

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO(s). 435 OF 2012

GOA FOUNDATION Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS. Respondent(s)

(Office report for directions along with letters received from members of Expert Committee I.e. S. Parmeswarappa IFS (Retd.), Dr. S.C.Dhiman, Former Chairman, Central Ground Water Board and Prof. C.R. Babu)

Date: 06/01/2014 These Petitions/Applications were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. PATNAIK  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SURINDER SINGH NIJJAR  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE FAKKIR MOHAMED IBRAHIM KALIFULLA

AMICUS CURIAE

Mr. Harish N. Salve, Sr. Adv. (NP)  
Mr. Uday Umesh Lalit, Sr. Adv. (NP)  
Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Adv.  
Mr. Siddharth Chowdhury, Adv.  
Mr. M.K. Jiwrajika, Member Secretary  
Central Empowered Committee

For Petitioner (S) Mr. Prashant Bhushan, Adv.  
Mr. Pranav Sachdeva, Adv.

For Applicant (s)  
In IA 1, 35 & 76  
Goa Foundation Mr. Prashant Bhushan, Adv.  
Mr. Pranav Sachdeva, Adv.

In IA 3  
Goa Mining Labour  
Welfare Union Ms. Jubli Momalia, Adv.  
Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, Adv.

In IA 5 & 6  
M/s HL Nathurmali Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Kunal A. Cheema, Adv.

In IA 7 & 8  
Goa Mining Assn. Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. KJ John & Co., Advs.

In IA 10 & 72  
Sesa Goa Ltd. Mr. Ninad Laud, Adv.  
Mr. Jayant Mohan, Adv.

In IA 11, 12 & 60  
Cose Costa & Sons Mr. S.J. Amith, Adv.  
Mr. Nakibur Rahman Barbhuiya, Adv.  
Ms. Ritika Gambhir, Adv.  
Dr. (Ms.) Vipin Gupta, Adv.

In IA 13, 14 & 59  
Sociedade Timblo Mr. Yashraj Singh Deora, Adv.  
Irmaos Limitada Ms. Anupama Dhurve, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Puri, Adv.  
Mr. Parag Rao, Adv.  
Ms. Swati Kamat, Adv.  
Mr. Linette Rodrigues, Adv.  
For M/s. K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 15 & 16 Ms. Triveni Poteker, Adv.  
Garge Barge Owners' Mr. Chandra Shekhar Ashri, Adv.  
Assn.

In IA 17 & 18  
Aleixo Manual  
C.P. Costa Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.

In IA 19, 20 & 21 Mr. Shikhil Suri, Adv.  
Salvia Oliver Mr. Shiv Kumar Suri, Adv.  
Rodrigues Mr. Chandrika Prasad Mishra, Adv.

In IA 22 & 77 Mr. Shikhil Suri, Adv.  
Sudip N. Tamankar Mr. Shiv Kumar Suri, Adv.  
Mr. Chandrika Prasad Mishra, Adv.  
For Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran, Adv.

In Ias 23-33  
Ramcanta Visnum,  
Sociedade Sir Maha Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Laxmi, Shaikh Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Abdul Kuddus Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Com. Mineraria Pro. Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
Ltda. Bhanudas,  
Emco, Shashikala,  
Atchuta Visnum,  
Rajaram Bandekar  
Mines, Smt.Shakuntala  
bai & Orient Goa

In IA 38  
Dr. Prafulla R. Mr. Bhavani Shankar Gadnis, Adv.  
Hede Mines Mr. A. Venayagam Balan, Adv.

In IAs 39-40  
Motiram Data  
Goundalkar Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ghanshyam Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Sardesai Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 41, 71 & 72  
M/s. Bandekar Bros  
Pvt. Ltd. Mr. Parijat Sinha, Adv.  
Ms. Reshmi Rea sinha, Adv.

In IA 42

M/s Madachem Bat  
Mines Pvt. Ltd. Mr. Parijat Sinha, Adv.  
Ms. Reshmi Rea Sinha, Adv.

In IA 43 & 44  
Village Panchayat of  
Kirlapal-Dabal & Ors. Ms. Madhu Sikri, Adv.

