

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS
CIVIL APPEAL NO. 1867 OF 2006

MALIK MAZHAR SULTAN AND ANR.

Appellant (s)

VERSUS

U.P. PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln. for clarification)

[Regarding States of Uttar Pradesh, Andhra Pradesh,
Jharkhand, Karnataka, West Bengal and Jammu & Kashmir)

Orissa,

Date: 03/11/2011 This Appeal was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE D.K. JAIN

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE

For Appellant(s)

Mr. Vijay Hansaria, Sr. Adv. (AC)(N/P)

Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, Adv.

Mr. Debasis Misra ,Adv

Mr. T.N. Rao ,Adv

For Respondent(s)

Mr. Lakshmi Raman Singh, Adv.

State of
Chhattisgarh

Mr. Atul Jha, Adv.

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, Adv.

Intervener

Mr. Arvind Kr. Tiwary, Adv.

Mr. Ranjan Dwivedi, Adv.

State of W.B.

Mr. Chanchal Kr. Ganguli, Adv.

Mr. Abhijit Sengupta, Adv.

Mr. B.P. Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Tara Chandra Sharma, Adv.

State of A.P.

Mr. G.N. Reddy, Adv.

Mr. C. Kannan, Adv.

Mr. Ravi Shankar, Adv.

State of Arunachal
Pradesh

Mr. Anil Shrivastav, Adv.

Mr. Ritu Raj Biswas, Adv.

...2/-

:2:

Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, Adv.

Mr. Amit Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Shankar Divate, Adv.

State of Jharkhand

Ms. Chhaya Kumari, Adv.

Mr. S.K. Divakar, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kr. Jha, Adv.

State of Goa

Ms. A.Subhashini ,Adv
Mr. Ashok K. Srivastava ,Adv
Mr. Arun K. Sinha, Adv.

HC of P & H

Ms. Asha Jain Madan ,Adv
Mr. Ashok Mathur ,Adv
Mr. Anis Suhrawardy ,Adv
Ms. Bina Gupta ,Adv

HC of J & K

Mr. Bharat Sangal ,Adv
Ms. Vermika Tomar, Adv.
Ms. Srijana Lama, Adv.
Ms. Binu Tamta ,Adv
Mr. Dharam Bir Raj Vohra ,Adv

Calcutta HC

Mr. Jaideep Gupta, Sr. Adv.
Mr. G.S. Chatterjee ,Adv
Mr. Sachin Das, Adv.

NCT of Delhi

Mr. P.P. Malhotra, ASG
Mr. S. Wasim Qadri, Adv.
Mr. Keshav Thakur, Adv.
Mrs. Anil Katiyar, Adv.

State of Bihar/
Tripura

Mr. Gopal Singh ,Adv

...3/-

:3:

State of Nagaland

Mr. Edward Belho, Adv.
Mr. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kr. Singh, Adv.
Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, Adv.

Ms. Hemantika Wahi ,Adv
Ms. Jesal, Adv.
Ms. Suveni Banerjee, Adv.

HC of Orissa

Mr. Sibho Sankar Mishra,Adv
Mr. K.K. Mohan ,Adv

Chandigarh

Ms. Kamini Jaiswal ,Adv. (N/P)
Mr. Naresh K. Sharma ,Adv
Mr. Naresh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Pradeep Misra ,Adv

State of Mizoram

Mr. Pragyan P. Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Mandakini Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Rupesh Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Choudhary, Adv.
Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran ,Adv
Mr. Surendra Kr. Maurya, Adv.
Mr. K.N. Madhusoodhanan, Adv.
Mr. R. Sathish ,Adv

Mr. S.C. Patel ,Adv

Rajasthan HC

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain ,Adv
Mr. Parmatma Singh, Adv.
Mr. Mayank Jain, Adv.

Kerala HC

Mr. T.G. Narayanan Nair ,Adv
Mr. K.N. Madhusoodanan, Adv.

State of Kerala

Mr. G. Prakash ,Adv
Mr. A. Senthil, Adv.

AP H.C.

