

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Civil Appeal Nos. 3381-3400/1998

STATE OF KERALA AND OTHERS

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

FR.WILLIAM FERNANDEZ ETC ETC

Respondent(s)

(With appln(s) for intervention)

WITH

C.A. No. 9505/2017 (XVI)
T.C. (C) No. 149/2013 (XVI-A)
T.C. (C) No. 13/2004 (XVI -A)
C.A. No. 3592/1998 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 4651/1998 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 918/1999 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 5385/2002 (XVI)
C.A. NOS. 3720-3722/2003 (XI-A)
C.A. No. 6331/2003 (XVI)
W.P. (C) No. 574/2003 (X)
W.P. (C) No. 66/2004 (X)
SLP (C) No. 1101/2007 (XVII)
SLP (C) No. 10694/2007 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 9054/2007 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 12959/2007 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 13806/2007 (XVI)
C.A. No. 6177/2010 (XI-A)
C.A. No. 6178/2010 (XI-A)
C.A. No. 6179/2010 (XI-A)
SLP (C) No. 18088/2007 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 6180/2010 (XI-A)
SLP (C) No. 18044/2007 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15082-15085/2007 (XII)
SLP (C) No. 746/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 747/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 742/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 5407/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 5408/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 6831/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 7914/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 8204/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 9227/2008 (XI -A)

SLP (C) No. 12424-12425/2008 (XI -A)

SLP (C) No. 15161/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15540/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15369/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15551/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17204/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 19030/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15579/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15357/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15700/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16772/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17865/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15623/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15495/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15934/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15647/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16930/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15496/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15491/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16865/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18346/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15356/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15492/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15845/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16926/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15405/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15684/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16832/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15666/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15636/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15498/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 15493/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16754/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16733/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16689/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17193/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18379/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18344/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16667/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18354/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17233/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17203/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15711/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15618/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16664/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16885/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17892/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17192/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15179/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 20795/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 15643/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 19141/2008 (XI -A)

Civil Appeal Nos. 3381-3400/1998 etc.

SLP (C) No. 18857/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 19849/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 19847/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 19867/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18360-18364/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18865/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 22083/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 22735/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 22086/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 21819/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18405/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 23075/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 23609/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 22707/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 21107/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 22931/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 23623/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 20766/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 20165/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 22081/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 23277/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 22084/2008 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 5041-5042/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 22100-22101/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 23270/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 26750/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 19986/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 23077/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 26377/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 26593/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 27442-27444/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 17394-17396/2009 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 29764/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 29763/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 26543/2008 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 3276/2009 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 29194/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 29196/2008 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 9548/2009 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 11646/2009 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 25390/2009 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 25467/2009 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 23990/2009 (IV-A)
SLP (C) No. 33663-33665/2009 (IV-A)
SLP (C) No. 35038/2009 (IV-A)
SLP (C) No. 1820/2010 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 2042/2011 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 6762/2010 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 2041/2011 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 4387/2010 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 2459/2010 (XI -A)

SLP (C) No. 12690/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 4390/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 4389/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 4388/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 6763/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 6765/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 4362/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 5309/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 4511/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 3387/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 4572/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 7929/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 7356/2010 (XVI)
SLP (C) No. 19194/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 9022/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 9077/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 9723/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 11419/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 9702/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 10361/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 14886/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16694/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 16720/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 18318/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 19199/2010 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 13526/2011 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8239/2017 (XII-A)
SLP (C) No. 36486/2010 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 5860/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 5861/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 3267/2012 (III-A)
C.A. No. 4210/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 3268-3270/2012 (III-A)
C.A. No. 3266/2012 (III-A)
C.A. No. 8734/2012 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 33923/2012 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 33954/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8738/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8737/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8736/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8740/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8739/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8735/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8741/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8744/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 9292/2012 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 37712/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 8745/2012 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 40147/2012 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 36187/2012 (XI -A)
SLP (C) No. 40146/2012 (XI -A)

Civil Appeal Nos. 3381-3400/1998 etc.

