

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s) (Civil) No(s). 473/2005

SAMPURNA BEHRUA

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA &amp; ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With application for exemption from filing O.T. and interim directions and modification and permission to file additional documents and Office Report)

Date : 05/04/2017 This petition was called on for hearing today.

CORAM : HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE MADAN B. LOKUR  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE DEEPAK GUPTAFor Petitioner(s) Mr. Colin Gonsalves, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Anant Asthana, Adv.  
Ms. Sneha Mukherjee, Adv.  
Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, Adv.For Respondent(s) Mr. P.S. Patwalia, ASG  
UOI Mrs. V. Mohana, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ajit Kr. Sinha, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. S. Wasim Quadri, Adv.  
Ms. Kreeti Joshi, Adv.  
Mr. R.K. Rathore, Adv.  
Ms. Alka Agrawal, Adv.  
Mr. S.K. Pathak, Adv.  
Mr. S.N. Terdal, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay Amritraj, Adv.  
Mr. Dhruv Sheoran, Adv.  
Mr. G.S. Makkar, Adv.  
Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Vikas Bansal  
Ms. Gunwant Dara, Adv.  
Ms. Munmun Goswami, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Bahadur, Adv.NALSA Ms. Indu Malhotra, Adv.  
Mr. Gagan Gupta, Adv.AP Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, Adv.  
Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.

Arunachal Pradesh	Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR
Assam	Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR
Bihar	Mr. Gopal Singh, Adv. Mr. Manish Kumar, Adv.
Chhattisgarh	Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR Mr. A. Selvin Raja, Adv.
Goa	Mr. Arjun Bobde, Adv. Ms. Richa Relhan, Adv. Mr. Rajat Joseph, Adv.
Gujarat	Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR Ms. Jesal Wahi, Adv. Ms. Mamta Singh, Adv.
Haryana	Dr. Monika Gusain, Adv.
H.P.	Mr. Suryanarayana Singh, AAG Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR
J&K	Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, Adv. Ms. Fauzia Shakil, Adv. Mr. Ujjwal Singh, Adv. Mr. Mojahid Karim Khan, Adv.
Jharkhand	Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv. Mr. Jayesh Gaurav, Adv. Mr. Ratan Kr. Choudhuri, Adv.
Kerala	Mr. C.K. Sasi, AOR
Karnataka	Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, Adv. Mr. Lagnesh Mishra, Adv. Mr. Parikshit P. Angadi, Adv. Mr. Prakash Jadhav, Adv.
Maharashtra	Mr. Barun Kumar Sinha, Adv. Mr. Nishant R. Katneshwarkar, Adv.
Manipur	Ms. Sapam Biswajit Meitei, Adv. Mr. Naresh Kumar Gaur, Adv. Mr. M.N. Singh, Adv. Mr. Ashok Kr. Singh, AOR.
Meghalaya	Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, AOR

M.P.	Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR.
Mizoram	Mr. Pragyan Sharma, Adv. Mr. Shikhar Garg, Adv. Mr. P. V. Yogeswaran, AOR
Nagaland	Mrs. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv. Mr. Edward Belho, AAG Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv. Mr. K. Luikang Michael, Adv. Ms. Elix Gangmei, Adv. Mr. Z.H. Issac Haiding, Adv.
Orissa	Mr. Sibho Sankar Mishra, AOR. Mr. Umakant Mishra, Adv. Mr. Niranjana Sahu, Adv. Mr. Raj Kumar Parashar, Adv.
Punjab	Mr. Ajay Bansal, AAG Mr. Gaurav Yadava, Adv. Mr. Kuldip Singh, Adv.
Rajasthan	Mr. Ajay Kapur, AAG Mr. Anirudh Singh, Adv. Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR
Sikkim	Ms. Aruna Mathur, Adv. Mr. Avneesh Arputham, Adv. Mr. Amit Arora, Adv. Ms. Anuradha Arputham, Adv. for M/s Arputham Aruna & Co.
Tamil Nadu	Mr. B. Balaji, AOR Mr. S. Kumar, Adv.
Telangana	Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv. Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.
Tripura	Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv. Ms. Varsha Poddar, Adv.
Uttarakhand	Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR Mr. A.K. Sharma, Adv.
U.P.	Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR Mr. Utkarsh Sharma, Adv.
WB	Ms. Nandini Sen, Adv. Mr. Chanchal Kr. Ganguli, AOR

A&N

Mr. Bhupesh Narula, Adv.  
Mr. K.V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.  
Ms. G. Indira, AOR

Puducherry

Mr. V. G. Pragasam, AOR  
Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.

