

ITEM NO.32

COURT NO.2

SECTION PIL-W

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 13029/1985

M.C. MEHTA

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(IN RE: CROP BURNING

1) IA NO. 231822/2023 (APPLN. FOR DIRECTIONS ON B/O HARISH ARORA AND ORS.)

2) IA NO. 232078/2023 (APPLN. FOR INTERVENTION ON B/O MINU SINGH)

ONLY" IN W.P.(C) NO. 13029/1985 IS LISTED.

"ONLY" NAME OF THE FOLLOWING ADVOCATES MAY BE TREATED TO HAVE BEEN SHOWN IN THE LIST:

MR. HARISH N. SALVE, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.)

MS. APARAJITA SINGH, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.)

MR. A.D.N. RAO, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.)

MR. SIDDHARTHA CHOWDHURY, ADVOCATE (A.C.)

PETITIONER-IN-PERSON

MR. G.S. MAKKER,

MR. AMRISH KUMAR,

MR. SANJAY KR. VISEN,

MR. SUDEEP KUMAR,

MS. ROOHE HINA DUA,

MR. SANDEEP KR. JHA

MR. JYOTI MENDIRATTA,

MS. VRINDA BHANDARI,

MR. MUDIT GUPTA, ADVOCATES)

Date : 10-11-2023 This petition was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SUDHANSHU DHULIA

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE AHSANUDDIN AMANULLAH

For Parties

Ms. Aparajita Singh, Sr. Adv. (A.C.)

Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Sr. Adv. (A.C.)

Mr. Harish N. Salve, Sr. Adv. (A.C.) (NP)

Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury, Adv. (A.C.)

Petitioner-in-person

Mr. R. Venkataramani, Attorney General for India

Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Ms. Suhasini Sen, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh Kumar Singh, Adv.

Mr. S.s. Rebello, Adv.

Mr. Subhranshu Padhi, Adv.

Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv.

Mr. Wasim Qadri, Adv.

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.

Mr. Shagun Thakur, Adv.

Ms. Srishti Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

Mrs. Suhasini Sen, Adv.

Mr. Rajesh Kumar Singh, Adv.

Mr. Shubhranshu Padhi, Adv.

Mrs. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv.

Mr. P. K. Jain, AOR

Mr. Ramesh Babu M. R., AOR

Mr. Rajesh Kumar Chaurasia, AOR

Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR

Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR

Ms. Binu Tamta, AOR

Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Pradeep Kumar Bakshi, AOR

Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR

Mr. V. K. Verma, AOR

Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR

Mrs. Bina Gupta, AOR

Mr. Nishant Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR

Ms. Sujeeta Srivastava, AOR

Mr. Ajit Pudussery, AOR
Mr. Mukesh K. Giri, AOR
M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR

Mr. Sudhir Mendiratta, AOR
Mr. Joydeep Mukherjee, Adv.

Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR
Ms. Vijayalaxmi Jha, Adv.

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR
Mr. Hardeep Singh Anand, AOR
Mr. Sandeep Narain, AOR
Mr. Sushil Kumar Singh, AOR
Mrs. Rani Chhabra, AOR
Mr. G. Prakash, AOR
Ms. Shalini Kaul, AOR

Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, AOR
Mrs. Anu K Joy, Adv.
Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv.

Ms. Nandini Gidwaney, AOR
Mr. Shri Narain, AOR
Mr. Umesh Kumar Khaitan, AOR
Mrs. Priya Puri, AOR
Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR
Mrs. K. Sarada Devi, AOR

Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. A.A.G.
Mr. B. K. Satija, A.A.G.
Mr. Rahul Khurana, Adv.
Ms. Suvarna Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR

Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR

Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. A.A.G.
Mr. B.k. Satija, A.A.G.
Mr. Rahul Khurana, Adv.
Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR

Mr. T. V. Ratnam, AOR
Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR
Ms. Srishti Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Vaibhav Kandpal, Adv.

