

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 4677/1985

M.C.MEHTA

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(I.A. NO. 235067/2023 (CEC REPORT NO. 34/2023))

IN W.P. (C) NO. 4677/1985 "ONLY" ARE LISTED
NAMES OF FOLLOWING ADVOCATES MAY BE TREATED TO HAVE BEEN
SHOWN IN THE LIST :

MR. S GURU KRISHNA KUMAR, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.)

MS. ANITHA SHENOY, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.)

MR. A.D.N. RAO, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.)

MR. SIDDHARTHA CHOWDHURY, ADVOCATE (A.C.)

PETITIONER-IN-PERSON

MR. G.S. MAKKER,

MR. AMRISH KUMAR,

MR. PRAVEEN SWARUP,

MR. NISHIT AGRAWAL,

MR. CHIRAG M. SHROFF, ADVOCATES)

Date : 19-02-2024 This petition was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ABHAY S. OKA

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE UJJAL BHUYAN

Mr. S.Guru Krishna Kumar, Sr. Adv. (Amicus Curiae)

Ms. Anitha Shenoy, Sr. Adv. (Amicus Curiae)

Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Sr. Adv. (Amicus Curiae)

Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury, Adv. (Amicus Curiae)

For the appearing parties:

Mr. S. Wasim A. Qadri, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Tamim Qadri, Adv.

Mr. Saeed Qadri, Adv.

Mrs. Bhawna Kapur, Adv.

Mr. Deepak Bhati, Adv.

Mr. Shivendra Singh, Adv.

Ms. Udit Singh, AOR

Mr. Sanjiv Sen, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ajay Bansal, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Swarup, Adv.
Mr. Gaurava Yadava, Adv.
Mr. Ameet Siingh, Adv.
Mr. Ravi Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Anjali Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aman, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR

Dr. Surender Singh Hooda, AOR

M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR

Mrs. Rekha Pandey, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. Gunnam Venkateswara Rao, AOR

Petitioner-in-person

Ms. Prerna Mehta, AOR

Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR

Mr. A. Venayagam Balan, AOR

Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR
Mr. Manoranjan Paikaray, Adv.
Mr. Pranab Samantray, Adv.

Mr. Surinder Singh Lohchab, Adv.
Mr. Sahil Lohchab, Adv.
Mr. Kashmira Singh Chahar, Adv.
Mr. Vivek Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Sukesh Kumar Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Karan Thakur, Adv.
Mr. Devendra Singh, AOR

Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR

Mr. Abhay Kumar, AOR

Ms. Binu Tamta, AOR

Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR

Ms. Anu Gupta, AOR

Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR
Mr. Avadhesh Kumar Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep, Adv.
Mr. Sunil Prakash Pandey, Adv.
Mr. N B V Srinivasa Reddy, Adv.
Ms. Sarika Srivastava, Adv.

Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR
Mr. Pawan R Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Sarvjit Pratap Singh, Adv.

Mr. Satish Aggarwal, AOR

Mr. Satyendra Kumar, AOR
Ms. Vasundhara Rana, Adv.

Ms. Suhashini Sen, Adv.
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.
Mr. B K Satija, Adv.
Ms. Swarupama Chaturvedi, Adv.
Ms. Shagun Thakur, Adv.
Ms. Chitrangda Rastravara, Adv.
Ms. Chinmayee Chandra, Adv.
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Ajit Sharma, AOR

Mr. Suresh Chandra Tripathy, AOR

Mr. Sudhir Naagar, AOR

Mr. Md. Farman, AOR

Ms. Ruby Singh Ahuja, AOR

Mr. Venkateswara Rao Anumolu, AOR

Mr. Anand, Adv.
Mr. Abhijit Sengupta, AOR
Ms. Rajeshri Nivuratirao Reddy, Adv.
Ms. Shivani Jain, Adv.
Mr. Akhilesh Kumar Tiwari, Adv.
Mr. Rohit Jaiswal, Adv.
Mr. Bala Sahkari, Adv.

