

è'1

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA  
CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION  
CIVIL APPEAL NO(S).6914 of 2007  
STATE OF KERALA & ANR. APPELLANT(S)

VERSUS

THRESSIAMMA L.CHIRAYIL  
WITH

RESPONDENT(S)

C.A. NO.6849/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14819/2007)  
C.A. NO.6850/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14820/2007)  
C.A. NO.6851/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14821/2007)  
C.A. NO.6852/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14823/2007)  
C.A. NO.6854/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14824/2007)  
C.A. NO.6853/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14826/2007)  
C.A. NO.6856/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14828/2007)  
C.A. NO.6859/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14829/2007)  
C.A. NO.6861/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14830/2007)  
C.A. NO.6870/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14832/2007)  
C.A. NO.6871/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14833/2007)  
C.A. NO.6882/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14835/2007)  
C.A. NO.68883/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14837/2007)

2

C.A. NO.6896/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14838/2007)  
C.A. NO.6907/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14839/2007)  
C.A. NO.6909/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14841/2007)  
C.A. NO.6924/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14842/2007)  
C.A. NO.6925/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14845/2007)  
C.A. NO.6940/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 14846/2007)  
C.A. NO.6948/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17589/2007)  
C.A. NO.6957/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO.17907/2007)  
C.A. NO.6960/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.17908/2007)  
C.A. NO.6961/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.17909/2007)  
C.A. NO.6972/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17910/2007)  
C.A. NO.6974/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17911/2007)  
C.A. NO.6983/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17913/2007)  
C.A. NO.6984/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17915/2007)  
C.A. NO.6995/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17916/2007)  
C.A. NO.6996/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17917/2007)

3

C.A. NO.6997/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17918/2007)  
C.A. NO.6998/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17919/2007)  
C.A. NO.7002/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17920/2007)  
C.A. NO.7004/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17921/2007)  
C.A. NO.7006/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17922/2007)  
C.A. NO.7007/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17923/2007)  
C.A. NO.7015/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17924/2007)  
C.A. NO.7016/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17925/2007)  
C.A. NO.7017/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17926/2007)  
C.A. NO.7018/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17929/2007)  
C.A. NO.7028/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17930/2007)  
C.A. NO.7029/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17934/2007)  
C.A. NO.7043/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17936/2007)  
C.A. NO.7044/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17937/2007)  
C.A. NO.7056/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17938/2007)  
C.A. NO.7063/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17939/2007)  
C.A. NO.7074/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17941/2007)

4

C.A. NO.7075/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17942/2007)  
C.A. NO.6876/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17943/2007)  
C.A. NO.6875/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17944/2007)  
C.A. NO.6872/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17957/2007)  
C.A. NO.6873/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17959/2007)  
C.A. NO.6874/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17960/2007)  
C.A. NO.6887/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17961/2007)  
C.A. NO.6886/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17962/2007)  
C.A. NO.6885/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17963/2007)  
C.A. NO.6890/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17964/2007)  
C.A. NO.6895/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17965/2007)  
C.A. NO.6891/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17972/2007)  
C.A. NO.6892/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17973/2007)  
C.A. NO.6894/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17974/2007)  
C.A. NO.6893/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17975/2007)  
C.A. NO.6908/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17976/2007)

C.A. NO.6889/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17977/2007)

5

C.A. NO.6888/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17978/2007)  
C.A. NO.6911/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17979/2007)  
C.A. NO.6916/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17980/2007)  
C.A. NO.6914/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17982/2007)  
C.A. NO.6915/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17983/2007)  
C.A. NO.6917/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18037/2007)  
C.A. NO.6912/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18038/2007)  
C.A. NO.6910/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18039/2007)  
C.A. NO.6918/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18040/2007)  
C.A. NO.6913/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18041/2007)  
C.A. NO.6939/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18042/2007)  
C.A. NO.6938/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18043/2007)  
C.A. NO.6937/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18045/2007)  
C.A. NO.6933/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18046/2007)  
C.A. NO.6936/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18047/2007)  
C.A. NO.6935/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18048/2007)  
C.A. NO.6932/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18049/2007)

6

C.A. NO.6934/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18050/2007)  
C.A. NO.6868/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18051/2007)  
C.A. NO.6869/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18053/2007)  
C.A. NO.6881/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18054/2007)  
C.A. NO.6879/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18055/2007)  
C.A. NO.6877/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18056/2007)  
C.A. NO.6880/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18058/2007)  
C.A. NO.6878/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18061/2007)  
C.A. NO.6902/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18062/2007)  
C.A. NO.6900/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18063/2007)  
C.A. NO.6901/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18064/2007)  
C.A. NO.6899/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18066/2007)  
C.A. NO.6905/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18067/2007)  
C.A. NO.6903/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18068/2007)  
C.A. NO.6904/2017

(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18073/2007)  
C.A. NO.6906/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18074/2007)  
C.A. NO.6897/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18075/2007)

7

C.A. NO.6898/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18076/2007)  
C.A. NO.6922/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18077/2007)  
C.A. NO.6923/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18078/2007)  
C.A. NO.6919/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18080/2007)  
C.A. NO.6921/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18081/2007)  
C.A. NO.6920/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18083/2007)  
C.A. NO.6929/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18084/2007)  
C.A. NO.6930/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18085/2007)  
C.A. NO.6928/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18086/2007)  
C.A. NO.6927/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18087/2007)  
C.A. NO.6926/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18089/2007)  
C.A. NO.6941/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18090/2007)  
C.A. NO.6942/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18092/2007)  
C.A. NO.6947/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19049/2007)  
C.A. NO.6944/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19050/2007)  
C.A. NO.6943/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19051/2007)  
C.A. NO.6946/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19052/2007)

8

C.A. NO.6945/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19053/2007)  
C.A. NO.6963/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19055/2007)  
C.A. NO.6969/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19057/2007)  
C.A. NO.6967/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19060/2007)  
C.A. NO.6968/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19062/2007)  
C.A. NO.6971/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19066/2007)  
C.A. NO.6965/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19068/2007)  
C.A. NO.6964/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19070/2007)  
C.A. NO.6966/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19071/2007)  
C.A. NO.6970/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19073/2007)  
C.A. NO.6978/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19076/2007)  
C.A. NO.6976/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19077/2007)  
C.A. NO.6980/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19095/2007)

C.A. NO.6977/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19096/2007)  
C.A. NO.6982/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19099/2007)  
C.A. NO.6975/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19100/2007)  
C.A. NO.6981/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19101/2007)

