

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s).494/2012

JUSTICE K.S.PUTTASWAMY(RETD) &amp; ANR.

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA &amp; ORS.

Respondent(s)

[FOR FURTHER HEARING] IA No.141212/2017-impleading party and IA No.141215/2017-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No.5311/2018-impleading party and IA No.5312/2018-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No.5890/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.10105/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.10355/2018-impleading party and IA No.13628/2018-impleading party and IA No.24406/2018-Intervention Application)

WITH

[ITEM NO.501.1 - T.C.(C) No.151/2013 (XVI -A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.2 - T.C.(C) No.152/2013 (XVI -A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.3 - W.P.(C) No.833/2013 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.4 - W.P.(C) No.829/2013 (PIL-W)]  
[IA NO.22171/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION AND IA NO.22174/2018-PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON];  
[ITEM NO.501.5 - T.P.(C) No.1797/2013 (XVI -A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.6 - W.P.(C) No.932/2013 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.7 - T.P.(C) No.1796/2013 (XVI -A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.8 - CONMT.PET.(C) No.144/2014 In W.P.(C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.9 - T.P.(C) No.313/2014 (XVI -A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.10 - T.P.(C) No.312/2014 (XVI -A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.11 - SLP(Cr1) No.2524/2014 (II-A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.12 - W.P.(C) No.37/2015 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.13 - W.P.(C) No.220/2015 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.14 - CONMT.PET.(C) No.674/2015 In W.P.(C) No.829/2013 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.15 - T.P.(C) No.921/2015 (XVI -A)];  
[ITEM NO.501.16 - CONMT.PET.(C) No.470/2015 In W.P.(C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.17 - W.P.(C) No.231/2016 (PIL-W)  
(IA 1/2016(DIRECTION) FOR ON IA 2/2016( PERMISSION TO AMEND WRIT PETITION AND RAISING ADDITIONAL GROUNDS))];  
[ITEM NO.501.18 - CONMT.PET.(C) No.444/2016 In W.P.(C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.19 - CONMT.PET.(C) No.608/2016 In W.P.(C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.20 - W.P.(C) No.797/2016 (PIL-W)  
(FOR PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES ON IA 4/2016;  
FOR DIRECTIONS ON IA 5/2017 & FOR STAY APPLICATION ON IA 6/2017)];

[ITEM NO.501.21 - CONMT.PET.(C) No.844/2017 In W.P.(C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.22 - W.P.(C) No.342/2017 (PIL-W)  
(FOR INTERIM PRAYERS FOR GRANT OF INTERIM RELIEF ON IA 1/2017 and IA No.129017/2017-impleading party and IA No.129021/2017-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No.129027/2017-impleading party and IA No.129032/2017-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No.1551/2018-impleading party and IA No.6537/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.6666/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION)];  
[ITEM NO.501.23 - W.P.(C) No.372/2017 (X)];  
[ITEM NO.501.24 - W.P.(C) No.841/2017 (X)  
(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.119235/2017-AMENDMENT OF THE PETITION)];  
[ITEM NO.501.25 - W.P.(C) No.1058/2017 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.26 - W.P.(C) No.966/2017 (PIL-W)  
(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.102155/2017-GRANT OF INTERIM RELIEF)];  
[ITEM NO.501.27 - W.P.(C) No. 1014/2017 (PIL-W)  
(FOR ADMISSION and I.R. and IA No.107091/2017-GRANT OF INTERIM RELIEF and IA No.122999/2017-impleading party)];  
[ITEM NO.501.28 - W.P.(C) No.1002/2017 (PIL-W)];  
[ITEM NO.501.29 - W.P.(C) No.1056/2017 (X)  
(IA No.6196/2018-PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS)];  
[ITEM NO.501.30 - CONMT.PET.(C) No.34/2018 in W.P.(C) No.1014/2017 (PIL-W) (FOR ADMISSION)].

