

ITEM NO.901

COURT NO.1

SECTION PIL-W

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(s) (Civil) No(s) .494/2012

JUSTICE K.S.PUTTASWAMY (RETD) AND ANR.

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA AND ORS.

Respondent(s)

WITH

T.C. (C) No.151/2013 (XVI -A)

T.C. (C) No.152/2013 (XVI -A)

W.P. (C) No.833/2013 (PIL-W)

W.P. (C) No.829/2013 (PIL-W)

W.P. (C) No. 932/2013 (PIL-W)

CONMT.PET. (C) No.144/2014 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)

T.P. (C) No.313/2014 (XVI -A)

T.P. (C) No.312/2014 (XVI -A)

SLP (Cr1) No.2524/2014 (II-A)

W.P. (C) No.37/2015 (PIL-W)

W.P. (C) No.220/2015 (PIL-W)

CONMT.PET. (C) No.674/2015 In W.P. (C) No.829/2013 (PIL-W)

T.P. (C) No.921/2015 (XVI -A)

CONMT.PET. (C) No.470/2015 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)

CONMT.PET. (C) No.444/2016 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)

CONMT.PET. (C) No.608/2016 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)

W.P. (C) No. 797/2016 (PIL-W)

(FOR [PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES] ON IA 4/2016

FOR [DIRECTIONS] ON IA 5/2017 FOR STAY APPLICATION ON IA 6/2017)

CONMT.PET. (C) No.844/2017 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)

W.P. (C) No.342/2017 (PIL-W)

(For interim prayers for grant of interim relief on IA 1/2017))

W.P. (C) No.372/2017 (X)

Date : 02-08-2017 These Matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J. CHELAMESWAR

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE S.A. BOBDE

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.K. AGRAWAL

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ROHINTON FALI NARIMAN

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ABHAY MANOHAR SAPRE

HON'BLE DR. JUSTICE D.Y. CHANDRACHUD

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE S. ABDUL NAZEER

For Petitioner(s)
In WP 494/2012

Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Avdhesh Kr. Singh, adv.
Mr. R.K. Rajwanshi, Adv.
Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv.
Ms. Deep Shikha Bharti, Adv.

For Petitioner(s)
In TC 151/2013

Mr. Arvind Datar, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Geetha Kovilan, Adv.

For Petitioner(s)
In TC 152/2013

Ms. Meenakshi Arora, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rahul Narayan, Adv.
Mr. Apar Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Ananya, Adv.
Mr. Shashwat Goel, Adv.
Ms. Bhavna, Adv.
Mr. Gautam Bhatia, Adv.
Ms. Krutika, Adv.

For Petitioner(s)
In WP 833/2013

Mr. Anand Grover, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shadan Farasat, Adv.
Ms. Tripti Tandon, Adv.
Ms. Lorraine Misquith, Adv.
Ms. Srinidhi Rao, Adv.
Ms. Priyam Cherian, Adv.
Mr. Prasanna S, Adv.
Mr. Suraj, Adv.
Mr. Vijayant Singh, Adv.
Mr. Nipun Saxena, adv.
Mr. Anando Mukherjee, Adv.

For Petitioner(s)
In WP 829/2013,
WP220/15,CP 674/
2015,WP 797/2016

Mr. Shyam Divan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.
Mr. Udayaditya Banerjee, Adv.
Mr. Prasanna S, Adv.
Ms. Niharika, Adv.
Mr. Anuj Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Kanika Kalaiyarasan, Adv.
Ms. Sameeksha G., Adv.
Ms. Kritika Bhardwaj, Adv.
Mr. Apar Gupta, Adv.
For M/s K.J. John & Co., Adv.

In WP(C) 342/2017

Mr. Shyam Divan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Vipin Nair, Adv.
Mr. P.B.Suresh, Adv.
Mr. Udayaditya Banerjee, Adv.
Mr. S.Prasanna, Adv.
Ms. Samiksha Godiyal, Adv.
Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Govind Manoharan, Adv.
Mr. V.K.Biju, Adv.
Ms. Nidhi Khanna, Adv.
Ms. Kritika Bhardwaj, Adv.

For Petitioner(s) Dr. Abhishek Atrey, Adv.
In WP 932/2013, Mr. Ravindra Lokhande, Adv.
CP 470/2015

For Petitioner(s) Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, Sr. Adv.
In CP 144/2014, Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, Adv.
444/2016, 608/2016 Ms. Neha Meena, Adv.
in WP 494/2012 Mr. Jaideep Singh, Adv.
Mr. Anirban Sen, Adv.
Ms. Taniya, Adv.