9

C.A. NO.6979/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19102/2007)  
C.A. NO.6985/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19103/2007)  
C.A. NO.6987/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19105/2007)  
C.A. NO.6989/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19106/2007)  
C.A. NO.6990/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19107/2007)  
C.A. NO.6991/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19108/2007)  
C.A. NO.6988/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19113/2007)  
C.A. NO.6986/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19114/2007)  
C.A. NO.6992/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19505/2007)  
C.A. NO.6994/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19506/2007)  
C.A. NO.6993/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19507/2007)  
C.A. NO.7010/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19508/2007)  
C.A. NO.7009/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19510/2007)  
C.A. NO.7013/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19511/2007)  
C.A. NO.7008/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19512/2007)  
C.A. NO.7011/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19513/2007)  
C.A. NO.7014/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19514/2007)

10

C.A. NO.7012/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19515/2007)  
C.A. NO.6999/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19516/2007)  
C.A. NO.7000/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19518/2007)  
C.A. NO.7019/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19521/2007)  
C.A. NO.7001/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO.19522/2007)  
C.A. NO.7022-27/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NOS.19523-19528/2007)  
C.A. NO.7020/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.19529/2007)  
C.A. NO.7021/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19530/2007)  
C.A. NO.7030/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19531/2007)  
C.A. NO.7031-7035/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NOS. 19543-19547/2007)  
C.A. NO.7037/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 20527/2007)  
C.A. NO.7036/2017

(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 20559/2007)  
C.A. NO.7038/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21841/2007)  
C.A. NO.7039/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21843/2007)  
C.A. NO.7042/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21844/2007)  
C.A. NO.7040/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21845/2007)  
C.A. NO.7041/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21846/2007)

11  
C.A. NO.7062/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21847/2007)  
C.A. NO.7061/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21849/2007)  
C.A. NO.7060/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21851/2007)  
C.A. NO.7058/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21864/2007)  
C.A. NO.7057/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21866/2007)  
C.A. NO.7059/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21867/2007)  
C.A. NO.7069/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21905/2007)  
C.A. NO.7070/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21907/2007)  
C.A. NO.7068/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21909/2007)  
C.A. NO.7071/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 21910/2007)  
C.A. NO.7072/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 22947/2007)  
C.A. NO.7073/2017  
(Arising out of (C) NO. 22958/2007)  
C.A. NO.7137/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 3230/2008)  
C.A. NO.7138/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 3231/2008)  
C.A. NO.7133/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 3233/2008)  
C.A. NO.7134/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 3234/2008)  
C.A. NO.7135/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 3236/2008)

12  
C.A. NO.7136/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO.3237/2008)  
C.A. NO.7139-7163/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NOS. 3238-3262/2008)  
C.A. NO.7077-7081/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NOS. 6148-6152/2008)  
C.A. NO.6745/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 13889/2008)  
C.A. NO.7046/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 19049/2008)  
C.A. NO.7047/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 20089/2008)  
C.A. NO.7048/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 4720/2009)  
C.A. NO.7049/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 10279/2009)  
C.A. Nos.7089-7090/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NOS. 17332-17333/2009)  
C.A. NOS.7082-7088/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NOS. 17492-17498/2009)

C.A. NO.7050/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 17744/2009)  
C.A. NO.7051/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 24149/2009)  
C.A. NO.7052/2017  
(Arising out of (C) NO. 25157/2009)  
C.A. Nos.7091-7092/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NOS. 25399-25400/2009)  
C.A. NO.7053/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 25470/2009)  
C.A. NO.7054/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 28775/2009)  
C.A. NO.7055/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 29597/2009)

13  
C.A. NO.7064/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 6037/2010)  
C.A. NO.7065/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 18834/2010)  
C.A. NO.7066/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 3433/2011)  
C.A. NO.7067/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 5094/2011.)

O R D E R  
Delay condoned.  
Leave granted.

Having regard to the fact that the correctness of the ratio of the judgment of the Seven Judges' Bench of this Court in 'Automobile Transport (Rajasthan) Ltd. Etc. v. State of Rajasthan and Ors.' [1963 (1) SCR 491] and the theory of compensatory tax was questioned, the matter was referred to Nine Judges' Bench. The Nine Judges' Bench of this Court heard the matters and answered the reference in those cases, leading case being 'Jindal Stainless Ltd. and Anr. v. State of Haryana and Ors.' [2016 (11) SCALE 1]. The Court, by majority, answered the reference in the following terms:

1. Taxes simpliciter are not within the contemplation of Part XIII of the Constitution of India. The word 'Free' used in Article 301 does not mean 'free from taxation'.

2. Only such taxes as are discriminatory in nature are prohibited by Article 304(a). It follows that levy of a non-discriminatory tax would not constitute an infraction of Article 301.

3. Clauses (a) and (b) of Article 304 have to be read disjunctively.

4. A levy that violates 304(a) cannot be saved even

14  
if the procedure under Article 304(b) or the proviso there under is satisfied.

5. The compensatory tax theory evolved in Automobile Transport case and subsequently modified in Jindal's case has no juristic basis and is therefore rejected.

6. Decisions of this Court in Atiabari, Automobile Transport and Jindal cases (supra) and all other judgments that follow these pronouncements are to be extent of such reliance over ruled.

7. A tax on entry of goods into a local area for use, sale or consumption therein is permissible although similar goods are not produced within the taxing state.

8. Article 304(a) frowns upon discrimination (of a hostile nature in the protectionist sense) and not on mere differentiation. Therefore, incentives, set-offs etc. granted to a specified class of dealers for a limited period of time in a non-hostile fashion with a view to developing economically backward areas would not violate Article 304(a). The question

whether the levies in the present case indeed satisfy this test is left to be determined by the regular benches hearing the matters.

9. States are well within their right to design their fiscal legislations to ensure that the tax burden on goods imported from other States and goods produced within the State fall equally. Such measures if taken would not contravene Article 304(a) of the Constitution. The question whether the levies in the present case indeed satisfy this test is left to be determined by the regular benches hearing the matters.

10. The questions whether the entire State can be notified as a local area and whether entry tax can be levied on goods entering the landmass of India from another country are left open to be determined in appropriate proceedings.â- \235

It may be recapitulated at this stage that insofar as the instant appeals are concerned, which were also part of the aforesaid reference, the levy of entry tax was challenged by the assesseees by filing writ petitions in the High Courts primarily on

15

the ground that the levy was not in the nature of compensatory tax. The aforesaid challenge was because of the law laid down in Automobile Transport case (supra) which held the field at that time.