Date : 05-04-2018 These matters were called on for HEARING today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.M. KHANWILKAR  
HON'BLE DR. JUSTICE D.Y. CHANDRACHUD  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ASHOK BHUSHAN

For Petitioner(s) Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, Adv. [AOR]  
Cont.P(C)Nos.144/14;Mr. Jaidep Singh, Adv.  
444/16 Mr. Anirben Sen, Adv.  
608/16 Mr. Pavan Bhushan, Adv.  
Mr. Jayavardhan Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Nupur Bhati, Adv.  
Ms. Chitragada Rashtravade, Adv.  
Ms. Vaidruti Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. T. Gopal, Adv.

WP(C)No.494/12 Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Avdhesh Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Rajendra Singh, Adv.  
Mrs. Rita Gupta, Adv.  
Ms. Harsha, Adv.

TC(C)No.151/13 Mr. P.R. Kovilan Poongkuntran, Adv.  
Mrs. Geetha Kovilan, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Aswathi M.K., Adv.  
Mr. V. Vasudevan, Adv.

TC(C)No.152/13 Mr. Rahul Narayan, Adv. [AOR]

WP(C)No.833/13 Mr. K.V. Vishwanathan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Shadan Farasat, Adv. [AOR]

WP(C)Nos.829/13; Mr. Shyam Divan, Sr. Adv.  
220/15; Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
797/16 Mr. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
CP(C)No.674/15 Mr. Anuj Sarma, Adv.  
Mr. Udayaditya Banerjee, Adv.  
Ms. Samiksha Godiyal, Adv.  
Ms. Niharika, Adv.  
Ms. Kanika Kalaiyarasan, Adv.  
Ms. Kritika Bharadwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Kanika Kalaiyarasan, Adv.  
for  
M/s. K.J. John And Co., Adv. [AOR]

TP(C)Nos.1797/13; M/s. Meharia & Company, Adv. [AOR]  
1796/13;  
313/14;  
312/14

WP(C)No.932/13 | Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, Adv. [AOR]  
|

CP(C)No.470/15 | Mr. Shyam Divan, Sr. Adv.  
| Mr. Abhishek Atrey, Adv. [AOR]  
| Ms. Vidyottma, Adv.  
|

WP(C)No.37/15 Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv. [AOR]

WP(C)No.231/16 Mr. Gautam Talukdar, Adv. [AOR]

CP(C)No.844/17 Mr. Prashant Bhushan, Adv. [AOR]

WP(C)Nos.342/17; Mr. Vipin Nair, Adv. [AOR]  
1002/17

WP(C)No.372/17 Mr. Pranaya Kumar Mohapatra, Adv. [AOR]

WP(C)No.841/17 Mr. Suhaan Mukerji, Adv.  
Ms. Astha Sharma, Adv.  
for  
PLR Chambers & Co., Adv. [AOR]

WP(C)No.1058/17 Mr. Anando Mukherjee, Adv. [AOR]

WP(C)No.966/17 Mr. Koshy John, Adv.  
Mr. Md. Nizam Pasha, Adv.  
Ms. Anusha Nagarajan, Adv.  
Mr. Adit Pujari, Adv.  
Ms. Pragya Baghel, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Ranjeeta Rohatgi, Adv.  
Ms. Samten Doma, Adv.

WP(C)No.1014/17 Mr. Apar Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Deepayan Mandal, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Rahul Unnikrishnan, Adv.

WP(C)No.1056/17 Mr. K.V. Viswanathan, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Vrinda Bhandari, Adv.  
Mr. Gautam Bhatia, Adv.  
Mr. N. Sai Vinod, Adv.  
Mr. T.V.S. Raghavendra Sreyas, Adv. [AOR]

CP(C)No.34/18 Mr. Sameer H. Shahani-in-person

For Respondent(s) Mr. K.K. Venugopal, AG  
Mr. Zoheb Hossain, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Ankur Talwar, Adv.  
Ms. Shraddha Deshmukh, Adv.  
Mr. R. Balasubramanian, Adv.  
Ms. Chavanya L., Adv.  
Ms. Aarti Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Rohit Bhat, Adv.  
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.  
Mr. Kanu Aggarwal, Adv.  
Ms. Adeeba Mujahid, Adv.  
Mr. Rajendra Dangwal, Adv.  
Mr. Piyush Goyal, Adv.  
Mr. Palash Maheshwari, Adv.  
Mr. Fahad M. Khan, Adv.  
Ms. Bhavita Kumar, Adv.  
Ms. Priyanka Walesha, Adv.

