

ITEM NO.901

COURT NO.1

SECTION III-A

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Civil Appeal No.151/2007

STATE OF U.P. & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

M/S. LALTA PRASAD VAISH

Respondent(s)

(With IA No.38597/2021 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION, IA No.2/2010 -
IMPLEADMENT and IA No.237338/2023 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION)

WITH S.L.P.(C)...CC No. 7999/2017 (XI)

(With IA No.1/2017 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)

S.L.P.(C) No.27241/2019 (XI)

(With IA No.89586/2020 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.
162358/2019 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

S.L.P.(C) No.18582/2023 (XI)

(With IA No.74808/2023 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

S.L.P.(C) No.19275/2004 (XI)

(With IA No.1/2006 and IA No.27845/2006)

S.L.P.(C) No.16505/2004 (XI)

(With IA No.59616/2005, IA No.28372/2006, IA No.45611/2007 and IA
No.2/2005 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

S.L.P.(C) No.26110/2004 (XI)

(With IA No.23275/2010 and IA No.1/2004 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN
FILING)

S.L.P.(C) No.26111/2004 (XI)

(With IA No.1/2004 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)

C.A. No.580/2008 (III-A)

C.A. No.152/2007 (III-A)

C.A. No.153/2007 (III-A)

C.A. No.610/2008 (III-A)

S.L.P.(C) No.20204/2012 (XI)

C.A. No.6768/2014 (XI-A)

S.L.P.(C) No.20519/2014 (XI)

S.L.P.(C) No.25447/2014 (XI)

(With IA No.2/2015 - modification/clarification)

S.L.P.(C) No.3160/2015 (XI-A)

S.L.P.(C) No.4057/2015 (XI)

(With IA No.2/2015 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

C.A. No.2084/2020 (III-A)

(With IA No.92559/2020 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

C.A. No.4987/2021 (III-A)

(With IA No.111730/2020 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING C/C OF THE IMPUGNED JUDGMENT and IA No.108947/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

Diary No.41507/2019 (XI)

(With I.R. and IA No.39619/2020-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING and IA No.39622/2020-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.39621/2020-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILEING/ CURING THE DEFECTS and IA No.92567/2020 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

S.L.P.(C) No.18686/2022 (XI)

(With IA No.136077/2022 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

Diary No.7447/2023 (XI)

(With IA No.68372/2023-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING and IA No.68373/2023-EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No.68371/2023-CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILEING / CURING THE DEFECTS)

C.A. No.154/2007 (III-A)

C.A. No.671/2008 (III-A)

C.A. No.672/2008 (III-A)

C.A. No.688/2008 (III-A)

C.A. No.750/2008 (III-A)

C.A. No.5093/2011 (X)

(With IA No.55155/2011 - Stay)

Date : 18-04-2024 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE HRISHIKESH ROY
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ABHAY S. OKA
HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE B.V. NAGARATHNA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J.B. PARDIWALA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE MANOJ MISRA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE UJJAL BHUYAN
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SATISH CHANDRA SHARMA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE AUGUSTINE GEORGE MASIH

For Appellant(s)

Mr. Dinesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Arvind P Datar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Samar Vijay Singh, AOR
Mr. Bhakti Vardhan Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Unnikrishnan, Adv.
Mr. Prateek Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Singh Jangra, Adv.
Mr. Manish Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Patiraj Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Krishnam Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Pawan Kishore Singh, Adv.
Mr. Nishant Singh, Adv.
Mr. Keshav Mittal, Adv.
Mr. Amit Ojha, Adv.
Mr. Azeem A Dost, Adv.
Ms. Sabarni Som, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Akshat Kumar, AOR

Mr. Pankaj Bhagat, AOR

Mr. V. Giri, Sr. Adv.
Mr. C.K. Sasi, AOR
Mr. Meena K Poullose, Adv.
Ms. Meena K Poullose, Adv.
Mr. Harsher Sunder, Adv.
Mr. Nihar Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Rao Vishwaja, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Narang, Adv.

For Respondent(s)

Mr. R. Venkatramani, AG
Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR
Ms. Sonali Jain, Adv.
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Raman Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Kartikay Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Kumar Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Chitvan Singhal, Adv.
Mrs. Ameyvikrama Thanvi, Adv.