Mr. Anuvrat Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Arun K. Sinha, Adv.

Mr. Avijit Bhattacharjee, Adv.

Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, Adv.

Mr. B. S. Banthia, Adv.

Mr. T.N. Rama Rao, Adv.

Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. T. Veera Reddy, Adv.

Mr. G. N. Reddy, Adv.

Mr. Khwairakpam Nobin Singh, Adv.

Mr. Naresh K. Sharma, Adv.

Mr. P. V. Dinesh, Adv.

Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, Adv.

Mr. Ratan Kumar Choudhuri, Adv.

Mr. T. Harish Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, Adv.

Ms. Kamini Jaiswal, Adv.

Ms. Sushma Suri, Adv.

M/s. Venkat Palwai Law Associates

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

Learned Additional Solicitor General has brought to our notice the following status report as on 05.04.2017 in respect of the

State Commission for Child Rights:

1. Andhra Pradesh

Six members joined in the month of February, 2014 but Chairperson had not joined. The term of 3 years of the existing members in SCPCR had expired in the month of February, 2017. Hence, the action is under process for appointment of Chairperson and Members of AP SCPCR.

2. Assam

The process for appointment of Chairperson and 4 members of the Commission is under process and will be completed shortly. At present Smt. Runumi Gogoi, Member of the Commission is temporarily holding the charge of the Chairperson.

3. Bihar

The State Government notified the selection of the following Chairperson and members on the SCPCR vide notification no. 362 and 363 respectively dated 21.02.2014:-

- (i) Mrs. Nisha Jha, Chairperson
- (ii) Mrs. Aparna Singh, Member
- (iii) Mrs. Lalita Jaiswal, Member
- (iv) Dr. Nishichandra Kinjalk, Member
- (v) Mr. Arun Kumar Verma, Member
- (vi) Mr. Satyendra Kumar Gautam, Member

In the year 2016, the Chairperson and members appointed vide notification nos. 362 and 363 resigned voluntarily on 17.05.2016 and the same has been accepted by the State Government. Currently, the administrative functions of the Commission are being looked after by the Member Secretary of the SCPCR. Selection of

Chairperson and members is under process presently.

4. Chandigarh

Ms. Harjinder Kaur	Chairperson	16-03-2017	For a period of 3 years
--------------------	-------------	------------	-------------------------

Note: The two members of the Chandigarh Commission for Protection of Child Rights have been appointed vide notification No. SW3/SCPCR/2014/11607 dated 10.12.2014 for a period of 3 years. The term of the members is likely to expire on 09.12.2017.

5. Delhi

The Department of WCD, GNCTD has already published an advertisement in the leading newspapers on 22.12.2016 to fill up the vacancies of the Chairperson and Members of the Delhi Commission for Protection of Child Rights (DCPCR). The meeting of the Selection Committee was held on 01.03.2017 under the Chairmanship of Minister (WCD)/Dy. C.M. for the post of Chairperson DCPCR. The file has been sent to the Lt. Governor, Govt. of NCT of Delhi for approval of the appointment of selected candidate for the post of Chairperson, DCPCR. The process for appointment of Member, DCPCR is under process.

6. Goa

Response awaited

7. Gujarat

The State Government has constituted Gujarat State Commission for Protection of Child Rights vide notification dated 28.09.2012. The State Government has appointed Smt. Jagrutiben Harenbhai Pandya as a Chairperson for the Gujarat State Commission for Protection of Child Rights vide notification dated 13.01.2016 for three years

tenure. Appointment of members for the commission is under consideration.

#### 7. Kerala

Kerala State Commission for Protection of Child Rights came into existence on 03/06/2013 consisting of a Chairperson and six other members for a period of 3 years. Smt. Shobha Koshy is the present Chairperson of the commission who was appointed on 06/03/15 for a period of 3 years and the term of the other members expired on 07/01/2017. Subsequent steps are being taken to fill up the vacancies and the process is still continuing.

#### 8. Madhya Pradesh

Mr. Raghvendra Sharma	Chairperson	completed by March, 2019
Mrs. Nirmla Barela	Members	completed by February, 2020

Note: The rest of the vacancies will be filled as early as possible.

#### 9. Maharashtra

The process of appointment of Chairperson and six members of State Commission for Protection of Child Rights are at final stage. At present, the additional charge of Chairman, Maharashtra State Commission for Protection of Child Rights is given to the Secretary, Women and Child Development Department.