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, AG  
Mr. S.S. Shamsery, Adv.  
Mr. Harish V. Shenkar, Adv.  
Ms. Rukmani Bobde, Adv.  
Ms. Shradha Deshmukh, Adv.  
Mr. M.K. Maroria, Adv. [AOR]

Ms. Sanchi Malhotra, Adv.  
Ms. Priyanka Walesha, Adv.  
Mr. Rohit Bhat, Adv.

Mr. K.V. Venugopal, AG  
Mr. S.S. Shamsery, Adv.  
Ms. Shardha Deshmukha, Adv.  
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.  
Mr. R. Balasubramaniam, Adv.  
Mr. Zoheb Hossain, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Bahadur, Adv. [AOR]

Gujarat Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Zoheb Hossain, Adv.  
Ms. Hemantika Wahi, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Shodhika Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, Adv.  
Ms. Apoorva Garg, Adv.

Himachal Pradesh Mr. Varinder Kumar Sharma, Adv. [AOR]

Puducherry Mr. V. G. Pragasam, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. S. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.  
Mr. S. Manuraj, Adv.

TRAI Mr. Sanjay Kapur, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Mansi Kapur, Adv.  
Ms. Megha Karnwal, Adv.  
Ms. Shubhra Kapur, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Adv.  
Ms. Savita Singh, Adv. [AOR]

Rajasthan Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv. [AOR]

Meghalaya Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Daniel Stone Lyngdoh, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Mishra Saurabh, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. S. Mukherjee, Adv.  
Mr. Manoj K. Mishra, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Umesh Dubey, Adv.  
Mr. Ashish Kumar Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Manish Vashishtha, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Jayant Mohan, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Jagjit Singh Chhabra, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Harish Pandey, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Garvesh Kabra, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Ashok Mathur, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Sauya Mehrotra, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Anip Sachthey, Adv. [AOR]  
Mrs. Anil Katiyar, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Radhika Chaturvedi, Adv.  
Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. S.K. Rajora, Adv.  
for  
Dr. (Mrs.) Vipin Gupta, Adv. [AOR]

**Andhra Pradesh** Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.  
M/s. Corporate Law Group, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, Adv. [AOR]

**Haryana** Mr. Anil Grover, AAG  
Ms. Noopur Singhal, Adv.  
Mr. Shivam Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, Adv. [AOR]

**Jharkhand** Mr. Tapesk Kumar Singh, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Mohd. Waquas, Adv.

**J&K** Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Anitha Shenoy, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, Adv. [AOR]

**Mizoram** Mr. K.N. Madhusoodhanan, Adv.  
Ms. Nitya Madhusoodhanan, Adv.  
Mr. T. G. Narayanan Nair, Adv. [AOR]

**Sikkim** Ms. Aruna Mathur, Adv.  
Mr. Avneesh Arputham, Adv.  
Ms. Anuradha Arputham, Adv.  
Ms. Simran Jeet, Adv.  
for  
M/s. Arputham Aruna and Co., Adv. [AOR]

**Uttarakhand** Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Ashutosh Kumar Sharma, Adv.

**West Bengal** Ms. Astha Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Suhaan Mukerji, Adv.  
for  
PLR Chambers & Co., Adv. [AOR]

**Tripura** Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.

**Tamil Nadu** Mr. K.V. Vijayakumar, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Maitreyee Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Muthuvel Palani, Adv.

Mr. Milind Kumar, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. E.C. Agrawala, Adv. [AOR]

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, Adv. [AOR]

Ms. Rashmi Singhanian, Adv. [AOR]

**UT of Chandigarh** Mr. Gopal Singh, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Dinkar Kalra, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Mohit D. Ram, Adv. [AOR]

**R.B.I.** Mr. Jayant Bhushan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Kuldeep S. Parihar, Adv.  
Mr. H.S. Parihar, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Ketan Paul, Adv.