Similar challenges were made by the assesseees in other States challenging various provisions of the similar enactments made by the said States. Some of the High Courts upheld the legislation holding the tax to be compensatory, whereas some other High Courts found the legislation not to be compensatory in nature and, thus, struck down the provisions thereof. Some High Courts had given certain additional reasons also in striking down these legislations. The assesseees as well as the States had filed special leave petitions against those judgments. Those cases were heard and decided by the Constitution Bench of this Court in Jindal Stainless Ltd. (2) and Anr. v. State of Haryana and Ors. [ 2006 (7) SCC 241].

Jindal Strips Ltd. is an industry manufacturing products within the State of Haryana. The raw-material is purchased from outside the State. The finished products are sent to other States on consignment basis or stock transfer basis. No sales tax is paid on the input of the raw material. Similarly, no sales tax is paid on the export of finished products.

The impugned Act came into force w.e.f. 5th May, 2000 to provide for levy and collection of tax on the entry of goods into

16

the local areas of the State for consumption or use therein. The Act is enacted to provide for levy and collection of tax on the entry into a local area of the State, of a motor vehicle for use or sale, and of other goods for use or consumption therein. The Act seeks to impose entry tax on all goods brought into a local area.

The entire State is divided into local areas. The Act covers not only vehicles bringing goods into the State but also vehicles carrying goods from one local area to another. However, those who pay sales tax to the State are exempt from payment of entry tax. Ultimately, the entry tax only falls on concerns, like Jindal Strips, which, by virtue of the provisions of the Central Sales Tax Act, 1956, pay sales tax on purchase of raw-material and sale of finished goods to other States and do not pay sales tax to the State of Haryana. This is the context in which the challenge to the Act under Article 301 has been made. At this stage, we may point out that prior to September 30, 2003, Section 22 stated that the tax collected under the Act shall be distributed by the State Government amongst the local bodies to be utilized for the development of local areas. However, on 30th September, 2003, Section 22 was amended clarifying that the tax levied and collected

shall be utilized for facilitating free flow of trade and commerce.

REASONS FOR THE REFERRAL ORDER :

In *Atiabari Tea Co. Ltd. etc. v. State of Assam & Ors.* , it was held that taxing laws are not excluded from the operation of

17

Article 301, which means that tax laws can and do amount to restrictions on the freedoms guaranteed to trade under Part-XIII of the Constitution. However, the prohibition of restrictions on free trade is not an absolute one. Statutes restrictive of trade can avoid invalidation if they comply with Article 304(a) or (b).

In *Automobile Transport (Rajasthan) Ltd. (Supra)*, it was held that only such taxes that directly and immediately restrict trade would fall within the purview of Article 301 and that any restriction in the form of taxes imposed on the carriage of goods or their movement by the State Legislature can only be done after satisfying the requirements of Article 304(b). The statute which was challenged in *Atiabari Tea Co. (supra)* was the Assam Taxation (On Goods Carried By Roads And Inland Waterways) Act, 1954. It was held that the Act had put a direct restriction on the freedom of trade and since the State Legislature had not complied with the provisions of Article 304(b), the Act was declared void.

It is in the aforesaid background, reference was made to Nine Judges' Bench, as indicated at the outset of this order.

We may also mention at this stage that when the matters were argued before the Nine Judges' Bench, certain other aspects were also argued. Primarily, three kinds of issues were taken by the assesseees which are to the following effect:

(1) Whether the entire State can be treated as

18

'local area' for the purposes of entry tax?

(2) Whether entry tax can be levied on the goods which are directly imported from other countries and brought in a particular State?.

(3) In some statutes enacted by certain States, there was a provision for giving adjustment of other taxes like VAT, incentives etc. paid by the indigenous manufacturers and it was contended by the assesseees that whether the benefits given to certain categories of manufacturers would amount to discrimination under Section 304.

The Nine Judges' Bench while answering the reference deemed it appropriate to leave these questions to be agitated before the regular Bench. That is how these matters are posted before this Bench and it is agreed that the aforesaid issues are the main issues to be decided.

During the hearing of arguments, counsel for both sides submitted that since the main challenge in the writ petitions which were filed by the writ petitioners before the High Court was predicated on the law laid down by the Constitution Bench in 'Atiabari Tea Co. Ltd. (supra) , the High Court essentially confined its discussion only on compensatory tax theory, as propounded in the aforesaid judgment, looking at the issue by only keeping in mind the aforesaid judgment and deciding as to whether the tax

19

imposed by a particular statute is compensatory or not. Thus, when other issues are to be dealt with, as indicated above, we find that in many cases there is no adequate factual foundation and there is no discussion in the impugned judgments as well. It is also agreed by counsel for both the sides that in the absence thereof, it may not be possible for this Court to decide these issues.

According to us, in the aforesaid scenario, the appropriate course of action would be to permit the appellants to file fresh petitions by 31 st

May, 2017 raising the aforesaid issues with necessary factual background or any other constitutional/statutory issue which arises for consideration .

All these appeals are, accordingly, disposed of with the aforesaid liberty granted to the appellants. The interim orders which were passed by this Court and which are continued in these appeals shall continue till 31 st May, 2017. It will be open to the appellants to seek interim orders. We make it clear that the High Courts shall deal with the interim prayers of stay on their own merits without being influenced by the fact that the stay order was passed in these cases or has been extended by this Court till 31 st May, 2017. The High Courts, at that time, shall also consider the import and effect of the reference answered by the Nine Judges; Bench. There are many applicants who have filed applications for intervention in some of the appeals, those applications for

20  
intervention are dismissed giving them liberty to file substantive writ petition in the High Courts on the same lines as given to others. Some of the intervenors who had filed writ petitions in the High Courts but the High Courts did not entertain those petitions directing them to intervene in these matters. They are also given liberty.  
....., J.  
[ A.K. SIKRI ]  
....., J.  
[ ASHOK BHUSHAN ]  
NEW DELHI;  
MARCH 23, 2017.

21  
IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA  
CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION  
CIVIL APPEAL NO(S). 7165 of 2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 24430/2009)  
NOVE IRON & STEEL LTD. APPELLANT(S)  
VERSUS  
STATE OF CHHATISGARH & ORS. RESPONDENT(S)  
WITH  
C.A. NO.6949/2017,  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO.24822/2009)  
C.A. NO.6950/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO.26509/2009)  
  
C.A. NO.6951/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 28696/2009)  
C.A. NO.6952/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 29868/2009)  
C.A. NO.6953/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C) NO. 30383/2009)  
C.A. NO.6954/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.33176/2009)  
C.A. NO.6955/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.104/2010)  
C.A. NO.6956/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.4720/2010)  
C.A. NO.6957/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.6770/2010)  
C.A. NO.6958/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.15903/2010)  
C.A. NO.6959/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.19217/2010)  
C.A.NO.905/2011  
C.A. NO.6961/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.14342/2011)

22  
C.A. NO.6962/2017  
(Arising out of SLP(C)NO.39998/2012)

O R D E R

Delay condoned.

