

Revised*

ITEM NO.1501

COURT NO.1

SECTION IX

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Civil Appeal No(s). 1012/2002

PROPERTY OWNERS ASSOCIATION & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MAHARASHTRA . & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(WITH IA No. 146568/2022 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION)

WITH

SLP(C) No. 5777/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 5204/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 8797/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 7950/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 4367/1992 (IX)

W.P.(C) No. 934/1992 (X)

SLP(C) No. 6191-6192/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 6744/1993 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 2303/1995 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 13467/1995 (IX)

W.P.(C) No. 660/1998 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 342/1999 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 469/2000 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 672/2000 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 66/2024 (X)

(FOR ADMISSION)

Date : 05-11-2024 These matters were called on for pronouncement
of judgment today.

For Appellant(s) Mr. Zal Andhyarujina, Sr. Adv.
Mr. H. Devarajan, Adv.
Mr. Sameer Parekh, Adv.
Ms. Sonali Basu Parekh, Adv.
Mr. E.R. Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Sumit Goel, Adv.
Mr. Ishan Nagar, Adv.
Mr. Jayom Mahesh Shah, Adv.
Mr. Ashok Rajagopalan, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Thakral, Adv.
Ms. Aditi, Adv.
Ms. Apurba Pattanayak, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Krishna Chauhan, Adv.
Mr. Abhay Jadeja, Adv.
Ms. Dhanyashree Jadeja, Adv.
Mr. Varun Satiya, Adv.
Mr. Arun Unnikrishnan, Adv.
Ms. Revati Desai, Adv.
Ms. Akanksha Agrawal, Adv.
Ms. Serena Jetmalani, Adv.
Mr. Shayan Bisney, Adv.
M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR

Mr. Ashish Wad, Adv.
Mr. Manoj Wad, Adv.
Mrs. Tamali Wad, Adv.
Ms. Akriti Arya, Adv.
Ms. Swati Arya, Adv.
M/S. J S Wad And Co, AOR

Mr. P. Narasimhan, AOR

Mr. S. C. Birla, AOR
Mr. Subrat Birla, Adv.

Mr. Ujjwal A Rana, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Mehta, Adv.
M/S. Gagrat And Co, AOR

Mr. Amarjit Singh Bedi, AOR
Mr. P. N. Gupta, AOR

Mr. D. Ashok Rajagopalan, AOR
Mrs. Madhu Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. Kunal Jain, Adv.

M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR

Mr. Pramod Kumar Yadav, Adv.

For Respondent(s) Mr. Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General

Mr. Balbir Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR
Mr. Shrirang B. Varma, Adv.
Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Naman Tandon, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.
Mr. Sourav Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Krishna, Adv.
Ms. Preet S. Phanse, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Madhav Sinhal, Adv.
Mr. Gaurang Bhushan, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Dixit, Adv.
Ms. Aastha Singh, Adv.
Ms. Amudhini, Adv.
Mr. Aman Mehta, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Gopal Sankararayanan, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR
Mr. Nipun Saxena, Adv.
Mr. Srisatya Mohanty, Adv.
Ms. Anju Thomas, Adv.
Mr. Sanjeev Kaushik, Adv.
Ms. Mantika Haryani, Adv.
Mr. Shreyas Awasthi, Adv.
Mr. Eklavya Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Chakravarty, Adv.
Ms. Aditi Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Jahnvi Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Trisha Chandran, Adv.
Ms. Shivani Vij, Adv.
Ms. Tanya Srivastava, Adv.
Mr. Vishal Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Madhav Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv.
Mr. Bhanu Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Muskan Surana, Adv.
Mr. Shrutanjaya Bharadwaj, Adv.
Mr. Shourya Dasgupta, Adv.
Mr. Tushar Srivastava, Adv.
Ms. Shreya Nair, Adv.
Ms. Ishita Chowdhary, Adv.
Mr. Pradyut Kashyap, Adv.
Mr. Simranjeet Singh Rekhi, Adv.
Ms. Pratibha Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Abhijit Pattanaik, Adv.
Ms. Shriya Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Panistha Bhatt, Adv.
Ms. Mehreen Garg, Adv.
Ms. Aadya Pandey, Adv.