**Telangana** Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.

Mr. Wills Mathews, Adv.  
Mr. Shaji Sebastian, Adv.  
Mr. Ginesh P., Adv.  
Mr. Rabin Majumder, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Jogy Scaria, Adv. [AOR]

M/s. Meharia & Co., Adv. [AOR]

Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv.  
Ms. Swati Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Ramandeep Kaur, Adv.  
Ms. Shreyasi Kunwar, Adv.  
for  
M/s. Lawyer S Knit & Co., Adv. [AOR]

Mr. M.P. Vinod, Adv. [AOR]

Dr. Lalit Bhasin, Adv.  
Ms. Nina Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Shereen Shukla, Adv.  
Ms. Palak Chadha, Adv.  
Mr. Mudit Sharma, Adv. [AOR]

Mr. Harsh Kaushik, Adv. [AOR]

M/s. Khaitan & Co., Adv. [AOR]

Mr. K.R. Sasiprabhu, Adv. [AOR]

West Bengal Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, Adv. [AOR]

Kerala Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Anu K. Joy, Adv.  
Mr. Manav Vohra, Adv.  
Mr. Krishna Dev J., Adv.  
Mr. Amith Krishnan, Adv.  
Mr. Mohammed Sadique T.A., Adv.  
Ms. Svadha Shankar, Adv.  
Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.

Karnataka Mr. Devadatt kamat, Addl. Adv. Gen.  
Mr. Joseph Aristotle S., Adv. [AOR]  
Mrs. Priya Aristotle, Adv.  
Mr. Rajesh Inamdar, Adv.  
Mr. Javedur Rehman, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Bhat, Adv.

Punjab Mr. Karan Bharihoke, Adv.

Jharkhand Mr. Jayesh Gaurav, Adv.  
Mr. Ratan Kr. Choudhuri, Adv.

A&N Admn. Mr. Bhupesh Narula, Adv.  
Mr. K.V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.  
Mrs. G. Indira, Adv.

Nagaland Mr. Edward Belho, AAG  
Mrs. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. K. Luikang Michael, Adv.

Manipur Mr. Leisangthem Roshmani Kh., Adv.  
Mr. Maibam Babina, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Bansal, Adv.  
Mrs. Veena Bansal, Adv.  
Mr. Kuldip Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Yadava, Adv.

**Assam**

Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, Adv.  
Mr. Sayooj Mohandas M., Adv.

**For Applicant (s)**

Mr. E.C. Agrawala, Adv.  
  
Mr. P.V. Surendra Nath, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Resmitha R. Chandran, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Lekha Sudhakaran, Adv.  
  
Ms. Pallavi Pratap, Adv. [AOR]  
  
Mr. Sriram P., Adv.  
Ms. Khushbu Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Vishnu Shankar M.S., Adv.  
Ms. Athira G. Nair, Adv.  
  
Mr. Syed Jafar Alam, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Shivani Khandekar, Adv.  
  
Ms. Pooja Dhar, Adv. [AOR]  
  
Mr. K. Rajeev, Adv. [AOR]  
  
Mr. Fuzail Ahmad Ayyubi, Adv. [AOR]  
  
Ms. Kavita Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Dr. Anindita Pujari, Adv. [AOR]  
  
Mr. Jawahar Raja, Adv.  
Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Rahat Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Chinmay Kanojia, Adv.  
  
Ms. Aparna Bhat, Adv. [AOR]  
Mr. Mayank Sapra, Adv.  
Ms. Joshita Pai, Adv.  
  
**IA No.122999/17**  
  
Mr. Koshy John, Adv.  
Mr. Md. Nizam Pasha, Adv.  
Ms. Anusha Nagarajan, Adv.  
Mr. Adit Pujari, Adv.  
Ms. Pragya Baghel, Adv. [AOR]  
Ms. Ranjeeta Rohatgi, Adv.  
Ms. Samten Doma, Adv.  
  
Mr. Sai Krishna Rajgopal, Adv.  
Mr. Julien George, Adv.  
Ms. Arundhati Gopal, Adv.  
Mr. Arjun Ranganathan, Adv.  
Mr. Vaneeja Jain, Adv.  
Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, Adv.

**Intervenor-in-person  
Applicant-in-person**

**UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R**

**Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned Attorney General for India  
continued his arguments which remained inconclusive.**

**List on Tuesday, the 10<sup>th</sup> April 2018 for further hearing.**

**(Subhash Chander)  
AR-cum-PS**

**(H.S. Parasher)  
Assistant Registrar**