SLP(C) No. 37455/2012 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 9293/2012 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 37728/2012 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 37708-37709/2012 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 38304/2012 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 38919/2012 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 449/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 1426/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 9693-9695/2013 (XVI)
SLP(C) No. 8939/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 9844/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 16867/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 16869/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 16870/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 11060/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 10516/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 16744-16746/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 17156-17157/2013 (XII-A)
SLP(C) No. 27001-27002/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 32256/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 30986/2013 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 33600/2013 (XI -A)
C.A. No. 9214/2014 (IV-A)
SLP(C) No. 29119/2014 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 8231/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 22349/2015 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 72/2016 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 2057/2016 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 86/2016 (XI -A)
SLP(C) No. 16820/2016 (XI -A)

Date : 17-08-2017 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ASHOK BHUSHAN

For Parties

Mr. Dinesh Kumar Garg, AOR

Mr. Kanchan Kaur Dhodi, AOR

Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR
Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Vanita Bhargava, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Bhargava, Adv.
Mr. Abhisar Bairagi, Adv.
M/s. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Mr. P. S. Sudheer, Adv.

Mr. A. K. Panda, Sr. Adv.

Mr. R. K. Rathore, Adv.

Mr. Vikas Bansal, Adv.

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Anil Kr. Gulati, Adv.

Mr. B. Krishna Prasad, AOR

Mr. K. C. Kaushik, Adv.

Ms. Bhuvneshwari Pathak, Adv.

Ms. Shilpi Satyapriya Satyam, Adv.

Mr. Rahul Kaushik, Adv.

Mr. Shreekant N. Terdal, AOR

Mr. G. Prakash, AOR

Mr. Jishnu M. L., Adv.

Ms. Priyanka Prakash, Adv.

Ms. Beena Prakash, Adv.

Mr. A. P. Datar, Sr. Adv.

Mr. U. A. Rana, Adv.

Mr. Himanshu Mehta, Adv.

Mr. Avirat Kumar, Adv.

M/s. Gagrat And Co, AOR

Mr. Sibho Sankar Mishra, AOR

M/s Mitter & Mitter Co., AOR

Mr. P. K. Manohar, AOR

Mr. Arvind P. Datar, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Tushar Jarwal, Adv.

Ms. Fereshte D. Sethna, Adv.

Ms. B. Vijayalakshmi Menon, AOR

Ms. Anuradha Dutt, Adv.

Ms. Ameya Pant, Adv.

Mr. Rahul Sateerja, Adv.

Mr. Nakul Dewan, Adv.

Mr. Pradhuman Gohil, Adv.

Mr. Vikash Singh, AOR

Ms. Taruna Singh Gohil, Adv.

Mr. Himanshu Chaubey, Adv.

Ms. Inshita Singh, Adv.

Mr. Zain Maqbool, Adv.

Mr. D. K Singh, Adv.

Ms. Komal Mundhra, Adv.

Mr. Saurabh Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Abhijit Sengupta, AOR

Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR

Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR

Mr. A. K. Ganguli, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR
Mr. Sujit Keshri, Adv.

Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR

Mr. Ajay Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. Ravinder Narain, Adv.
Ms. Mallika Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR

Mr. Merusagar Samantaray, AOR

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.
Mr. G. C. Bharuka, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rajiv Agnihotri, Adv.
Mr. Ramesh Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Kumar, AOR
Ms. Babita, Adv.
Mr. Kumar Ajit Singh, Adv.

Ms. Bina Gupta, AOR

Mr. Jagdeep Dhankar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR
Ms. Priyanka Parida, Adv.
Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Bibekananda Mohanti, Adv.
Mr. Ajit Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Punya Garg, Adv.

Mr. Jagdeep Dhankar, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Priyanka Parida, Adv.
Mr. Jagjit Singh Chhabra, AOR

Ms. Anil Katiyar, AOR

M/s. Venkat Palwai Law Associates, AOR

Mr. Devashish Bharuka, AOR

Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR

M/s. Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR

Mr. Kedar Nath Tripathy, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Gupta II, AOR

Mr. Ashok Panigrahi, AOR

Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR

Mr. K. K. Mani, AOR

Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Ms. Sylona Mohapatra, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Choudhary, AOR

M/s. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, AOR

Mr. Shishir Deshpande, AOR

Mr. B. Balaji, AOR

Mr. Romy Chacko, AOR

Mr. Pramit Saxena, AOR

Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Gopal Prasad, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR

Mr. A. Selvin Raja, Adv.