Ms. Manjula Gupta, AOR
Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR
Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain, AOR
Mr. Aniruddha Deshmukh, AOR
M/S. Khaitan & Co., AOR
Mr. Surya Kant, AOR
Mrs. B. Sunita Rao, AOR
Mr. Abhishek, AOR
Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR
Mr. Ravindra Bana, AOR
Mr. R. P. Gupta, AOR
Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR
Mr. Mohit D. Ram, AOR
Mr. Sarvam Ritam Khare, AOR
Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR
M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR
Mr. Pramod Dayal, AOR
Mr. Parijat Sinha, AOR
M/S. Saharya & Co., AOR
Mr. Rakesh Kumar-i, AOR
M/S. S. Narain & Co., AOR

Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR

Mr. Pavan Kumar, AOR

Mr. K. S. Kalara, Adv.
Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. S. K. Rajora, Adv.
Mr. Akhileshwar Jha, Adv.
Mr. Neeraj Singh, Adv.
Ms. Ritika Raj, Adv.
Ms. Komal, Adv.
Mr. T. V. George, Adv.

Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR
Mr. Ajay Bansal, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Swarup, Adv.
Mr. Gaurava Yadava, Adv.
Mr. Ameet Siingh, Adv.
Mr. Ravi Kumar, Adv.
Dr. Suvesh Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Pratishtha Majumdar, Adv.
Mr. Shankar Prasad Tanti, Adv.

Mr. Prashant Kumar, AOR
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR
Ms. Pritha Srikumar Iyer, AOR
Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, AOR

Mr. Gurminder Singh, A.G./ Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shadan Farasat, A.A.G.
Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, AOR
Mr. Harshit Khanduja, Adv.
Mr. Sahib Kochhar, Adv.

Mr. Atmaram Nadkarni, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Pradeep Mishra, AOR

Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Varun Singh, Adv.
Ms. Deepeika Kalia, Adv.
Ms. Kajal S Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Somesa S Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Keshav Khandelwal, Adv.
Ms. Vaishnavi, Adv.
Mr. Mudit Gupta, AOR

Mr. Vivek Gupta, AOR

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR
Mr. Manendra Pal Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Md. Apzal Ansari, Adv.

Ms. Charu Ambwani, AOR
Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR
M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR

Mr. Pradeep Misra, AOR
Mr. Daleep Dhyan, Adv.
Mr. Manoj Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Suraj Singh, Adv.
Mr. Bhuwan Chandra, Adv.

Mr. Manish Kumar, AOR
Mr. Ravi Shanker Jha, Adv.

Ms. Pritha Srikumar Iyer, AOR
Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR

Ms. Garima Prasad, AAG/ Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sudeep Kumar, AOR
Ms. Arushi Singh, Adv.

Ms. Surbhi Mehta, AOR
Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR
Ms. Divya Jyoti Singh, AOR

Ms. Aswathi M.k., AOR
Mr. Gopal Jha, AOR
Mr. Shishir Deshpande, AOR
Mr. D.kumanan, AOR
Mr. Danish Zubair Khan, AOR

Mr. Ajay Vikram Singh, AOR
Mrs. Priyanka Singh, Adv.
Mr. Pankaj Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Omkar, Adv.
Mr. Shubham Singh, Adv.

Mr. K. Paari Vendhan, AOR

Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv.
Mr. Pankaj Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Yash Pal Dhingra, AOR

Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR
Mr. Kabir Shankar Bose, Adv.
Mr. Deepayan Dutta, Adv.
Mr. Saurabh Tripathi, Adv.

Mr. Akshay Girish Ringe, AOR
Mr. Gaurav, AOR
Ms. Puja Sharma, AOR
Mr. Gautam Narayan, AOR
Mr. Neeraj Kumar Gupta, AOR
Mr. Hiren Dasan, AOR

Ms. Malvika Kapila, AOR
Ms. Tanwangi Shukla, Adv.

Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR
M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

Mr. Tapesh Kumar Singh, AOR
Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.

Ms. Shagun Matta, AOR

Ms. Meenakshi Arora, Sr. Adv.

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR

Mr. Anurag Kishore, AOR

Ms. Mayuri Raghuvanshi, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Vyom Raghuvanshi, Adv.

