

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Civil Appeal No. 2165/2012

COMMISSIONER OF INCOME TAX 5 MUMBAI

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

M/S. ESSAR TELEHOLDINGS LTD. THROUGH ITS MANAGER

Respondent(s)

WITH

C.A. No. 1423/2015 (IV)
SLP(C) No. 4243/2017 (IX)
C.A. No. 1101/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 129/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 125/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 8918/2017 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 8507-8509/2012 (IX)
C.A. No. 4539/2017 (III)
C.A. No. 3267/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 3358/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 127/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 3279/2016 (III)
SLP(C) No. 36560/2012 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 23624/2016 (IX)
C.A. No. 130/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 16185/2016 (IX)
C.A. No. 110-112/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 104-109/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 5044/2016 (XIV)
C.A. No. 5417/2016 (III)
C.A. No. 4308/2014 (III)
SLP(C) No. 21844/2013 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 19614/2013 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 31417/2016 (XIV)
C.A. No. 128/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6019/2016 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 18398/2015 (IX)
C.A. No. 6294/2015 (III)
SLP(C) No. 21845/2013 (IX)
C.A. No. 6313/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 5469/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 6733/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 115/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 21294/2012 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 19303/2015 (IX)
C.A. No. 113/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 117/2015 (XIV)

C.A. No. 2165/2012 etc.

C.A. No. 5101/2012 (IX)
C.A. No. 5471/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 5470/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 118/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 7797/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6727/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 119/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 116/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 20478/2015 (IX)
C.A. No. 194/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 114/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6191/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8921/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 6192/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7169/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7166/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 3355/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 7167/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8376/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7172/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7170/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 9183/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 120/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 7395/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8341/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7168/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8256/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7171/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7974/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8342/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7173/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8343/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8933/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 381/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8596/2014 (III)
SLP(C) No. 26278/2016 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 27054/2016 (III)
C.A. No. 8909/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7394/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 121/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 122/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 9832/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 9833/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7892/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 9184/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7426/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 3359/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 10096/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 123/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6590/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 9251/2015 (III)

C.A. No. 2165/2012 etc.

C.A. No. 8195/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 126/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8800/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 9252/2015 (III)
SLP(C) No. 36388/2014 (IX)
C.A. No. 14525/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 3781/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 3273/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8178/2016 (III)
C.A. No. 8177/2016 (III)
SLP(C) No. 10986/2013 (XVI)
C.A. No. 124/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 19098/2017 (XIV)
(With IA No.45647/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING and IA
No.45648/2017-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT)
SLP(C) No. 17499/2017 (XIV)
Diary No(s). 15600/2017 (XIV)
(FOR CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING ON IA 49025/2017)
SLP(C) No. 20475/2017 (IV-B)
(With IA No.63093/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)
SLP(C) No. 23123/2017 (IV-B)
(With IA No.74705/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING and IA
No.74707/2017-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT
and IA No.74706/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILEING)
Diary No. 19735/2017
(With IA No.88764/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING, IA
No.88768/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILEING and IA
No.88771/2017-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT)

Date : 19-09-2017 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ASHOK BHUSHAN

For parties

Mr. Munawwar Naseem, AOR
Mr. Kamal K. Jetley, Adv.
Mr. Rishabh Jetley, Adv.
Mr. Varun Kaushik, Adv.

Mr. Rohit Rao N., Adv.
Mr. Mukund P. Unny, Adv.
Ms. Devahuti Tamuli, Adv.
Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.

Mr. Rajat Navet, Adv.
Mr. Kushagra Pandit, Adv.
Mr. Pradeep K. Bakshi, Adv.

Mr. Salil Kapoor, Adv.

Ms. Sanat Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Sumit Lalchandani, Adv.
Ms. Ananya Kapoor, Adv.
Ms. Soumya Singh, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Swaroop, Adv.

Dr. Shashwat Bajpai, Adv.
Mr. Sharad Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, Adv.

Mr. P. J. Pardiwalla, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rustom B. Hathikhanawala, AOR

Mr. B. P. Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Naveen Kumar, Adv.

Mr. S. S. H. Rizvi, Adv.
Mr. N. A. Usmani, Adv.

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, ADV.
Mr. Vivek Jain, Adv.
Mr. Rishabh Parikh, Adv.
Ms. Shally Bhasin, Adv.

Mr. K. K. Venugopal, AG.
Mr. P. S. Narsimha, ASG.
Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. D. L. Chidananda, Adv.
Mr. Arijit Prasad, Adv.
Ms. Sadhna Sandhu, Adv.
Ms. Gargi Khanna, Adv.
Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.
Mr. Subhash Acharya, Adv.
Mr. Manish Pushkarna, Adv.
Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, Adv.
Mr. S. K. Pathak, Adv.
Mr. H. R. Rao, Adv.