Leave granted.

Having regard to the fact that the correctness of the ratio of the judgment of the Seven Judges' Bench of this Court in 'Automobile Transport (Rajasthan) Ltd. Etc. v. State of Rajasthan and Ors.' [1963 (1) SCR 491] and the theory of compensatory tax was questioned, the matter was referred to Nine Judges' Bench. The Nine Judges' Bench of this Court heard the matters and answered the reference in those cases, leading case being 'Jindal Stainless Ltd. and Anr. v. State of Haryana and Ors.' [2016 (11) SCALE 11]. The Court, by majority, answered the reference in the following terms:

1. Taxes simpliciter are not within the contemplation of Part XIII of the Constitution of India. The word 'Free' used in Article 301 does not mean 'free from taxation'.
2. Only such taxes as are discriminatory in nature are prohibited by Article 304(a). It follows that levy of a non-discriminatory tax would not constitute an infraction of Article 301.
3. Clauses (a) and (b) of Article 304 have to be read disjunctively.
4. A levy that violates 304(a) cannot be saved even if the procedure under Article 304(b) or the proviso there under is satisfied.
5. The compensatory tax theory evolved in Automobile

23

Transport case and subsequently modified in Jindal's case has no juristic basis and is therefore rejected.

6. Decisions of this Court in Atiabari, Automobile Transport and Jindal cases (supra) and all other judgments that follow these pronouncements are to be extent of such reliance over ruled.

7. A tax on entry of goods into a local area for use, sale or consumption therein is permissible although similar goods are not produced within the taxing state.

8. Article 304(a) frowns upon discrimination (of a hostile nature in the protectionist sense) and not on mere differentiation. Therefore, incentives, set-offs etc. granted to a specified class of dealers for a limited period of time in a non-hostile fashion with a view to developing economically backward areas would not violate Article 304(a). The question whether the levies in the present case indeed satisfy this test is left to be determined by the regular benches hearing the matters.

9. States are well within their right to design their fiscal legislations to ensure that the tax burden on goods imported from other States and goods produced within the State fall equally. Such measures if taken would not contravene Article 304(a) of the Constitution. The question whether the levies in the present case indeed satisfy this test is left to be determined by the regular benches hearing the matters.

10. The questions whether the entire State can be notified as a local area and whether entry tax can be levied on goods entering the landmass of India from another country are left open to be determined in appropriate proceedings.

It may be recapitulated at this stage that insofar as the instant appeals are concerned, which were also part of the aforesaid reference, the levy of entry tax was challenged by the assesseees by filing writ petitions in the High Courts primarily on

the ground that the levy was not in the nature of compensatory tax. The aforesaid challenge was because of the law laid down in

24

Automobile Transport case (supra) which held the field at that time.

Similar challenges were made by the assesseees in other States challenging various provisions of the similar enactments made by the said States. Some of the High Courts upheld the legislation holding the tax to be compensatory, whereas some other High Courts found the legislation not to be compensatory in nature and, thus, struck down the provisions thereof. Some High Courts had given certain additional reasons also in striking down these legislations. The assesseees as well as the States had filed special leave petitions against those judgments. Those cases were heard and decided by the Constitution Bench of this Court in *Jindal Stainless Ltd. (2) and Anr. v. State of Haryana and Ors.* [2006 (7) SCC 241].

*Jindal Strips Ltd.* is an industry manufacturing products within the State of Haryana. The raw-material is purchased from outside the State. The finished products are sent to other States on consignment basis or stock transfer basis. No sales tax is paid on the input of the raw material. Similarly, no sales tax is paid on the export of finished products.

The impugned Act came into force w.e.f. 5th May, 2000 to provide for levy and collection of tax on the entry of goods into the local areas of the State for consumption or use therein. The Act is enacted to provide for levy and collection of tax on the

25

entry into a local area of the State, of a motor vehicle for use or sale, and of other goods for use or consumption therein. The Act seeks to impose entry tax on all goods brought into a local area. The entire State is divided into local areas. The Act covers not only vehicles bringing goods into the State but also vehicles carrying goods from one local area to another. However, those who pay sales tax to the State are exempt from payment of entry tax. Ultimately, the entry tax only falls on concerns, like *Jindal Strips*, which, by virtue of the provisions of the Central Sales Tax Act, 1956, pay sales tax on purchase of raw-material and sale of finished goods to other States and do not pay sales tax to the State of Haryana. This is the context in which the challenge to the Act under Article 301 has been made. At this stage, we may point out that prior to September 30, 2003, Section 22 stated that the tax collected under the Act shall be distributed by the State Government amongst the local bodies to be utilized for the development of local areas. However, on 30th September, 2003, Section 22 was amended clarifying that the tax levied and collected shall be utilized for facilitating free flow of trade and commerce.

REASONS FOR THE REFERRAL ORDER :

In *Atiabari Tea Co. Ltd. etc. v. State of Assam & Ors.*, it was held that taxing laws are not excluded from the operation of Article 301, which means that tax laws can and do amount to restrictions on the freedoms guaranteed to trade under Part-XIII of

26

the Constitution. However, the prohibition of restrictions on free trade is not an absolute one. Statutes restrictive of trade can avoid invalidation if they comply with Article 304(a) or (b).

In *Automobile Transport (Rajasthan) Ltd. (Supra)*, it was held that only such taxes that directly and immediately restrict trade would fall within the purview of Article 301 and that any restriction in the form of taxes imposed on the carriage of goods or their movement by the State Legislature can only be done after satisfying the requirements of Article 304(b). The statute which was challenged in *Atiabari Tea Co. (supra)* was the Assam Taxation (On Goods Carried By Roads And Inland Waterways) Act, 1954. It was held that the Act had put a direct restriction on the freedom of trade and since the State Legislature had not complied with the

provisions of Article 304(b), the Act was declared void.

It is in the aforesaid background, reference was made to Nine Judges' Bench, as indicated at the outset of this order.