Dr. Brij Bhushan K Jauhari, Adv.
Mr. O.p.singh, Adv.
Mr. Harsh Mahan, Adv.
Ms. Purnima Jauhari, AOR

M/S. Ram Sankar & Co, AOR
Mrs. Harini Ramsankar, Adv.
Dr. Ram Sankar, Adv.
Mr. G Jai Singh, Adv.
Mr. G Anandan, Adv.
Mr. B Sasi Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Reegan Raj, Adv.
Mr. Krishna Pandey, Adv.
Ms. Jasmine Khurana, Adv.
Ms. Divya, Adv.
Ms. Rv Shaarumathi, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR
Mr. Dhananjaya Mishra, AOR
Mr. Gaurav, AOR
Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR
M/S. S. Narain & Co., AOR
Mr. Ayush Sharma, AOR
Mr. Kuldip Singh, AOR
Ms. Anushree Prashit Kapadia, AOR
Mr. Ketan Paul, AOR
Mr. Sameer Kumar, AOR

Mr. R Venkataramani, Attorney General for India
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR
Ms. Suhasini Sen, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. S. S. Rebello, Adv.
Mr. Subhranshu Padhi, Adv.
Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv.
Mr. Wasim Qadri, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kolhi, Adv.

Mr. Gaurav Choudhary, AOR
Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, AOR
Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR
Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR
Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR
Ms. Diksha Rai, AOR
Mr. Soumya Dutta, AOR

Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, AOR
Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, AOR
Ms. Divya Roy, AOR
Ms. Astha Tyagi, AOR
Mr. Anas Tanwir, AOR
Mr. Mritunjay Kumar Sinha, AOR
Mr. Durga Dutt, AOR
Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR

Mr. Sahil Tagotra, AOR
Ms. Abhivyakti Banerjee, Adv.
Ms. Sakshi Garg, Adv.
Mr. Gajendra Singh Negi, Adv.

Mr. Akhil Anand, AOR
Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR

Ms. Madhumita Bhattacharjee, AOR
Ms. Urmila Kar Purkayastha, Adv.
Ms. Srija Choudhury, Adv.

Mr. Rishi Matoliya, AOR

Mr. D. Abhinav Rao, AOR

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR
Mrs. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv.
Mrs. Baby Devi Bonia, Adv.
Mrs. Alka Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Anirudh Bhat, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Singh Ii, Adv.
Ms. Sonali Jain, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.

Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR
Mr. Ravindra S. Garia, AOR

Mr. Sumeer Sodhi, AOR
Mr. Chaitanya Sharma, Adv.

M/S. Ahmadi Law Offices, AOR
Ms. Jaikriti S. Jadeja, AOR

Mr. P. B. Suresh, Adv.
Mr. Vipin Nair, AOR
Mr. Arindam Ghosh, Adv.

Ms. Nidhi Mohan Parashar, AOR
Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR

Mr. Nitin Saluja, AOR
Mr. Deepayan Mandal, AOR
Ms. Shalu Sharma, AOR
Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR
Ms. Neeru Vaid, AOR
Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR

Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR
Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.
Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv.

Mr. Rishi Malhotra, AOR
Mr. Prakash Ranjan Nayak, AOR
Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR
Mr. Prasanna S., AOR
Ms. Mithu Jain, AOR
Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR
Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR
Mr. Rajiv Yadav, AOR
Mr. R. C. Kohli, AOR

Mr. D. Abhinav Rao, AOR

Mr. Aakarshan Aditya, AOR
Mr. Vinodh Kanna B., AOR
Mr. Sandeep Singh, AOR
Ms. N. Annapoorani, AOR
Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR
Mr. Sameer Shrivastava, AOR
Mr. Debojit Borkakati, AOR

Mr. Mahfooz Ahsan Nazki, AOR
Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.
Mr. T Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv.
Mr. Kv Girish Chowdary, Adv.
Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv.
Mr. Meeran Maqbool, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Guasain, Adv.