Mr. Avnish M. Oza, Adv.

Mr. Chirag Jain, Adv.

Mr. C. D. Singh, AOR

Mr. C. K. Sucharita, AOR

Mr. M. P. Devanath, AOR

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR

Ms. Akriti Chaubey, Adv.

Ms. Tanya Shree, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh Jain, Adv.

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.

Ms. Shally Bhasin, Adv.
Ms. Neeha Nagpal, Adv.
Ms. Sayaree Basu Malik, Adv.
Ms. Shruti Garg, Adv.
Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Dr. Rajeev Sharma, AOR

Mr. S. Nanda Kumar, Adv.
Mr. M.S. Saran Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Deepika Nanda Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Senjul Mehta, Adv.
Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR

Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR.
Dr. Rajeev Sharma, AOR.
Mr. M. Paikaray, Adv.
Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR.

Mr. R. Chandrachud, AOR

Mr. Sudarsh Menon, AOR

Mr. Arvind P. Datar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sparsh Bhargava, Adv.
Ms. Ishita Farsaiya, Adv.
Mr. Vipin Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Kishore Kunal, AOR
Mr. Anupam Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Vinayak Mathur, Adv.

Ms. Shalini Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Upendra Misra, Adv.
Mr. Vinay Garg, Adv.

Mr. A. Venayagam Balan, AOR

Ms. Suruchii Aggarwal, AOR

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Syed Imtiyaz Ali, Adv.
Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR
Mr. N. A. Usmani, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mrs. Kirti Renu Mishra, AOR
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, Adv.
Ms. Apoorva Garg, Adv.
Ms. Apurna Upmanyu, Adv.

Mr. Bijoy Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR

Mr. K. V. Bharathi Upadhyaya, AOR

Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR

Mr. C. K. Sucharita, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR

Ms. Vimla Sinha, Adv.

Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.

Mr. Manish Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Pranab Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Shivam Singh, Adv.

Mr. Aditya Raina, Adv.

Mr. Shreyas Jain, Adv.

Mr. Kumar Milind, Adv.

Ms. Ambika Gautam, Adv.

Mr. C. N. Sree Kumar, AOR

Mr. C. S. N. Mohan Rao, AOR

Mr. Rabin Majumder, AOR

Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR

Mr. M. P. Vinod, AOR

Mr. Baby Krishnan, AOR

Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR

Mr. R. Sathish, AOR

Mr. Rajiv Mehta, AOR

Mr. M. T. George, AOR

Mr. Suwendu Suvasis Dash, AOR

Mr. A. V. Rangam, AOR

Mr. Abhijat P. Medh, AOR

Mr. Punit Dutt Tyagi, AOR

Mr. Y. Raja Gopala Rao, AOR

Mr. Prem Prakash, AOR
Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR
Mr. Y. Prabhakara Rao, AOR
Ms. Meera Mathur, AOR
M/s. Lawyer S Knit & Co, AOR
Mrs. Shally Bhasin, AOR
Mr. Sanjeeb Panigrahi, AOR
Mr. T. G. Narayanan Nair, AOR
Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR
Mr. Atul Jha, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep Jha, Adv.
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR
Mr. Deba Prasad Mukherjee, AOR
Mr. R. V. Kameshwaran, AOR
Mr. Prabha Swami, AOR
Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR
Mr. Krishnayan Sen, AOR
Mr. B. S. Banthia, AOR
Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR
Mr. A. Radhakrishnan, AOR
Mr. M. K. Dua, AOR
Mr. G. N. Reddy, AOR
Mr. D. S. Chauhan, AOR
Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR
Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, AOR
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR
Mr. Parijat Sinha, AOR

Civil Appeal Nos. 3381-3400/1998 etc.

Ms. Reshmi Rea Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Ghosh, Adv.

Mr. Devashish Bharuka, AOR

Mr. Rajesh Prasad Singh, AOR

Mr. C. Balakrishna, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Maitreyee Mishra, Adv.
Mr. K. V. Vijaya Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Mishra Saurabh, Adv.
Mr. Ankit Kr. Lal, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

Heard in part.

The matters be listed on 22nd August, 2017.

(NIDHI AHUJA)
COURT MASTER

(MALA KUMARI SHARMA)
COURT MASTER