We may also mention at this stage that when the matters were argued before the Nine Judges' Bench, certain other aspects were also argued. Primarily, three kinds of issues were taken by the assesseees which are to the following effect:

(1) Whether the entire State can be treated as 'local area' for the purposes of entry tax?

(2) Whether entry tax can be levied on the goods

27

which are directly imported from other countries and brought in a particular State?.

(3) In some statutes enacted by certain States, there was a provision for giving adjustment of other taxes like VAT, incentives etc. paid by the indigenous manufacturers and it was contended by the assesseees that whether the benefits given to certain categories of manufacturers would amount to discrimination under Section 304.

The Nine Judges' Bench while answering the reference deemed it appropriate to leave these questions to be agitated before the regular Bench. That is how these matters are posted before this Bench and it is agreed that the aforesaid issues are the main issues to be decided.

During the hearing of arguments, counsel for both sides submitted that since the main challenge in the writ petitions which were filed by the writ petitioners before the High Court was predicated on the law laid down by the Constitution Bench in 'Atiabari Tea Co. Ltd. (supra)', the High Court essentially confined its discussion only on compensatory tax theory, as propounded in the aforesaid judgment, looking at the issue by only keeping in mind the aforesaid judgment and deciding as to whether the tax imposed by a particular statute is compensatory or not. Thus, when other issues are to be dealt with, as indicated above, we find that

28

in many cases there is no adequate factual foundation and there is no discussion in the impugned judgments as well. It is also agreed by counsel for both the sides that in the absence thereof, it may not be possible for this Court to decide these issues.

According to us, in the aforesaid scenario, the appropriate course of action would be to permit the appellants to file fresh petitions by 31 st

May, 2017 raising the aforesaid issues with necessary factual background or any other constitutional/statutory issue which arises for consideration .

All these appeals are, accordingly, disposed of with the aforesaid liberty granted to the appellants. The interim orders which were passed by this Court and which are continued in these appeals shall continue till 31 st

May, 2017. It will be open to the appellants to seek interim orders. We make it clear that the High Courts shall deal with the interim prayers of stay on their own merits without being influenced by the fact that the stay order was passed in these cases or has been extended by this Court till 31 st May, 2017. The High Courts, at that time, shall also consider the import and effect of the reference answered by the Nine Judges' Bench.

There are many applicants who have filed applications for intervention in some of the appeals, those applications for intervention are dismissed giving them liberty to file substantive writ petition in the High Courts on the same lines as given to

29

others.

Some of the intervenors who had filed writ petitions in the High Courts but the High Courts did not entertain those petitions

directing them to intervene in these matters. They are also given liberty.

....., J.  
[ A.K. SIKRI ]  
....., J.  
[ ASHOK BHUSHAN ]

NEW DELHI;  
MARCH 23, 2017.

30

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA  
CIVIL ORIGINAL JURISDICTION

WRIT PETITION (C) NO(S).221 OF 2004  
M/S. JAY SHREE INDUSTRIES & ANR. PETITIONER(S)  
VERSUS

STATE OF HARYANA & ORS. RESPONDENT(S)  
WITH

W.P.(C) NO. 11/2010 , W.P.(C) NO. 42/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 43/2010,  
W.P.(C) NO. 44/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 46/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 48/2010, W.P.  
(C) NO. 63/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 71/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 31/2011, W.P.(C)  
NO. 497/2011, W.P.(C) NO. 278/2012, W.P.(C) NO. 290/2012

O R D E R

In view of the order dated 21.03.2017 passed in Civil Appeal Nos. 997-998 of 2004 titled as State of U.P. & Ors. Versus M/s. Indian Oil Corporation Ltd. Etc ., we are not inclined to entertain these writ petitions under Article 32 of the Constitution of India. These writ petitions are, accordingly, dismissed with liberty to the petitioner(s) to approach the High Court in the first instance by filing writ petition(s) under Article 226 of the Constitution.

....., J.  
[ A.K. SIKRI ]  
....., J.  
[ ASHOK BHUSHAN ]

NEW DELHI;  
MARCH 23, 2017.

31

ITEM NO.11-313 COURT NO.8 SECTION III & X  
S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No(s). 3381-3400/1998

STATE OF KERALA & ORS

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

FR.WILLIAM FERNANDEZ & ORS

Respondent(s)

(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR INTERVENTION AND OFFICE REPORT)

WITH

C.A. NO. 3592/1998

C.A. NO. 4651/1998

C.A. NO. 918/1999

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

C.A. NO. 2769/2000

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 6914/2007

(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR INTERVENTION, INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 14819/2007

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 14820/2007

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 14821/2007

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 14823/2007

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 14824/2007

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

32

SLP(C) NO. 14826/2007

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 14828/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14829/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14830/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14832/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14833/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14835/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14837/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14838/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14839/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14841/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14842/2007  
SLP(C) NO. 14845/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14846/2007

33

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14847/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 17589/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN  
REFILING SLP AND INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17590/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17905/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17906/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17907/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17908/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17909/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17910/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17911/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17913/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17914/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17915/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17916/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17917/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17918/2007

34

(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17919/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17920/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17921/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17922/2007

(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17923/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17924/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17925/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17926/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17929/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17930/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17933/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17934/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17936/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17937/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17938/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17939/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17941/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)

35

SLP(C) NO. 17942/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17943/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17944/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17957/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17959/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17960/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17961/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17962/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17963/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17964/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17965/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17972/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17973/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17974/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17975/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17976/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17977/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17978/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)

36

SLP(C) NO. 17979/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)

SLP(C) NO. 17980/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17981/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17982/2007  
SLP(C) NO. 17983/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 17984/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18036/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18037/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18038/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18039/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18040/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18041/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18042/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18043/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18044/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18045/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18046/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18047/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)

37

SLP(C) NO. 18048/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18049/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18050/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18051/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18053/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18054/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18055/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18056/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18057/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18058/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18059/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18061/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18062/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18063/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18064/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18065/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18066/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)

SLP(C) NO. 18067/2007

38

(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18068/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18069/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18073/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18074/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18075/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18076/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18077/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18078/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18079/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18080/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18081/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18082/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18083/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18084/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18085/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18086/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18087/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)

39

SLP(C) NO. 18088/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18089/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18090/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18091/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 18092/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 19049/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19050/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19051/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19052/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19053/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19055/2007 (WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP  
AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19057/2007 (WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP  
AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19059/2007 (WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP  
AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19060/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19062/2007

(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19064/2007 (WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP  
AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19066/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19068/2007