Mr. R. Venkataramani, AG
Mr. Tushar Mehta, SG
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR
Mr. Pratyush Shrivastava, Adv.
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Navanjay Mahapatra, Adv.
Mr. Chitvan Singhal, Adv.
Mr. Kartikay Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Kumar Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Raman Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Ameyavikrama Thanvi, Adv.
Mr. Vatsal Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Bhuvan Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Varun Chugh, Adv.
Mr. Mrinal Elkar Mazumdar, Adv.
Ms. Indira Bhakar, Adv.
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Verma, Adv.
Mr. Shashwat Parihar, Adv.
Mr. Harish Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Singh Chauhan, Adv.
Mr. Apoorv Kurup, Adv.
Mr. Piyush Beriwal, Adv.
Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.
Mr. Omar Ahmad, Adv.
Ms. Tahira Karanjawala, Adv.
Mr. Ishan Gaur, Adv.
Ms. Simran Jeet, Adv.
Mr. Vikram Shah, Adv.
Mr. Pratibhanu Kharola, Adv.
Mr. Tuhin Dey, Adv.
Mr. Shreyas Maheswari, Adv.
Ms. Astha Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Shankar Dixit, Adv.

Mr. Abhimanyu Bhandari, Adv.
Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR
Mr. Raghavendra M. Bajaj, Adv.
Mrs. Garima Bajaj, Adv.
Ms. Akriti Chaubey, Adv.
Mr. S. Mahesh Sahasranaman, Adv.
Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, Adv.
Mr. Saif Zia, Adv.

Mr. Harshit Khanduja, Adv.
Mr. Sahib Kochar, Adv.
Ms. Ritika Kohli, Adv.
Mr. Md Faisal Masood, Adv.

Mr. Samar Vijay Singh, AOR
Mr. Bhakti Vardhan Singh, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Singh Jangra, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Pawan Kishore Singh, Adv.
Mr. Amit Ojha, Adv.
Mr. Keshav Mittal, Adv.
Ms. Sabarni Som, Adv.

Mr. Dhruv Agarwal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mr. Dhruv Agrawal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Praveen Kumar, AOR
Ms. Sunaina Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Pradeep Kumar Dubey, AOR
Mr. Abhigya Kushwah, Adv.
Mrs. Sunita Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Vineeth S., Adv.
Mr. Ravindra Kumar Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Rajkumar Murarka, Adv.
Mr. Rohan Rohatgi, Adv.
Mr. Akhilesh Kumar Shrivastava, Adv.
Mrs. Shubhangini Rohatgi, Adv.

Mr. Anirudh Bakhru, Adv.
Mr. Shadan Shadan Farasat, AAG
Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, AOR
Mr. Harshit Anand, Adv.
Mr. Harshit Khaduja, Adv.
Mr. Ankit Khera, Adv.
Ms. Hrishika Jain, Adv.

Mr. M.P. Vinod, AOR

Mr. Rajiv Dutta, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sanjeev Kumar Singh, Adv.

Mr. Kumar Dushyant Singh, AOR
Mr. Shighra Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Bhisim Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Devansh Shekhar, Adv.
Ms. Pooja Singh, Adv.
Ms. Subasri Jaganathan, Adv.
Ms. Neha Singh, Adv.

Mrs. Vanita Bhargava, Adv.
Mr. Sanjeev Kumar Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Aakash Bajaj, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Bhargava, Adv.
Ms. Prerona Banerjee, Adv.
Ms. Nandita Chauhan, Adv.
Ms. Tijil Thakur, Adv.
Ms. Aarushi Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Narinder Kumar Verma, Adv.
M/s. Khaitan & Co.

Mr. Ajit Sharma, AOR

Mr. Krishnamohan K., AOR
Ms. Dania Nayyar, Adv.
Mr. Yamini Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Praveen Chaturvedi, AOR

Mr. J.S. Attri, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Vikas Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. D.S. Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Pradeep Kumar Mathur, Adv.
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR

Mr. S. Nandakumar, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Deepika Nandakumar, Adv.
Mr. Niraj Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Naresh Kumar, AOR

Mrs. Nanita Sharma, AOR
Mr. Vivek Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Shailendra Singh, Adv.
Mr. Mahesh Tiwari, Adv.

Mr. Dhruv Agrawal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Nishit Agrawal, AOR
Ms. Kanishka Mittal, Adv.
Ms. Vanya Agrawal, Adv.
Ms. Upasna Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Shrey Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Vikash Kumar Jha, Adv.

Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR
Mr. Upendra Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Neetu Rawat, Adv.

Mr. Ankit Shah, Adv.
Mr. Manan Verma, AOR

Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR
Mr. B.S. Rajesh Agrajit, Adv.
Mr. Vishal Meghwal, Adv.
Ms. Priya Nagar, Adv.