Mr. Neeraj Kumar Gupta, AOR

Mr. Tarun Johri, AOR
Mr. Avinash Kr. Lakhanpal, AOR
Mr. Sanjay Kapur, AOR
Mr. Pranaya Kumar Mohapatra, AOR
Mr. T. L. Garg, AOR
Mr. Shiv Prakash Pandey, AOR
Mr. Ashwani Kumar, AOR
Mrs. Rachana Joshi Issar, AOR
Mr. Prashant Chaudhary, AOR
Mr. Yashraj Singh Deora, AOR
Mr. V. K. Verma, AOR
Mr. Nikilesh Ramachandran, AOR
Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR
Mr. Pravir Choudhary, AOR
Mr. Reepak Kansal, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Prince Arora, Adv.
Mr. Venketa Balaji Kodavali, Adv.
Mr. Pankaj Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Verma, Adv.
Mr. Ravi Kumar Tomar, AOR
Mr. Harsh V. Surana, AOR
Mr. Raj Kamal, AOR
Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR
Ms. Rukhsana Choudhury, AOR
Mr. Prashant Bhushan, AOR
Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR

Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. A.A.G.
Mr. B.k. Satija, A.A.G.
Mr. Rahul Khurana, Adv.
Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR

Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, AOR

Mr. Haresh Raichura, AOR

Mr. Shekhar G Devasa, Adv.
Mr. Manish Tiwari, Adv.
Ms. Thashmitha Muthanna, Adv.
Mr. Shashi Bhushan Nagar, Adv.
Mr. Vishwanath Chaturvedi, Adv.
For M/S. Devasa & Co., AOR

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Vivek Narayan Sharma, AOR
Mrs. Mahima Bhardwaj Kalucha, Adv.
Mr. Dinesh Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Ravinder Kumar Yadav, AOR
Ms. Arti Anupriya, Adv.
Mr. Vineet Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Kartikey, Adv.

Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR

Ms. Anuradha Mutatkar, AOR
Mr. Nishit Agrawal, AOR
Ms. Rakhi Ray, AOR

Mr. Anando Mukherjee, AOR
Mr. Shwetank Singh, Adv.
Ms. Ekta Bharati, Adv.

Mr. Gagan Gupta, AOR
Mr. Anand Mishra, AOR
Ms. K. V. Bharathi Upadhyaya, AOR
Mr. Rajivkumar, AOR

Mr. Manoj K. Mishra, AOR
Mr. Umesh Dubey, Adv.
Mr. A. Baskar, Adv.
Mr. Vishal, Adv.
Ms. Madhulika, Adv.

Ms. Vanita Bhargava, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, AOR

Mr. Kailas Bajirao Autade, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Sharma, AOR

Mr. Ashok Anand, AOR

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR

Ms. Shubhangi Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Apurv Singhvi, Adv.

Mr. Rohan Darade, Adv.

Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR

Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR

Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR

Mr. Shiv Sagar Tiwari, Adv.

Mr. D. K. Devesh, AOR

Ms. Nidhi Das, Adv.

Mr. Anuj Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Shailesh Joshi, Adv.

Mr. Abhinav Agrawal, AOR

M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

Mr. Ilin Saraswat, Adv.

Mr. Sikander Saiyed, Adv.

Ms. Ilma Saifi, Adv.

Mrs. Itisha Jain Shukla, Adv.

Ms. Varsha Hotwani, Adv.

Ms. Samiksha Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Pooja Garg, Adv.

Mr. M. M. Kashyap, AOR

M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR

Mr. Dhananjay Garg, AOR

Mr. Abhishek Garg, Adv.

Mr. Ishaan Tiwari, Adv.

Mr. Dinesh Kumar Garg, Adv.

Mr. Chaudhary Shamsuddin, Adv.

Mr. R.p. Bansal, Adv.

Mr. Chanakya Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Arun Singh, Adv.

Ms. B. Vijayalakshmi Menon, AOR

Ms. Neha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Smarhar Singh, AOR

Mr. Jai Krishna Singh, Adv.

Mr. Vikas Chopra, Adv.

Ms. Shweta Kumari, Adv.

Mr. Manoj Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Mishra, AOR

Ms. Akriti Chaubey , AOR

Mr. Gaurav Goel, AOR

Mr. Rajesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Vinit Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Umesh Kumar Khaitan, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Upadhyay, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Mayuri Raghuvanshi, AOR

Mr. Vyom Raghuvanshi, Adv.

Mr. Saurabh Mishra, AOR

Mr. Rakesh Chander, Adv.

Mr. Shrimay Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Nirbhaya S Tiwari, Adv.

Ms. Priya Kaushik, Adv.

Ms. Nidhi Mohan Parashar, AOR

Mr. Abhas Kumar, AOR

Mr. Rahul Narayan, AOR

Ms. Firdouse Qutb Wani, AOR

Mr. Md. Zaryab J Rizvi, Adv.

Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR

Mr. Guntur Pramod Kumar, AOR

Mr. Abinash Kumar Mishra, AOR

Mr. Ajay Kumar Singh, AOR

Mr. Rajat Joseph, AOR

Mr. Prithu Garg, AOR

Mr. Krishnanand Pandeya, AOR
Mr. K. V. Mohan, AOR
Mr. Arjun Garg, AOR
Mr. Vishnu Kant, AOR
Mr. Jasmeet Singh, AOR
Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR
Mrs. Gargi Khanna, AOR
Mr. Somnath Mukherjee, AOR
Ms. Binu Tamta, AOR
Mrs. Rani Chhabra, AOR
Mr. Tarun Gupta, AOR
Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR
Mr. Vivek Narayan Sharma, AOR
Mrs. Mahima Bhardwaj Kalucha, Adv.
Mr. Dinesh Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Ravindra Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Binay Kumar Das, AOR
Ms. Priyanka Das, Adv.
Ms. Neha Das, Adv.
Mr. Shivam Saksena, Adv.
Ms. Shobha Gupta, AOR
Ms. Smita Maan, AOR
Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. A.A.G.
Mr. B.k. Satija, A.A.G.
Mr. Rahul Khurana, Adv.
Mr. Samar Vijay Singh, AOR
Mr. Nikunj Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Keshav Mittal, Adv.
Ms. Sabarni Som, Adv.
Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR

Ms. S. Janani, AOR

Dr. Arvind S. Avhad, AOR

Ms. Madhu Sikri, AOR

Mr. T. V. George, AOR

Mr. Bimlesh Kumar Singh, AOR

Mr. Rishi Malhotra, AOR
Mr. Jaydip Pati, Adv.

Mr. Shekhar Prit Jha, AOR
Ms. Preeti Kumari, Adv.

Mr. Vishnu Sharma, AOR
Mrs. Anupama Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Sonu Kumari, Adv.
Mrs. Anupama Kumari, Adv.

Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR
Mr. Manoranjan Paikaray, Adv.
Mr. Pranab Samantray, Adv.

Dr. Rakesh Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, AOR
Mr. Somil Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Devashish Bharuka, AOR

Mr. Rajesh Kumar Chaurasia, AOR

Ms. Richa Kapoor, AOR

Mr. Amarjit Singh Bedi, AOR

Mr. Arvind Gupta, AOR

Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR
Mr. Pawan R Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Sarvjit Pratap Singh, Adv.

Mr. R. C. Kohli, AOR

Mr. M. C. Dhingra, AOR

Mr. Shantanu Krishna, AOR
Mr. Siddharth Sengar, Adv.

Mr. Ekansh Mishra, AOR
Mr. Ramesh Kumar Mishra, AOR
Ms. Kaveeta Wadia, AOR
M/S. Unuc Legal Llp, AOR
Mr. D S Mehra, AOR
M/S. Mitter & Mitter Co., AOR
Ms. Shagun Matta, AOR
Mr. Samir Malik, AOR
Mr. Karunakar Mahalik, AOR
Mr. Yoginder Handoo, AOR
Mr. Dinesh Chandra Pandey, AOR
Mr. Dushyant Dahiya, Adv.
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR
Mr. Kiran Kumar Patra, AOR
Mr. Sunil Mund, Adv.
Mr. Sujit Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Biswajit Kumar Patra, Adv.
Mr. Chandrashekhar Padhi, Adv.
Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR
Mr. Dhananjay Kataria, Adv.
Mr. Shyam D. Nandan, AOR
Mr. A. Raghunath, AOR
Mr. Prakash Ranjan Nayak, AOR
Mr. Mritunjay Kumar Sinha, AOR
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR
Dr. Surender Singh Hooda, AOR
Ms. Supriya Juneja, AOR

Mrs. Suhasini Sen, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
Mr. S.S Rebello, Adv.
Mr. T S Sabarish, Adv.
Mr. Navanjay Mahapatra, Adv.
Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

We have perused the Report No.34 of 2023 of the Central Empowered Committee (CEC). We find that no authority has made an adjudication whether it is absolutely necessary to cut or remove 39 trees to enable construction as prayed for in IA No.235067/2023 (Application No.1567 of 2023).

Unless the said exercise is done of ascertaining whether felling of all 39 trees is required, we will not permit felling of a single tree. Moreover, the distance between the site allotted for compensatory afforestation and the site where the trees are in existence is not set out in the application.

To enable the learned Amicus Curiae to take instructions, list on 4th March, 2024.

The Registry to place on record Application No.1567 of 2023 before the Court on the next date of hearing.

(ANITA MALHOTRA)
AR-CUM-PS

(AVGV RAMU)
COURT MASTER