For Petitioner(s) M/s Meharia & Co., AOR
In TP 313 & 312/2014

For Petitioner(s) Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, Sr. Adv.
In WP 37/2015 Mr. Jaideep Singh, Adv.
Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, AOR
Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, Adv.
Mr. Prateek Chaddha, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Kashyap, Adv.
Mr. Pavan Bhushan, Adv.
Mr. Zulnoor Ahmed, Adv.
Mr. Jayavardhan Singh, Adv.
Mr. Eklavya Vasudev, Adv.
Ms. Ankita Chaudhary, Adv.
Ms. Radhika Sharma, Adv.

For Petitioner(s) Mr. Prashant Bhushan, AOR
In CP 844/2017

For Petitioner(s) Mr. Chittaranjan Mishra, Adv.
in WP 372/2017 Mr. Bhanu Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sarthak Chodhury, Adv.
for Mr. Pranaya Kumar Mohapatra, AOR

For Respondent(s) Mr. K. K.Venugopal, AG
(UOI) and for Mr. Tushar Mehta, ASG
petitioner(s) in Mr. Zoheb Hossain, Adv.
TP 921/2015 & SR Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
2524/2014 Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Manan Popli, Adv.
Ms. Shraddha Deshmukh, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Talwar, Adv.
Mr. Piyush Goyal, Adv.
Ms. Devika Jain, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kr. Gulati, Adv.
for Mrs. Anil Katiyar, Adv.

For UIDAI & State Mr. Tushar Mehta, ASG
of Madhya Pradesh Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
Mr. Manan Popli, Adv.
Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.

	Mr. Ankit Lal, Adv.
	Mr. Mishra saurabh, Adv.
For State of Maharashtra	Mr. C.A. Sundaram, Sr. Adv.
	Mr. Nishant R. Katneshwarkar, Adv.
	Ms. Rohini Musa, Adv.
	Mr. Abhishek Gupta, Adv.
	Mr. Zafar Inayat, Adv.
	Mr. Apoorv Tripathy, Adv.
	Mr. Arpit Rai, Adv.
State of Gujarat	Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
	Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR
	Ms. Jesal Wahi, Adv.
	Ms. Shodhika Sharma, Adv.
	Mr. Apoorva Garg, Adv.
	Ms. Sansriti Pathak, Adv.
IA 51252&51253/2017 In WP 494/2012	Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
	Mr. Dipesh Sinha, Adv.
	Ms. Ayiala Imti, Adv.
IA 5/2014 in WP 833/2013	Mr. Sajan Poovayya, Sr. Adv.
	Mr. Saransh Kumar, Adv.
	Mr. Priyadarshi Banerjee, Adv.
	Mr. Pratibhanu S. Kharola, Adv.
	Mr. Saransh Jain, Adv.
	For E.C. Agrawala, AOR
For RBI For W.P.932/2013	Mr. Jayant Bhushan, Sr. Adv.
	Ms. Reeja Verghese, Adv.
	Mr. Ketan Paul, Adv.
	Mr. Kuldeep S. Parihar, Adv.
	Mr. H.S. Parihar, Adv.
State of UP	Mr. D.K. Singh, AAG
	Mr. Adarsh Upadhyay, Adv.
	Miss Komal Mundra, Adv.
	Mr. Saurabh Agrawal, Adv.
State of Himachal Pradesh	Mr. J.S. Attri, Sr. Adv.
	Mr. Varinder Kumar Sharma, Adv.
	Mr. Chandra Nand Jha, Adv.
For IRDA	Mr. Parmanand Gaur, Adv.
NCT of Delhi	Mr. J.M. Kalia, Adv.
	Mr. D. S. Mahra, AOR
IA No. 31/2015 In WP(C) 494/12	Mr. Lalit Bhasin, Adv.
	Ms. Nina Gupta, Adv.
	Mr. Mudit Sharma, Adv.

For State of W.B.	Mr. Soumitra G. Chaudhuri, Adv. Mr. Chanchal K. Ganguli, Adv.
UT of Chandigarh	Ms. Vimla Sinha, Adv. for Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR
State of Telangana	Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.
For State of Meghalaya	Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, Adv.
State of AP	Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.
For RR No.39	Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Adv. Mr. Zeeshan Diwan, Adv. Ms. Savita Singh, AOR Ms. Veera Mahuli, Adv. Mr. Shruthanjaya Bharadwaj, Adv.
State of Goa	Mr. Jayant Mohan, AOR
For TRAI	Dr. Arghya Sengupta, Adv. Mr. Sanjay Kapur, AOR
For State of Mizoram	Mr. T. G. Narayanan Nair, AOR Ms. Nitya Madhusoodhanan, Adv.
For Govt. of Puducherry	Mr. Kapil Sibal, Sr. Adv. Mr. V. G. Pragasam, AOR Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.
For State of Pb.	Mr. Karan Bharihoke, Adv. For Mr. Jagjit Singh Chhabra, AOR
For State of Uttarakhand	Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR Mr. Ashutosh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
For State of Haryana	Dr. Arghya Sengupta, Adv. Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR
State of Chhattisgarh	Mr. Jugal Kishore Gilda, AG Mr. A.P. Mayee, Adv. Mr. A.Selvin Raja, Adv. Mr. Avnish M. Oza, Adv. Mr. Chirag Jain, Adv.
State of Rajasthan	Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, AAG Mr. Shrey Kapoor, Adv. Mr. T.A. Rehman, Adv. for Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