40

(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19070/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19071/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19072/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19073/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19074/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19076/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19077/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19094/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19095/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19096/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19099/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19100/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19101/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19102/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19103/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19104/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19105/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)

41

SLP(C) NO. 19106/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19107/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19108/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19110/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19111/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19113/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19114/2007  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19505/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19506/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19507/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19508/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19510/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 19511/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19512/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19513/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19514/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19515/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19516/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

42

SLP(C) NO. 19518/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19521/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19522/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19523-19528/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19529/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19530/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19531/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19543-19547/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 20527/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 20529/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 20559/2007  
SLP(C) NO. 21841/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21843/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21844/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21845/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21846/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21847/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21848/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)

43

SLP(C) NO. 21849/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21851/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21864/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21866/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21867/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21871-21904/2007  
SLP(C) NO. 21905/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21907/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21908/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21909/2007

(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 21910/2007  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 22947/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 22958/2007  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 3230/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 3231/2008  
SLP(C) NO. 3233/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 3234/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 3236/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

44

SLP(C) NO. 3237/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 3238-3262/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 6148-6152/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 13327/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 13889/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14232-14252/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT) MR. SHREE PAL SINGH  
SLP(C) NO. 18040/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 18684-18714/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19049/2008  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 20089/2008  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 4720/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
S.L.P.(C)... /2009 CC NO. 5143  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
S.L.P.(C)... /2009 CC NO. 5311  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 10279/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14623/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14856/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 16757-16760/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 17332-17333/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

45

SLP(C) NO. 17394-17396/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND C/DELAY IN REFILEING  
SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 17488/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND C/DELAY IN REFILEING  
SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 17490/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 17491/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND C/DELAY IN REFILEING  
SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 17492-17498/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)

SLP(C) NO. 17744/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19695/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 24149/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 25157/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 25390/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 25399-25400/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 25470/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 25797/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 26116/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 26236/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 28509/2009  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 28775/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)

46

SLP(C) NO. 29597/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 1820/2010  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 6037/2010  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 14845/2010  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 18834/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19194/2010  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 22327/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING PROCESS FEE AND C/DELAY IN  
FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 3433/2011  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 5094/2011  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 8571/2011  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 9758/2011  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 13526/2011  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 574/2003  
(OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 66/2004  
SLP(C) NO. 24430/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS)  
SLP(C) NO. 24822/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 26509/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 28696/2009

47

(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. AND INTERIM RELIEF)  
SLP(C) NO. 29868/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 30383/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 33176/2009

(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 33663-33665/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING SLP)  
SLP(C) NO. 35038/2009  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 104/2010  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 4720/2010  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 6770/2010  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 15903/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED  
JUDGMENT AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 19217/2010  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
C.A. NO. 905/2011  
SLP(C) NO. 14342/2011  
(WITH INTERIM RELIEF AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 39998/2012  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS AND  
OFFICE REPORT)  
C.A. NO. 9214/2014  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR DIRECTIONS)  
C.A. NO. 9216/2014  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR C/DELAY IN FILING AFFIDAVIT AND EXEMPTION  
FROM FILING O.T. AND MODIFICATION AND OFFICE REPORT)  
SLP(C) NO. 23990/2009  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR STAY AND OFFICE REPORT)

48

W.P.(C) NO. 512/2003  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 221/2004  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 11/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR EX-PARTE STAY AND OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 42/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR STAY AND OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 43/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR STAY AND OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 44/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR STAY)  
W.P.(C) NO. 46/2010 M/S  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR STAY)  
W.P.(C) NO. 48/2010  
W.P.(C) NO. 63/2010 (WITH APPLN. (S) FOR EX-PARTE STAY AND OFFICE  
REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 71/2010  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR EX-PARTE STAY AND OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 31/2011  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR DIRECTIONS AND OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 497/2011  
(WITH OFFICE REPORT)  
W.P.(C) NO. 278/2012  
W.P.(C) NO. 290/2012  
(WITH APPLN. (S) FOR DIRECTIONS AND OFFICE REPORT)

Date : 23/03/2017 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM : HON&#39;BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI  
HON&#39;BLE MR. JUSTICE ASHOK BHUSHAN

For Parties: Mr. V. Giri, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Beena Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Jishnu M.L., Adv.

Ms. Priyanka Prakash, Adv.

Ms. Svadha Shanker, Adv.

Mr. Manav Vohra, Adv.

49

Mr. Krishna Dev, Adv.

Mr.Amit Krishnan, Adv.  
Mr. Manu Srinath, Adv.  
Mr. G. Prakash,Adv.

Mr. KB Ali  
Petitioner-in-person  
Mr. Atul Jha, Adv, Adv.  
Mr.Sandeep Jha, Adv.  
Mr Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, Adv.  
Mr. M. P. Vinod,Adv.  
Mr. Dileep Pillain, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay K. Jain,Adv.  
Mr .Atul Shankar Vinod, Adv.  
Mr. Ritunjay Gupta, Adv.  
Ms. Catherine Ayallore , Adv.  
Mr. Dheeraj Nair, Adv.  
Mr. Romy Chacko, Adv.  
Mr. Shubham Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Varun Mudgal, Adv.  
Mr. S.C. Jaidwal, Adv  
Mr. Alok Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Udit Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Somnath Shukla, Adv.  
Mr. Avinash Tripathi, Adv.  
Ms. Ashwini Chandrasekaran, Adv.  
Mr. Harish Pandey, Adv.  
Mr. Praveen Kumar, Adv.  
Ms. Shally Bhasin, Adv.  
Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.  
Ms. S. Basu Malik, Adv.  
Ms. Mithila Lalit, Adv.  
Mr. E.C. Agrawala, Adv.  
Mr. Hasan Murtaza, Adv.  
Mr. Rajesh Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Sukumaran, Adv.  
Mr. Anand Sukumar, Adv.  
Mr. Bhupesh Kumar Pathak, Adv.  
Ms.Meera Mathur, Adv.  
Mr. V.K. Siddharthan, Adv.  
Mr. Wills Mathews, Adv.  
Mr. Shreepal Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Hrishkruah, Adv.