Mr. Shyam Divan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Agrawala, Adv.
Mr. Manu Krishnan, Adv.
Ms. Anwasha Padhi, Adv.
Mr. Yash Momaya, Adv.
Ms. Shivani Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Udayaditya Banerjee, Adv.
Mr. Aditi Deshmukh, Adv.
Mr. Shaurya Rai Ranjan, Adv.
Mr. Aryan Rachh, Adv.
Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Ms. Sujata Kurdukar, AOR

Mr. Rabin Majumder, AOR

Mr. Pramod B. Agarwala, AOR

Mr. Gopal Balwant Sathe, AOR

Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, AOR

M/S. Manoj Swarup And Co., AOR

Mrs. Manik Karanjawala, AOR

Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR
Mr. Sushant Dogra, Adv.
Mr. Dhananjay Kataria, Adv.
Mrs. Mahima C Shroff, Adv.

Mr. Manu Krishnan G, AOR

Mr. Sameer Parekh, AOR

Ms. B. Vijayalakshmi Menon, AOR

Mr. Vivek Sharma, AOR
Dr. Vijay Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Varun K Chopra, Adv.
M/S. Vkc Law Offices, AOR

Mr. Santosh Paul, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sriharsh Nahush Bundela, AOR
Mr. Vedant Mishra, Adv.

M/S. Lawyer S Knit & Co, AOR

Ms. Uttara Babbar, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Daisy Hannah, AOR
Ms. Oindrila Sen, Adv.
Ms. Ryana Mukherjee, Adv.
Mr. Samarth Mohanth Mohanty, Adv.
Ms. Sneha Ahmed, Adv.

Dr. Harshvir Pratap Sharma, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Tejas Patel, AOR
Mrs. Meera Kaura, Adv.
Mr. Paras Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Akshu Jain, Adv.
Mr. Akul Krishnan, Adv.
Ms. Stuti Jain, Adv.

M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Verma, AOR

- 1 Hon'ble Dr Justice Dhananjaya Y Chandrachud, Chief Justice of India, pronounced the judgment on behalf of himself, Hon'ble Mr Justice Hrishikesh Roy, Hon'ble Mr Justice J B Pardiwala, Hon'ble Mr Justice Manoj Misra, Hon'ble Mr Justice Rajesh Bindal, Hon'ble Mr Justice Satish Chandra Sharma and Hon'ble Mr Justice Augustine George Masih.
- 2 Hon'ble Mrs Justice B V Nagarathna and Hon'ble Mr Justice Sudhanshu Dhulia pronounced their separate judgments.
- 3 The Reference is answered in terms of the majority opinion.
- 4 The Registry is directed to obtain administrative instructions from the Chief Justice for placing the matters before an appropriate bench.

(SANJAY KUMAR-I)
ADDITIONAL REGISTRAR

(SAROJ KUMARI GAUR)
ASSISTANT REGISTRAR

(Three signed reportable judgments are placed on the file)

* Revised for appearances on being mentioned in Court No 1 on 6 November 2024.

ITEM NO.1501

COURT NO.1

SECTION IX

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No(s). 1012/2002

PROPERTY OWNERS ASSOCIATION & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MAHARASHTRA . & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(WITH IA No. 146568/2022 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION)

WITH

SLP(C) No. 5777/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 5204/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 8797/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 7950/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 4367/1992 (IX)

W.P.(C) No. 934/1992 (X)

SLP(C) No. 6191-6192/1992 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 6744/1993 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 2303/1995 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 13467/1995 (IX)

W.P.(C) No. 660/1998 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 342/1999 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 469/2000 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 672/2000 (X)

W.P.(C) No. 66/2024 (X)
(FOR ADMISSION)

Date : 05-11-2024 These matters were called on for pronouncement
of judgment today.

For Appellant(s)

Mr. Ashish Wad, Adv.
Mr. Manoj Wad, Adv.
Mrs. Tamali Wad, Adv.
Ms. Akriti Arya, Adv.
Ms. Swati Arya, Adv.
M/S. J S Wad And Co, AOR

Mr. P. Narasimhan, AOR

Mr. S. C. Birla, AOR
Mr. Subrat Birla, Adv.

Mr. Ujjwal A Rana, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Mehta, Adv.
M/S. Gagrat And Co, AOR

Mr. Amarjit Singh Bedi, AOR
Mr. P. N. Gupta, AOR

Mr. D. Ashok Rajagopalan, AOR
Mrs. Madhu Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. Kunal Jain, Adv.

M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR

Mr. Pramod Kumar Yadav, Adv.