Ms. A. Subhashini, Adv.
Mr. T.V. Ratnam ,Adv

Mr. Ugra Shankar Prasad ,Adv

State of Sikkim

Mr. A. Mariarputham, Adv.Gen.
Mrs. Aruna Mathur, Adv.
Mr. Amarjeet Singh Girsra, Adv.
for M/S Arputham, Aruna & Co.

...4/-

:4:

UOI

Mr. D.S. Mahra, Adv.
Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv.
Mr. R.K. Rathore, Adv.
Mr. A. Devkumar, Adv.

State of Meghalaya

Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee ,Adv
Ms. S. Janani ,Adv

State of Puducherry

Mr. V.G. Pragasam ,Adv
Mr. S.J. Aristotle, Adv.
Mr. Prabu Ramasubramaniam, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh ,Adv

Mrs.D. Bharathi Reddy ,Adv

Mr. Krishnanand Pandey ,Adv

State of M.P.

Mr. B.S. Banthia ,Adv

State of Manipur

Mr. Khwairakpam Nobin Singh, Adv
Mr. Sapam Biswajit Meitei, Adv.

Mr. Radha Shyam Jena ,Adv

Mr. Sanjay R. Hegde ,Adv

Mr. P.I. Jose ,Adv

Mr. Y. Raja Gopala Rao ,Adv

Mr. Shail Kumar Dwivedi ,Adv

Mr. T. Harish Kumar, Adv.

HC of Madras

Mr. R. Nedumaran ,Adv

State of Haryana

Mr. Manjit Singh, AAG
Mr. Tarjit Singh, Adv.
Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta ,Adv

Mr. V.N. Raghupathy ,Adv

State of
Uttarakhand

Mr. Rahul Verma, Adv.
Ms. Rachana Srivastava ,Adv

State of Assam

Mr. Navnit Kumar, Adv.
for M/s Corporate Law Group

Mr. Ashwani Kumar ,Adv.

...5/-

:5:

Mr. Rajesh Srivastava ,Adv

HC of M.P.

Mr. S.K. Dubey, Sr. Adv.
Mr. C.D. Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sunny Choudhary, Adv.

Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia ,Adv

Mr. Kamlendra Mishra ,Adv

State of U.P.

Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.
Mr. Shrish Kumar Misra ,Adv

for M/S. Parekh & Co.(N/P)

Mr. T. Mahipal ,Adv

Ms. Sumita Hazarika ,Adv

HC OF Bombay

Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee ,Adv
Mr. Charudatta Mahindrakar, Adv.

Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury ,Adv

HC of Sikkim

Mr. Vishnu Sharma ,Adv

Mr.T.V.George ,Adv

Mr.Prakash Kumar Singh ,Adv

Mr.Sunil Kumar Verma ,Adv
Mr. Anuvrat Sharma ,Adv

Mr. Balaji Srinivasan ,Adv

State of Rajasthan

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Addl. AG
Mr. Abhinav Ramkrishna, Adv.
Mr. Milind Kumar ,Adv

State of Punjab

Mr. Anil Grover, AAG
Ms. Noopur Singhal, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Pal ,Adv

State of Mah.

Mrs. Asha G. Nair, Adv.

Mr. E.C. Vidyasagar, Adv.

...6/-

:6:

State of J & K

Mr. Sunil Fernandes, Adv.

Ms. Suhaas Joshi, Adv.

Ms. Astha Sharma, Adv.

DHC

Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Adv.

Ms. Neelam Jain, Adv.

Mr. Kirthi Kiran, Adv.

Ms. T. Kanaka Durga, Adv.

Mr. Navin Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Ambhoj Kr. Sinha, Adv.

UPON hearing counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

I.A. No. 114 of 2011 in C.A. No. 1867 of 2006

In view of the directions contained in

Para 28 of the judgment of this Court in All

India Judges' Association & Ors. versus Union of

India & Ors. [(2002) 4 SCC 247], no further
clarification is called for. The application is

disposed of accordingly.

Re: States of Uttar Pradesh, Andhra Pradesh,
Orissa, Jharkhand, Karnataka, West Bengal and
Jammu & Kashmir

List on 9th November, 2011 at 3.00 p.m.

(VINOD LAKHINA)
Court Master

(VEENA KHERA)
Court Master