Mr. Kamal Sawhney, Adv.
Mr. Shikhar Garg, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Meharchandani, Adv.
Ms. Pooja Dhar, Adv.

Mr. R. Santhanam, Adv.
Mr. A. P. Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Brajesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. R. Sudhinder, Adv.
Ms. Amrita Sarkar, Adv.
Mr. Ashok Mathur, Adv.

Mr. Bimal Roy, Adv.
Mr. Ankush M., Adv.

Ms. Vithika Garg, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Kumar, Adv.

Dr. Rakesh Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Somil Agarwal, Adv.
Ms. Monika Ghai, Adv.
Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Vohra, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Kavita Jha, Adv.
Mr. Bhuwan Dhoopar, Adv.

Mr. Rajiv Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. Divakar Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Abhay A. Jena, Adv.
Mr. Ranjit B. Raut, Adv.
Ms. Bina Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Mihir Ashok Mody, Adv.
Mr. Sudhanshu Sikka, Adv.
Mr. Suresh R. Nair, Adv.
M/s. K Ashar & Co.

Mr. K. Dutta, Adv.
Mr. Birendra Kumar Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Aashish Verma, Adv.
Ms. Poonam Atey, Adv.

Ms. Anshula Laroiya, Adv.
Mr. Chandra Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh Mahna, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Jureja, Adv.
Mr. Bhargava V. Desai, Adv.
Mr. Akshat Malpani, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Aggarwal, Adv.
Ms. Mallika Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Rajan Narain, Adv.

Mr. S. Vasudevan, Adv.
Mr. Saurav Sood, Adv.
Mr. Shashank Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Punit D. Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. M. P. Devanath, Adv.
Mr. Punit Dutt Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Neelam Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Dinesh Minocha, Adv.

Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR

Mr. Pradeep Kumar Bakshi, AOR

Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR

M/s. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Mr. B. S. Banthia, AOR

Ms. Aruna Gupta, AOR

Mr. Naveen Kumar, AOR

Mr. Jagdish Kumar Chawla, AOR

Mr. Vijay Kumar, AOR

Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR

Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR

Mr. Chandra Prakash, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

Part heard.

List the matters on 04.10.2017.

(NIDHI AHUJA)
COURT MASTER

(MALA KUMARI SHARMA)
COURT MASTER

C.A. No. 2165/2012 etc.

ITEM NO.102

COURT NO.6

SECTION IX

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No. 2165/2012

COMMISSIONER OF INCOME TAX 5 MUMBAI

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

M/S. ESSAR TELEHOLDINGS LTD. THROUGH ITS MANAGER

Respondent(s)

WITH

C.A. No. 1423/2015 (IV)
SLP(C) No. 4243/2017 (IX)
C.A. No. 1101/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 129/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 125/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 8918/2017 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 8507-8509/2012 (IX)
C.A. No. 4539/2017 (III)
C.A. No. 3267/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 3358/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 127/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 3279/2016 (III)
SLP(C) No. 36560/2012 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 23624/2016 (IX)
C.A. No. 130/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 16185/2016 (IX)
C.A. No. 110-112/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 104-109/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 5044/2016 (XIV)
C.A. No. 5417/2016 (III)
C.A. No. 4308/2014 (III)
SLP(C) No. 21844/2013 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 19614/2013 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 31417/2016 (XIV)
C.A. No. 128/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6019/2016 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 18398/2015 (IX)
C.A. No. 6294/2015 (III)
SLP(C) No. 21845/2013 (IX)
C.A. No. 6313/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 5469/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 6733/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 115/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 21294/2012 (IX)
SLP(C) No. 19303/2015 (IX)
C.A. No. 113/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 117/2015 (XIV)

C.A. No. 2165/2012 etc.

C.A. No. 5101/2012 (IX)
C.A. No. 5471/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 5470/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 118/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 7797/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6727/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 119/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 116/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 20478/2015 (IX)
C.A. No. 194/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 114/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6191/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8921/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 6192/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7169/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7166/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 3355/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 7167/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8376/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7172/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7170/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 9183/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 120/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 7395/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8341/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7168/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8256/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7171/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7974/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8342/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7173/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8343/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 8933/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 381/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8596/2014 (III)
SLP(C) No. 26278/2016 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 27054/2016 (III)
C.A. No. 8909/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7394/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 121/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 122/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 9832/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 9833/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7892/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 9184/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 7426/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 3359/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 10096/2013 (III)
C.A. No. 123/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 6590/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 9251/2015 (III)

C.A. No. 2165/2012 etc.