Ms. Misha Rohatgi, AOR
Mr. Ravi Prakash, AOR
Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR
M/S. Mukesh Kumar Singh And Co., AOR

Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, AOR
Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Devvrat Singh, Adv.
Mr. Kailas U More, Adv.

Mrs. Nirmala D Borade, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR

Mr. Vinod Sharma, AOR

M/S. Ram Sankar & Co, AOR
Mrs. Harini Ramsankar, Adv.
Dr. Ram Sankar, Adv.
Mr. G Jai Singh, Adv.
Mr. G Anandan, Adv.
Mr. B Sasi Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Reegan Raj, Adv.
Mr. Krishna Pandey, Adv.
Ms. Jasmine Khurana, Adv.
Ms. Divya, Adv.
Ms. Rv Shaarumathi, Adv.

Mr. Manoj Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Narender Bhahadur Tiwari, Adv.
Mr. Onkar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sagar Roy, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep L., Adv.
Ms. Manju Bala, Adv.
Mr. Subhro Sanyal, AOR

Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, AOR
Mr. Rakesh Kumar-i, AOR
Mr. Parminder Singh Bhullar, AOR

Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR

Mr. Yashraj Singh Bundela, AOR
Mr. Vishnu Kant, Adv.
Mr. Pawan, Adv.
Ms. Jyoti Verma, Adv.

Mr. M. P. Devanath, AOR
Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR
Ms. G. Indira, AOR
Mr. Yoginder Handoo, AOR

Mr. Vipin Shanghi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Saif Ali, Adv.
Mr. Pushendra S. Bhadoriya, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kumar, AOR

Ms. Lubna Naaz, AOR
Ms. Shashi Kiran, AOR
Mr. Nishit Agrawal, AOR
Ms. Rakhi Ray, AOR
Mr. Pranav Sachdeva, AOR
Mr. Shovan Mishra, AOR
Ms. G. Indira, AOR
Mr. Anuj Bhandari, AOR
Mr. Neeraj Shekhar, AOR
Mr. Mohit Paul, AOR
Mr. Nischal Kumar Neeraj, AOR
Mr. Harsh V. Surana, AOR

Mr. Puneet Taneja, AOR
Mr. Manmohan Singh Narula, Adv.
Mr. Amit Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, Adv.

Ms. Vrinda Bhandari, AOR
Ms. Surabhi Sanchita, AOR
Mr. Ashutosh Dubey, AOR
Mr. Chandra Prakash, AOR

Ms. Muskan Surana, Adv.
Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. T. R. B. Sivakumar, AOR
Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR

Mr. Vikram Gulati, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

We have heard learned counsel for the parties at some length.

Learned Attorney General is present in the Court and submits that the meeting held under the Chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary with the representatives of the State has prescribed certain steps to be taken up immediately in paragraph 12 at page 13 of the note submitted on behalf of the Union of India that all steps should be proceeded with by all stakeholders.

We are informed that every endeavour is being made and shall be made for use of carrot and stick policy to see that farm fires are brought under control. The reference to Punjab is only apparently because the percentage of fires there are more but it is not as if there is absence of delinquency on the part of other States.

There are certain suggestions being made in the course of hearing and the concerned authorities will look to it. Among the suggestions which we can easily flag is that with technology available now information is forthcoming to be utilized to control the farm fire where the exact location of farm fire can be immediately detected. How to proceed with it and what measures are to be taken are administrative in character and the function of the Court is to make sure that the administrators perform the task assigned to them.

We have once again flagged the issue of long time measures which will be required for crop diversification to be done in a phased manner including alternative varieties of paddy and encourage the crops which do not have such stubble which is required to be removed.

It is clarified that the submission of the learned Advocate General on the last date was to encourage what we have stated aforesaid and not to abolish the MSP forthwith on paddy.

In respect of the crop diversification there is a discussion on page 14 of the note on behalf of the Union of India as adopted by Haryana.

The Chairman, DPCC may not remain present in the court as the order has been complied with.

List on 21.11.2023.

(RASHMI DHYANI PANT)
COURT MASTER

(POONAM VAID)
COURT MASTER