#### 10. Odisha

Smt. Kasturi Mohapatra	Chairperson	26-03-2015	25-03-2018
Mrs. Rajalaxmi Das	Member	05-01-2015	04-01-2018
Ms. Sandhyabati Pradhan	Member	05-01-2015	04-01-2018

Out of 6 members, 2 Members are present and steps have already

been taken for filling up of the vacant positions of Members of Odisha Commission for Protection of Child Rights.

11. Tamil Nadu

Vacant	Chairperson		
Thiru Sundaraparipooran P.	Member	05-03-2014	04-03-2017
Thiru S. Mouleeswaran	Member	12-03-2014	11-03-2017
Thiru M. Ramachandran	Member	07-03-2014	06-03-2017
Thiru C. Selvakumar	Member	05-03-2014	04-03-2017
Tmt. T Jayanthi Rani	Member	06-03-2014	05-03-2017
Dr. A.D. Revathy	Member	05-03-2014	04-03-2017

Note: Tmt. Saraswathi Rangasami, Chennai was appointed as Chairperson to SCPCR vide G.O. (Ms) No. 02, SW & NMP Dept. Dated 02.01.2013. Her tenure expired on 17.01.2016 and the post is vacant at present.

The Secretary, SCPCR has called for application for filling up of the post of Chairperson through Press Release and had sent the applications received by the Commission to Government for necessary action.

After a thorough scrutiny and after a careful consideration of the qualifications and experience of the eligible candidates, based on the recommendation of the Selection Committee, the Government shall appoint a person of eminence who has done outstanding work for promoting the welfare of the children as Chairperson of Tamil Nadu Commission for Protection of Child Rights.

12. Telangana

Government of Telangana have issued orders for constitution of State Commission for protection of Child Rights vide G.O. Ms.NO.

11, Department for Women, Children, Disabled & Senior Citizens, dated:25-11-2014 with a Chairperson and 6 members, out of which 2 shall be women and rules were also framed vide G.O. Ms. No. 3, Department for Women, Children, Disabled & Senior Citizens dated: 20-01-2015. Notification was also issued inviting applications from the eligible candidates for appointment of Chairperson and members of the Commission. The appointment of the Chairperson and members of the Commission is under process.

13. Tripura

Smt. Ganguly	Rupa	Chairperson	24.02.2014	24.02.2017
Shri Datta	Paramartha	Members	24.02.2014	24.02.2017
Dr. Debbarma	Sanjib	Members	24.02.2014	24.02.2017
Smt. Indira Dhar		Members	24.02.2014	24.02.2017
Smt. Gupta	Padma Datta	Members	24.02.2014	24.02.2017
Shri Ranjan Das	Pramod	Members	24.02.2014	24.02.2017
Smt. Debbarma	Rita	Members	24.02.2014	24.02.2017

Note: The process for re-constitution of Tripura State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (TCPCR) has been initiated and would be notified shortly.

14. Uttarakhand

Shri Khanduri	Yogender	Chairperson	20.05.2015	
Smt. Beena Joshi		Member	07-02-2014	06-02-2017
Shri Uniyal	Aashish	Member	21-02-2014	20-02-2017
Smt. Haldar	Anima	Member	05-03-2014	04-03-2017

Smt. Jaya Mishra	Member	06-02-2014	05-02-2017
Dr. Zeeshan Ali	Member	12-02-2014	11-02-2017
Shri Shailendra Shekhar Kargeti	Member	16-09-2015	

It is obvious from the above that there are 14 States that are in clear violation of Section 18 of the Commissions for Protection of Child Rights Act, 2005.

Under the circumstances, these State Governments should fill up all the vacancies of the Chairperson/Members under the Commissions for Protection of Child Rights Act, 2005 within four weeks from today subject to payment of costs of Rs.50,000/- to be deposited by each State Government within three weeks with the Supreme Court Legal Services Committee for utilization of juvenile justice issues.

It is made clear that in case the appointments are not made, we may require the presence of the Secretary of the Women and Child Development Department in the concerned State Government to explain the difficulty in doing so and for violating the law.

We may record the fact that the statute referred to is a parliamentary law and the provisions thereof must be adhered to by the State Governments.

List the matter on 11<sup>th</sup> July, 2017.

(Meenakshi Kohli)  
Court Master (SH)

(Sharda Kapoor)  
Court Master (NS)