For Respondent(s)

Mr. Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General
Mr. Balbir Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR
Mr. Shrirang B. Varma, Adv.
Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Naman Tandon, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.
Mr. Sourav Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Krishna, Adv.
Ms. Preet S. Phanse, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Gopal Sankararayanan, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR
Mr. Nipun Saxena, Adv.
Mr. Srisatya Mohanty, Adv.
Ms. Anju Thomas, Adv.
Mr. Sanjeev Kaushik, Adv.
Ms. Mantika Haryani, Adv.
Mr. Shreyas Awasthi, Adv.

Mr. Eklavya Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Chakravarty, Adv.
Ms. Aditi Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Jahnvi Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Trisha Chandran, Adv.
Ms. Shivani Vij, Adv.
Ms. Tanya Srivastava, Adv.
Mr. Vishal Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Madhav Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv.
Mr. Bhanu Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Muskan Surana, Adv.
Mr. Shrutanjaya Bharadwaj, Adv.
Mr. Shourya Dasgupta, Adv.
Mr. Tushar Srivastava, Adv.
Ms. Shreya Nair, Adv.
Ms. Ishita Chowdhary, Adv.
Mr. Pradyut Kashyap, Adv.
Mr. Simranjeet Singh Rekhi, Adv.
Ms. Pratibha Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Abhijit Pattanaik, Adv.
Ms. Shriya Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Panistha Bhatt, Adv.
Ms. Mehreen Garg, Adv.
Ms. Aadya Pandey, Adv.

Mr. Shyam Divan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Agrawala, Adv.
Mr. Manu Krishnan, Adv.
Ms. Anwasha Padhi, Adv.
Mr. Yash Momaya, Adv.
Ms. Shivani Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Udayaditya Banerjee, Adv.
Mr. Aditi Deshmukh, Adv.
Mr. Shaurya Rai Ranjan, Adv.
Mr. Aryan Rachh, Adv.
Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Ms. Sujata Kurdukar, AOR

Mr. Rabin Majumder, AOR

Mr. Pramod B. Agarwala, AOR

Mr. Gopal Balwant Sathe, AOR

Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, AOR

M/S. Manoj Swarup And Co., AOR

Mrs. Manik Karanjawala, AOR

Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR
Mr. Sushant Dogra, Adv.
Mr. Dhananjay Kataria, Adv.
Mrs. Mahima C Shroff, Adv.

Mr. Manu Krishnan G, AOR

Mr. Sameer Parekh, AOR

Ms. B. Vijayalakshmi Menon, AOR

Mr. Vivek Sharma, AOR
Dr. Vijay Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Varun K Chopra, Adv.
M/S. Vkc Law Offices, AOR

Mr. Santosh Paul, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sriharsh Nahush Bundela, AOR
Mr. Vedant Mishra, Adv.

M/S. Lawyer S Knit & Co, AOR

Ms. Uttara Babbar, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Daisy Hannah, AOR
Ms. Oindrila Sen, Adv.
Ms. Ryana Mukherjee, Adv.
Mr. Samarth Mohanth Mohanty, Adv.
Ms. Sneha Ahmed, Adv.

Dr. Harshvir Pratap Sharma, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Tejas Patel, AOR
Mrs. Meera Kaura, Adv.
Mr. Paras Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Akshu Jain, Adv.
Mr. Akul Krishnan, Adv.
Ms. Stuti Jain, Adv.

M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Verma, AOR

- 1 Hon'ble Dr Justice Dhananjaya Y Chandrachud, Chief Justice of India, pronounced the judgment on behalf of himself, Hon'ble Mr Justice Hrishikesh Roy, Hon'ble Mr Justice J B Pardiwala, Hon'ble Mr Justice Manoj Misra, Hon'ble Mr Justice Rajesh Bindal, Hon'ble Mr Justice Satish Chandra Sharma and Hon'ble Mr Justice Augustine George Masih.

- 2 Hon'ble Mrs Justice B V Nagarathna and Hon'ble Mr Justice Sudhanshu Dhulia pronounced their separate judgments.
- 3 The Reference is answered in terms of the majority opinion.
- 4 The Registry is directed to obtain administrative instructions from the Chief Justice for placing the matters before an appropriate bench.

(SANJAY KUMAR-I)
ADDITIONAL REGISTRAR

(SAROJ KUMARI GAUR)
ASSISTANT REGISTRAR

(Three signed reportable judgments are placed on the file)