C.A. No. 8195/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 126/2015 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8800/2012 (XIV)
C.A. No. 9252/2015 (III)
SLP(C) No. 36388/2014 (IX)
C.A. No. 14525/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 3781/2015 (III)
C.A. No. 3273/2013 (XIV)
C.A. No. 8178/2016 (III)
C.A. No. 8177/2016 (III)
SLP(C) No. 10986/2013 (XVI)
C.A. No. 124/2015 (XIV)
SLP(C) No. 19098/2017 (XIV)
(With IA No.45647/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING and IA
No.45648/2017-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT)
SLP(C) No. 17499/2017 (XIV)
Diary No(s). 15600/2017 (XIV)
(FOR CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING ON IA 49025/2017)
SLP(C) No. 20475/2017 (IV-B)
(With IA No.63093/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)
SLP(C) No. 23123/2017 (IV-B)
(With IA No.74705/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING and IA
No.74707/2017-EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT
and IA No.74706/2017-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILING)

Date : 19-09-2017 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ASHOK BHUSHAN

For parties

Mr. Munawwar Naseem, AOR
Mr. Kamal K. Jetley, Adv.
Mr. Rishabh Jetley, Adv.
Mr. Varun Kaushik, Adv.

Mr. Rohit Rao N., Adv.
Mr. Mukund P. Unny, Adv.
Ms. Devahuti Tamuli, Adv.
Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.

Mr. Rajat Navet, Adv.
Mr. Kushagra Pandit, Adv.
Mr. Pradeep K. Bakshi, Adv.

Mr. Salil Kapoor, Adv.
Ms. Sanat Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Sumit Lalchandani, Adv.
Ms. Ananya Kapoor, Adv.
Ms. Soumya Singh, Adv.

Mr. Praveen Swaroop, Adv.

Dr. Shashwat Bajpai, Adv.

Mr. Sharad Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, Adv.

Mr. P. J. Pardiwalla, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Rustom B. Hathikhanawala, AOR

Mr. B. P. Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Naveen Kumar, Adv.

Mr. S. S. H. Rizvi, Adv.

Mr. N. A. Usmani, Adv.

Mr. S. K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, ADV.

Mr. Vivek Jain, Adv.

Mr. Rishabh Parikh, Adv.

Ms. Shally Bhasin, Adv.

Mr. K. K. Venugopal, AG.

Mr. P. S. Narsimha, ASG.

Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. D. L. Chidananda, Adv.

Mr. Arijit Prasad, Adv.

Ms. Sadhna Sandhu, Adv.

Ms. Gargi Khanna, Adv.

Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.

Mr. Subhash Acharya, Adv.

Mr. Manish Pushkarna, Adv.

Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, Adv.

Mr. S. K. Pathak, Adv.

Mr. H. R. Rao, Adv.

Mr. Kamal Sawhney, Adv.

Mr. Shikhar Garg, Adv.

Mr. Prashant Meharchandani, Adv.

Ms. Pooja Dhar, Adv.

Mr. R. Santhanam, Adv.

Mr. A. P. Sinha, Adv.

Mr. Brajesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. R. Sudhinder, Adv.

Ms. Amrita Sarkar, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Mathur, Adv.

Mr. Bimal Roy, Adv.

Mr. Ankush M., Adv.

Ms. Vithika Garg, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Kumar, Adv.

Dr. Rakesh Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Somil Agarwal, Adv.
Ms. Monika Ghai, Adv.
Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Vohra, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Kavita Jha, Adv.
Mr. Bhuwan Dhoopar, Adv.

Mr. Rajiv Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. Divakar Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Abhay A. Jena, Adv.
Mr. Ranjit B. Raut, Adv.
Ms. Bina Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Mihir Ashok Mody, Adv.
Mr. Sudhanshu Sikka, Adv.
Mr. Suresh R. Nair, Adv.
M/s. K Ashar & Co.

Mr. K. Dutta, Adv.
Mr. Birendra Kumar Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Aashish Verma, Adv.
Ms. Poonam Atey, Adv.

Ms. Anshula Laroiya, Adv.
Mr. Chandra Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh Mahna, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Jureja, Adv.
Mr. Bhargava V. Desai, Adv.
Mr. Akshat Malpani, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Aggarwal, Adv.
Ms. Mallika Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Rajan Narain, Adv.

Mr. S. Vasudevan, Adv.
Mr. Saurav Sood, Adv.
Mr. Shashank Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Punit D. Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. M. P. Devanath, Adv.
Mr. Punit Dutt Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Neelam Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Dinesh Minocha, Adv.

Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR

Mr. Pradeep Kumar Bakshi, AOR

Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR

M/s. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Mr. B. S. Banthia, AOR

Ms. Aruna Gupta, AOR

Mr. Naveen Kumar, AOR

Mr. Jagdish Kumar Chawla, AOR

Mr. Vijay Kumar, AOR

Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR

Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR

Mr. Chandra Prakash, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

Part heard.

List the matters on 04.10.2017.

(NIDHI AHUJA)
COURT MASTER

(MALA KUMARI SHARMA)
COURT MASTER