50

Ms. Radhika Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Jagdeep Dhakar, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Priyanka Parida, Adv.  
Mr. Jagjit Singh Chhabra, Adv.  
Mr. Saksham Maheshwari, Adv.  
Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Adv.  
Ms. Pankhuri Shrivastava, Adv.  
Mr. Ashit Gupta, Adv  
Mr. Ravinder Narain, Adv.  
Mr.Ajay Aggarwal, Adv.  
Ms.Mallika Joshi, Adv.  
Mr. Rajan Narain, Adv.  
Mr. A.P. Mayee, Adv.  
Mr. A. Selvin Raja, Adv.  
Mr. S.K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Sunil K. Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, Adv.  
Mr. Kaushik Choudhury, Adv.  
Mr. Akarsh Garg, Adv.  
Mr. Punya Garg, Adv.  
Mr. KPS Chani, Adv.  
Mr. Ritin Rai, Adv.  
Mr. Jayant Malik, Adv.  
Mr. V.K Monga, Adv.  
Ms. Divya Roy, Adv.

Ms. Ranjana Roy, Adv.  
Mr. Rohan Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjeev K Kapoor, Adv.  
Mr. Snehal Kakrania, Adv.  
For Khaitan & Co.  
Mr. Suhail Dutt, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Sujoy Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Azhar Alam, Adv.  
Mr. Sujoy Kumar Adv.  
Mr. Preeti Khewani, Adv.  
Mr. B.R. Menon, Adv.  
Ms. Vijayalakshmi Menon, Adv.  
Mr. Gautam Swarup, Adv.  
Mr. Munindra Dvivedi, Adv.  
Mr. Sarvesh Singh Baghel, Adv.  
Mr. T. Bhushan, Adv.  
Mr. S.S. Shroff, Adv.

51

Mr. Debojit Borkakati, Adv.  
Ms. Sumita Hazarika, Adv.  
Ms. Preeti Singh, Adv.  
Mr. S.P. Singh Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Satya Prakash, Adv.  
Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, Adv.  
Mr. Mahabir Singh, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Preeti Singh, Adv.  
Mr. S.P. Singh Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Satya Prakash, Adv.  
Mr. Nikhil Jain, Adv.  
Mr. R.K. Rathore, Adv.  
Mr. Vibhu Shanker Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Bahadur, Adv.  
Mr. S.N. Terdal, Adv.  
Mr. Joseph Aristotle S., Adv.  
Ms. Priya Aristotle, Adv.  
Ms. K. Priyadarshini, Adv.  
Mr. Ashish Yadav, Adv.  
Ms. Romsha Raj, Adv.  
Pratiksha Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, Adv.  
Mr. Yashank Adhyaru, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Purnima Bhat Kak, Adv.  
Ms. Gargi Khanna, Adv.  
Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.  
Mr. R. Venkatramani, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. S. Aravindh, Adv.  
Mr. Rakesh K Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. V. Prabhakar, Adv.  
Ms. Jyoti Parshar, Adv.  
Ms. Revathy Raghavan, Adv.  
Mr. B. Adinarayana, Rao, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv.  
Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv.  
Ms. Akanksha Mehra, Adv.  
Ms. Ramandeep Kaur, Adv.  
For M/s. Lawyer's Knit & Co.  
Mr. S.S. Shamshery, AAG  
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.

52

Mr. Ajit Kr. Sinha, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. R.K. Rathore, Adv.  
Mr. Shankar Divate, Adv.  
Mr. B.K. Prasad, Adv.  
Mr. S. Gurukrishana Kumar, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Arvind P. Datar, Adv.  
Mr. Parijat Sinha, Adv.

Ms. Reshmi Rea Sinha, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Ghosh, Adv.  
Mr. Rudra Dutta, Adv.  
Mr. A.T.M. Ra  
Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, Adv.  
Mr. Gopal Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Varsha Poddar, Adv.  
Mr. U.A. Rana, Adv.  
Ms. Mrinal Ilkar Mazumdar, Adv.  
Mr. Hinanshu Mehta, Adv.  
Mr. Avirat Kumar, Adv  
For M/s. Gagrat & Co.  
Mr. Aditya Bhattacharya, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Anand, Adv.  
Mr. Anandh K., Adv.  
Mr. Victor Das, Adv.  
Ms. Apeksha Mehta, Adv.  
Mr. M.P. Devnath, Adv.,  
Ms. Ruby Singh Ahuja, Adv.  
Mr. Vishal Gehrana, Adv.  
Ms. Suman Yadav, Adv.  
Ms. Deepti Sarin, Adv.  
Ms. Aakanksha Munjal, Adv.  
Ms. Manik Karanjawala, Adv.  
M/s. Karanjawala & Co.  
Mr. Dileep Tandon, Adv.  
Ms. Neha Tandon, Adv.  
Mr. R.B. Phookan, Adv.  
Mr. J.S. Chhabra, Adv.  
Mr. Shailesh M., Adv.  
Mr. Nalin Kohli, Adv.  
Mr. Ankit Roy, Adv.  
Mr. Indrajeet Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, Adv.  
Mr. S.A. Haseeb, Adv.  
Mr. Amarjeet Singh, Adv.

53

Mr. Prabhas Bajaj, Adv.  
Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.

Ms. Baby Krishnan, Adv.  
Mr. R. Sathish, Adv.  
Mr. M. T. George, Adv.

Mr. Roy Abraham, Adv.  
Ms. Reena Roy, Adv.  
Ms. Rajni Ohri, Adv.

Mr. Himinder Lal, Adv.  
Mr. Rajiv Mehta, Adv.  
Mr B V Deepak, Adv.  
Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, Adv.  
Mr. K. R. Nambiar, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

C. A No(s). 3381-3400/1998, C.A. NO. 3592/1998, C.A. NO. 4651/1998

C.A. NO. 918/1999, C.A. NO. 2769/2000, SLP(C) No. 14847/2007, SLP(C)  
NO.17590/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17905/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17906/2007, SLP(C)  
No. 17914/2007, SLP(C) No. 17933/2007, SLP(C) No. 17981/2007,  
SLP(C) No. 17984/2007, SLP(C) No. 18036/2007, SLP(C) No.  
18044/2007, SLP(C) No. 18057/2007, SLP(C) No. 18059/2007, SLP(C)  
No. 18065/2007, SLP(C) No. 18069/2007, SLP(C) No. 18079/2007,  
SLP(C) No. 18082/2007, SLP(C) No. 18088/2007, SLP(C) No.  
18091/2007, SLP(C) No. 19059/2007, SLP(C) No. 19064/2007, SLP(C)  
No. 19072/2007, SLP(C) No. 19074/2007, SLP(C) No. 19094/2007,  
SLP(C) No. 19104/2007, SLP(C) No. 19110/2007, SLP(C) No. 19111/2007,

54

SLP(C) No. 20529/2007, SLP(C) No. 21848/2007, SLP(C) No.