In IA 45  
M/s Baddruddin  
Hussainbhai Mavani Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. KJ John & Co., Advs.

In IA 46  
Kamalini Ramakant  
Painguinkar & Ors. Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. KJ John & Co., Advs.

In IA 47  
Pandurang Timblo  
Inds. & Anr. Mr. Harish Pandey, Adv.

In IA 48 & 49 Mr. Rohit M. Alex, Adv.  
Rajesh P. Mr. P.S. Sudheer, Adv.  
Timblo Mr. Rishi Maheshwari, Adv.  
Mr. Anshul Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Kumar Kaushik, Adv.

In IA 50  
M/s Sarda Energy  
& Minerals Ltd. Mr. Mohan Pandey, Adv.

In IA 51  
M/s Noor Mohd.  
Abdul Karim & Anr. Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 52 Mr. Shikhil Suri, Adv.  
Ramesh Sajo Mr. Shiv Kumar Suri, Adv.  
Gauns & Ors. Mr. Chandrika Prasad Mishra, Adv.

In IA 53  
Girish M.  
Tendulkar & Ors. Ms. Sudha Gupta, Adv.

In IA 54 Mr. Ninad Laud, Adv.  
Gomantak Inv. Ms. Aparna Singhal, Adv.  
Pvt. Ltd. Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.  
Mr. Rishi Agrawala, Adv.  
Mr. E.C. Agrawala, Adv.

In IA 55 & 56 Mr. Ninad Laud, Adv.  
Damodar Mangalji Ms. Aparna Singhal, Adv.  
& Co. Ltd. Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.  
Mr. Rishi Agrawala, Adv.  
Mr. E.C. Agrawala, Adv.

In IA 57  
Geetabala Manohar  
Naik Parulekar Mr. Yash Raj Deora, Adv.  
For M/s J.S. Wad & Co., Advs.

In IA 58  
Ana Berta Do  
Rego E. Fernandes Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 61 & 62  
G.N. Agrawal Mr. M.P. Jha, Adv.

In IA 63, 64 & 65  
Chowgule & Co. Mr. Sumit Goel, Adv.  
Pvt. Ltd. Ms. Sarab Jot Walia, Adv.  
For M/s Parekh & Co., Advs.

In IA 66 & 67  
Hardesh Ores Mr. Rajesh Kumar, Adv.  
Pvt. Ltd. Mr. Mohit Abraham, Adv.  
In IA 68  
Goa Mining  
Foundation Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 69 & 70  
Timblo Enterprises Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 74  
Crisna Mucunda  
Camotim Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 75  
Jaisinh Maganlal Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s K.J. John & Co., Advs.

In IA 78  
Shantilal Kushaldas  
& Bros P. Ltd. Dr. (Ms.) Vipin Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. S.J. Amith, Adv.  
Ms. Ritika Gambhir, Adv.  
Mr. Nakibur Rahman Barbhuiya, Adv.

For Respondent (s)  
State of Goa Mr. A.N.S. Nadkarni, AG  
Mr. Siddharth Bhatnagar, Adv.  
Mr/ Nikhil D. Rai, AGA, Goa.  
Ms. Prachi Sawant, Adv.  
Mr. Pawan Kumar Bansal, Adv.  
Mr. T. Mahipal, Adv.

Union of India  
M/o Env. & Forests Mr. Mohan Parasaran, SG.  
Mr. Rakesh Kumar Khanna, ASG.

Mr. K. Radhakrishnan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. D.L. Chidananda, Adv.  
Ms. Asha G. Nair, Adv.  
Ms. Kiran Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Seema Rao, Adv.  
Mr. Ashwin Kumar D.S., Adv.  
Mr. Anirudh Tanwar, Adv.  
Ms. Gunwant Dara, Adv.  
Ms. Sukhbeer Kaur Bajwa, Adv.  
Mr. Shreekant N. Terdal, Adv.  
Mr. D.S. Mahra, Adv.

Union of India  
M/s Mines & Min.

Mr. Mohan Parasaran, SG.  
Mr. Ritin Rai, Adv.  
Mr. D.L. Chidananda, Adv.  
Mr. Shreekant N. Terdal, Adv.