Mr. Aravindh S., AOR
Mr. Akshay Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Devina Sehgal, AOR

Mr. D.L. Chidananda, AOR

Ms. Pallavi Langar, AOR

Mr. Manish Kumar, AOR
Mr. Shivam Singh, Adv.
Ms. Bahuli Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Sahil Bhatiya, Adv.
Mr. Ishwar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Shaswati Parhi, Adv.
Mr. Suyash Vyas, Adv.
Mr. Divyansh Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Pashupathi Nath Razdan, AOR
Mr. Mirza Kayesh Begg, Adv.
Ms. Maitreyee Jagat Joshi,, Adv.
Mr. Astik Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Akanksha Tomar,, Adv.
Mr. Argha Roy, Adv., Adv.
Ms. Ojaswini Gupta,, Adv.
Ms. Ruby, Adv.
Ms. Mamta Bharwaj, Adv.

Mr. Dhananjaya Mishra, AOR

Mr. Balbir Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.
Mr. Naman Tandon, Adv.
Ms. Monica Benjamin, Adv.
Mr. Karan Sachdev, Adv.
Mr. Shyam Gopal, Adv.
Mr. Ranjeev Khatana, Adv.
Mr. Rajnjeev Khatana, Adv.
Mr. Sourav Singh, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Preet S. Phanse, Adv.

Mr. Nalin Kohli, Sr. AAG
Mr. Ankit Roy, AOR
Mr. Anshul Malik, Adv.
Mr. Sarthak Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Shruti Agrawal, Adv.
Ms. Nimisha Menon, Adv.
Mr. Ayushman Arora, Adv.

Mr. Sravan Kumar Karanam, AOR
Ms. Shireesh Tyagi, Adv.
Ms. Tayade Pranali Gowardhan, Adv.
Ms. Jayashree PK, Adv.
Mr. Aniket Singh, Adv.
Mrs. B. Renuka Devi, Adv.
Ms. Mamatha Ralla, Adv.
Mr. P. Santhosh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Abhimanyu Tewari, AOR
Ms. Eliza Bar, Adv.

Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Jaideep Gupta, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Srisatya Mohanty, Adv.

Ms. Anju Thomas, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Kaushik, Adv.

Ms. Mantika Haryani, Adv.

Mr. Shreyas Awasthi, Adv.

Mr. Himanshu Chakravarty, Adv.

Mr. Ridhi Bose, Adv.

Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv.

Mr. Bhanu Mishra, Adv.

Ms. Muskan Surana, Adv.

Ms. Lihzu Shiney Konyak, Adv.

Ms. Anvita Dwivedi, Adv.

Mr. Vivek Sharma, AOR

Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. A.A.G.

Mr. Divyanshu Srivastava, Adv.

Ms. Himanshi Shakya, Adv.

Mr. Nikunj Gupta, Adv.

Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR

Mr. Mahfooz Ahsan Nazki, AOR

Mr. Sahil Bhalai, Adv.

Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv.

Mr. KV Girish Chowdary, Adv.

Mr. T Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv.

Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv.

Mr. Meeran Maqbool, Adv.

Ms. Archita Nigam, Adv.

Mr. Tushar Giri, Adv.

Mr. Siddharth Khanna, Adv.

Mr. Rajiv Kumar Choudhry , AOR

Mr. Kuldeep Parihar, DAG

Mr. Akshat Kumar, AOR

Mr. Ajay K. Jain, Adv.

Ms. Swati Ghildiyal, AOR
Ms. Devyani Bhatt, Adv.
Ms. Srujana Suman Mund, Adv.

Mr. Arvind Datar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sabarish Subramanian, AOR
Mr. C. Kranthi Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Vishnu Unnikrishnan, Adv.
Mr. Naman Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. B. Sarathraj, Adv.
Mr. Danish Saifi, Adv.

Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, AOR
Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Devvrat Singh, Adv.
Mr. Varun Singh, Adv.
Mr. Nishant Verma, Adv.

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR
Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Anupama Ngangom, Adv.
Ms. Rajkumari Divyasana, Adv.

Mr. Tushar Jarwal, Adv.
Ms. Anuradha Dutt, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Sateeraja, Adv.
Mr. Pranav Bansal, Adv.
Mr. Sanyam Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. B.R. Menon, Adv.
Ms. B. Vijayalakshmi Menon, AOR

Mr. Praveen Chaturvedi, AOR

Mr. Saurabh Mishra, AAG
Ms. Mrinal Gopal Elker, AOR
Mr. Saurabh Singh, Adv.

Mr. K.N. Balgopal, Adv.Gen. (Nagaland)
Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR
Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv.
Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv.

**Mr. Amit Kumar, Adv. General, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR**

**UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R**

- 1 Arguments concluded.
- 2 Judgment reserved.

**(CHETAN KUMAR)
A.R. -cum-P.S.**

**(A.V.G.V. RAMU)
Court Master**