21904/2007, SLP(C) No. 21908/2007, SLP(C) No. 13327/2008, SLP(C)  
No. 14232-14252/2008, SLP(C) No. 18040/2008, SLP(C) No.  
18684-18714/2008, SLP(C) No. 5311/2009, SLP(C) No.  
5143/2009, SLP(C) No. 14623/2009, SLP(C) No. 14856/2009, SLP(C)  
No. 16757-16760/2009, SLP(C) No. 17394-17396/2009, SLP(C) No.  
17488/2009, SLP(C) No. 17490/2009, SLP(C) No. 17491/2009, SLP(C)  
No. 19695/2009, SLP(C) No. 25390/2009, SLP(C) No. 25797/2009,  
SLP(C) No. 26116/2009, SLP(C) No. 26236/2009, SLP(C) No.  
28509/2009, SLP(C) No. 1820/2010, SLP(C) No. 14845/2010, SLP(C)  
No. 19194/2010, SLP(C) No. 22327/2010, SLP(C) No. 8571/2011, SLP(C)  
No. 9758/2011, SLP(C) No. 13526/2011, WP(C) No. 574/2003, WP(C) No.  
66/2004, SLP(C) NO. 33663-33665/2009 & C.A. NO. 9214/2014

List on 28.03.2017.

SLP(C) NO. 35038/2009 & SLP(C) NO. 23990/2009

List after three weeks.

W.P.(C) NO. 512/2003

Learned counsel appearing for the petitioner(s), seeks leave  
of this Court to withdraw this petition. Permission granted.

The Writ Petition is accordingly dismissed as withdrawn.

55

STATE OF KERELA

SLP(C) NO. 6914/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14819/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14820/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 14821/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14823/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14824/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 14826/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14828/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14829/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 14830/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14832/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14833/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 14835/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14837/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14838/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 14839/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14841/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14842/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 14845/2007, SLP(C) NO. 14846/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17589/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 17907/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17908/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17909/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17910/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17911/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17913/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17915/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17916/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17917/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17918/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17919/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17920/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17921/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17922/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17923/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17924/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17925/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17926/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17929/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17930/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17934/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17936/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17937/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17938/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17939/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17941/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17942/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17943/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17944/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17957/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17959/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17960/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17961/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17962/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17963/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17964/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17965/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17972/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17973/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17974/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17975/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17976/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17977/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17978/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17979/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 17980/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17982/2007, SLP(C) NO. 17983/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18037/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18038/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18039/2007, SLP(C)

56

NO. 18040/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18041/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18042/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18043/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18045/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18046/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18047/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18048/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18049/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18050/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18051/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18053/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18054/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18055/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18056/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18058/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18061/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18062/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18063/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18064/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18066/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18067/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18068/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18073/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18074/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18075/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18076/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18077/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18078/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18080/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18081/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18083/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18084/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18085/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18086/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18087/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 18089/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18090/2007, SLP(C) NO. 18092/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19049/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19050/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19051/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19052/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19053/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19055/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19057/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19060/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19062/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19066/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19068/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19070/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19071/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19073/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19076/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19077/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19095/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19096/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19099/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19100/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19101/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19102/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19103/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19105/2007, SLP(C)

NO. 19106/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19107/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19108/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19113/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19114/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19505/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19506/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19507/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19508/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19510/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19511/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19512/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19513/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19514/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19515/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19516/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19518/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19521/2007, SLP(C)

57

NO.19522/2007, SLP(C) NO.19523-19528/2007, SLP(C) NO.19529/2007, SLP(C)  
NO. 19530/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19531/2007, SLP(C) NO. 19543-19547/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 20527/2007, SLP(C) NO. 20559/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21841/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 21843/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21844/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21845/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 21846/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21847/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21849/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 21851/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21864/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21866/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 21867/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21905/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21907/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 21909/2007, SLP(C) NO. 21910/2007, SLP(C) NO. 22947/2007,  
SLP(C) NO. 22958/2007, SLP(C) NO. 3230/2008, SLP(C) NO. 3231/2008,  
SLP(C) NO. 3233/2008, SLP(C) NO. 3234/2008, SLP(C) NO. 3236/2008,  
SLP(C) NO.3237/2008, SLP(C) NO. 3238-3262/2008, SLP(C) NO.  
6148-6152/2008, SLP(C) NO. 13889/2008, SLP(C) NO. 19049/2008,  
SLP(C) NO. 20089/2008, SLP(C) NO. 4720/2009, SLP(C) NO. 10279/2009,  
SLP(C) NO. 17332-17333/2009, SLP(C) NO. 17492-17498/2009, SLP(C) NO.  
17744/2009, SLP(C) NO. 24149/2009, SLP(C) NO. 25157/2009, SLP(C) NO.  
25399-25400/2009, SLP(C) NO. 25470/2009, SLP(C) NO. 28775/2009,  
SLP(C) NO. 29597/2009, SLP(C) NO. 6037/2010, SLP(C) NO. 18834/2010,  
SLP(C) NO. 3433/2011, SLP(C) NO. 5094/2011.

Delay condoned.

Leave granted.

The appeals are disposed of in terms of the signed order.

Pending application(s), if any, stands disposed of accordingly.

STATE OF CHHATISGARH

SLP(C) NO. 24430/2009, SLP(C) NO.24822/2009, SLP(C) NO.26509/2009,  
SLP(C) NO. 28696/2009, SLP(C) NO. 29868/2009, SLP(C) NO.

58

30383/2009, SLP(C) NO.33176/2009, SLP(C) NO.104/2010, SLP(C)  
NO.4720/2010, SLP(C) NO.6770/2010, SLP(C) NO.15903/2010, SLP(C) NO.19217/  
2010, C.A.NO.905/2011, SLP(C) NO.14342/2011, SLP(C) NO.39998/2012, C.A.  
NO. 9216/2014.

Delay condoned.

Leave granted.

The appeals are disposed of in terms of the signed order.

Pending application(s), if any, stands disposed of accordingly.

WRIT PETITION (C) NO(S).221 OF 2004, W.P.(C) NO. 11/2010, W.P.(C)  
NO. 42/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 43/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 44/2010, W.P.(C) NO.  
46/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 48/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 63/2010, W.P.(C) NO.  
71/2010, W.P.(C) NO. 31/2011, W.P.(C) NO. 497/2011, W.P.(C) NO.  
278/2012, W.P.(C) NO. 290/2012

The writ petitions are dismissed in terms of the signed order.

Pending application(s), if any, stands disposed of accordingly.

(Ashwani Thakur) (Mala Kumari Sharma)

COURT MASTER

COURT MASTER

(Signed orders are placed on the file)