RR 5

Mr. Shridhar Y. Chitale, Adv.  
Mr. Abhijat P. Medh, Adv.

RR 6-Goa Min. Lab.

Welfare Union Ms. Jubli Momalia, Adv.  
Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, Adv.

For RR 7-Chowgule  
& Co. Pvt. Ltd.

Mr. Sumit Goel, Adv.  
Ms. Sarab Jot Walia, Adv.  
For M/s Parekh & Co., Advs.

For RR 8-HL Nathurmali

Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Kunal A. Cheema, Adv.

For RR 9-Goa Min.  
Assn. Soc.

Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. KJ John & Co., Advs.

For RR 10- M/s

Sesa Goa Ltd. Mr. Ninad Laud, Adv.  
Mr. Jayant Mohan, Adv.

For RR 11-Cosme

Cose Costa & Sons Mr. S.J. Amith, Adv.  
Mr. Nakibur Rahman Barbhuiya, Adv.  
Ms. Ritika Gambhir, Adv.  
Dr. (Ms.) Vipin Gupta, Adv.

For RR 12- Socie.  
Tim.Irmaos Lim.

Ms. Anupama Dhurve, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Puri, Adv.

For Rr No. 13

Goa Barge Owners  
Assn. Ms. Triveni Potekar, Adv.  
Mr. Chandra Shekhar Ashri, Adv.

For RR 14

For M/s Mitter & Mitter Co., Advs.

For RR 15-27

Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. KJ John & Co., Advs.

For RR 28 -M/s.  
Bandeekar Bros

Pvt. Ltd. Mr. Parijat Sinha, Adv.  
Ms. Reshmi Rea sinha, Adv.

For RR 30 - Mr. Mr. Bhavani Shankar Gadnis, Adv.  
Dr. Prafulla Mr. A. Venayagam Balan, Adv.  
Hede Mines

Mr. S.M. Walawaikar, Adv.  
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, Adv.

For RR 31 & 32 Mr. Pratap Venugopal, Adv.  
Ms. Surekha Raman, Adv.  
Ms. Meenakshi Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Gaurav Nair, Adv.  
For M/s. KJ John & Co., Advs.

Mr. S.M. Walawaikar, Adv.  
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, Adv.

UPON hearing counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R

|Office Report for directions is ordered in terms of the signed order. |

|[KALYANI GUPTA] | | [SHARDA KAPOOR] |  
|COURT MASTER | | COURT MASTER |

[SIGNED ORDER IS PLACED ON THE FILE.]

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA  
CIVIL ORIGINAL JURISDICTION

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO. 435 OF 2012

GOA FOUNDATION

PETITIONER

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

RESPONDENTS

O R D E R

Perused the communications received from Professor C.R. Babu, Centre for Environmental Management of Degraded Ecosystems, University of Delhi; Mr. S. Parameswarappa, Indian Forest Service (Retired) and Dr. S.C. Dhiman, Former Chairman, Central Ground Water Board.

2. Someone will have to act as a Convenor of the Expert Committee appointed to conduct the Macro Environmental Impact Assessment Study. We direct that the nominee of the Chief Secretary of Government of Goa will act as the Convenor of the Expert

Committee.

3. The nominee of the Chief Secretary, Government of Goa will also act as the Nodal Agency to provide all logistic support to the Expert Committee.

4. We are not quite sure whether the Secretary, Ministry of Environment and Forests, Government of India has nominated a member in the Expert Committee. If he has not done so, he will forth with nominate a Member and intimate the name to the Principal Secretary, Department of Mines, Revenue and Forests, Government of Goa.

5. Considering the limited time now available for the Expert Committee to submit its interim report, we would like the Expert Committee to meet day to day, as far as possible and submit the report by 15th February, 2014.

6. Office Report for directions is ordered accordingly.

.....J.  
[A.K. PATNAIK]

.....J.  
[SURINDER SINGH NIJJAR]

.....J.  
[FAKKIR MOHAMED IBRAHIM KALIFULLA]

New Delhi  
January 06, 2014.