State of Jharkhand
 Mr. Tapesh Kr. Singh, Adv.
 Mr. Sukant Vikram, Adv.
 Mr. Mohd. Waquas, Adv.
 Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.

State of Kerala
 Mr. P.V. Surendra Nath, Sr. Adv.
 Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, Adv.
 Mr. Mohammed Saddique, Adv.
 Ms. Resmitha R. Chandran, Adv.
 Ms. Anu K. Joy, Adv.

State of J&K
 Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, Adv.
 Ms. Fauzia Shakil, Adv.
 Mr. Ujjwal Singh, Adv.
 Mr. Mojahid Karim Khan, Adv.

UT of Andaman &
 Nicobar Admn.
 Mr. K.V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.
 Mrs. G. Indira, AOR

State of Manipur
 Mr. Sapam Biswajit Meitei, Adv.
 Mr. Naresh Kr. Gaur, Adv.
 Mr. Ashok Kr. Singh, Adv.

State of Tripura
 Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR
 Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.
 Mr. Manish Kumar, Adv.
 Mr. Pranab Prakash, Adv.
 Mr. Shivam Singh, Adv.
 Mr. Aditya Raina, Adv.
 Mr. Shreyas Jain, Adv.
 Mr. Kumar Milind, Adv.
 Ms. Ambika Gautam, Adv.
 Mr. Chandan Kumar, Adv.

State of Uttarakhand
 Mr. J.K. Bhatia, AOR
 Mr. Ashutosh Kr. Sharma, Adv.

State of Nagaland
 Mrs. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv.
 Mr. Edward Belho, Adv.
 Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
 Mr. K. Luikang Michael, Adv.
 Ms. Elix Gangmei, Adv.
 Mr. Z.H. Isaac Haiding, Adv.

Mr. S. Mukerjee, Adv.
 Mr. Manoj K. Mishra, Adv.
 Mr. Umesh Dubey, Adv.
 Ms. Meghna Kalra, Adv.

Ms. Neela Gokhale, Adv.
 Mr. Aliam P, Adv.
 Ms. K.S. Mehlwal, AOR

Mr. R. Sudhinder, Adv.
 Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR
 Ms. Amrita Sarkar, Adv.

Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, Adv.
 Ms. Julian George, Adv.
 Mr. Arjun Ranganathan, Adv.
 Mr. Yatinder Garg, Adv.
 Mr. Yashwant Prasad, Adv.

Mr. Pradeep Gupta, Adv.
 Mr. Parinav Gupta, Adv.
 Mrs. Mansi Gupta, Adv.
 Mr. Moazzam Ali, Adv.
 for Dr (Mrs.) Vipin Gupta, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
 O R D E R

Resuming his arguments at 10.30 a.m., Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, learned senior counsel representing the State of Gujarat concluded at 12:20 p.m. Thereafter, Mr. Gopal Sankarnarayanan, learned counsel representing respondent no.39 in Writ Petition(C) No. 494/2012 made his submissions till 2:20 p.m. Then, Dr. Arghya Sengupta, learned counsel representing the State of Haryana and TRAI addressed the Court up to 2:50 p.m.

Thereafter, Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, Mr. Kapil Sibal, Mr. Shyam Divan, Mr. Anand Grover, Ms. Meenakshi Arora, Mr. Sajjan Poovayya and Mr. Arvind Datar, learned senior counsel made their submissions (in rejoinder) till 4:00 p.m. In between, Mr. P.V.Surender Nath, learned senior counsel representing the State of Kerala also made his submissions for about five minutes.

Hearing concluded.

Judgment reserved.

(Sarita Purohit)
 Court Master

(Sanjay Kumar-II)
 Court Master

(Sneh Lata Sharma)
 Court Master

(Indu Kumari Pokhriyal)
 Court Master

(Parveen Kumar)
 AR-cum-PS

(Satish Kr. Yadav)
 AR-cum-PS