Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR

Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, AOR

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Ghosh, Adv.

Mr. Parijat Sinha, AOR

Mr. Devashish Bharuka, AOR

Mr. Rajesh Prasad Singh, AOR

Mr. C. Balakrishna, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R

The matters be listed on 27<sup>th</sup> July, 2017.

(NIDHI AHUJA)  
COURT MASTER

(MALA KUMARI SHARMA)  
COURT MASTER