

ITEM NO.1(PH)

COURT NO.1

SECTION PIL

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO(s). 265 OF 2006

ASHOKA KUMAR THAKUR

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS

Respondent(s)

(With appln(s) for directions and amendment of pleading in writ petition and intervention and vacating stay and office report)

(For final disposal)

WITH

W.P.(C) NO.269/2006

(With appln. for ex-parte stay and intervention and impleadment and permission for urging addl

facts and office report)

(For final disposal)

W.P.(C) NO.598/2006

(With office report)

(For final disposal)

I.A.No.5 (appln.(s) for permission to file affidavit)

W.P.(C) NO.29/2007, W.P.(C) No.35/2007

(With appln. for stay and office report)

(For final disposal)

W.P.(C) NO.53/2007,

(With appln. for stay and impleadment and office report)

Conmt. Pet.(C) No.112/2007 in W.P.(C) No.265/2006

W.P.(C) NO.336/2207

(With appln. for permission to file lengthy list of dates and office report)

W.P.(C) NO.313/2007

(With appln. for directions and office report)

2

W.P.(C) NO.335/2007

(With appln. for stay and office report)

W.P.(C) NO.231/2007

(With appln. for interim relief and office report)

3

006 etc.etc.

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO(s). 265 OF 2

W.P.(C)No.425/2007 (With appln.(s) for directions)

AND WITH W.P.(C)No.428/2007

(With appln.(s) for directions and office report)

Date: 30/10/2007 These Petitions were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE
HON'BLE DR. JUSTICE ARIJIT PASAYAT
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE C.K. THAKKER
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.V. RAVEENDRAN
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE DALVEER BHANDARI

For Petitioner(s) Petitioner-In-Person
in W.P.(C)No.265/06

W.P.(C) 35/07 Mr.F.S.Nariman, Sr.Adv.(N.P.on 30/10&01/11)
Mr. Vikas Mehta, Adv.
Mr.Gopal Sankaranarayanan,Adv.
Mr.Arjun Suresh, Adv.

W.P.(C) 29 & 335/07 Mr. M.L. Lahoty, Adv.
Mr. Paban K. Sharma, Adv.
Mrs. Poonam Lahoty, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Shekhar, Adv.

W.P.(C) 269/06 Mr. Anurag Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Kumar, Adv.

W.P.(C) 598/06 &
W.P.(C) 53/07 Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain, Adv.
Ms. Uttra, Adv.
Mr. Gopal Shanker Narayanan, Adv.
Mrs. Kiran Suri, Adv.
Mr. Anirudh Sharma, Adv.

Conmt. Pet.(C)
No.112/2007 Mr. Shashi Bhushan, Ad.

W.P.(C) 336/07 Mr. Purushottam S.T., Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Gupta, Adv.

4

Mr. Anshuman Ashok, Adv.
Mr. H.S. Uppal, Adv.
Ms. Ruchita Uppal, Adv.
Mr. Mohan Pandey, Adv.

5

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO(s). 265 OF 2006 etc.etc.

W.P.(C) 313/07 Dr. Rajeev Dhavan, Sr. Adv.(N.P.30.10.07)
M/s. Subramonium Prasad, Raghavendra Srivatsa,
Anirudh Sharma,Hari Kumar G., Abhay Kumar,
Karan Mehta, R. Gopala Krishnan, Jai Kishore
Singh, Purushottam S.T.,Advs.
Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain, Adv.
Mrs. Pratibha Jain, Adv.

W.P.(C) 231/07 Mr. P.P. Rao. Sr. Adv.
M/s. Subramonium Prasad, Raghavendra Srivatsa,Advs.

Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain,Adv.
Mr. Puneet Jain, Adv.
Ms. Christi Jain, Adv.
Mr. H.D. Thanvi, Adv.
Ms. Aprajita Singh, Adv.
Mr. Amish Jha, Adv.
Mr. Vivekanand, Adv.
Mr. Kamal Deep, Adv.
Mr. Pawan Kumar, Adv.

For Respondent(s)1

UOI Mr.G.E.Vahanvati, Sol.Genl.of India(N.P.on 1/11/07)
Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, ASG(N.P.on 30&31/10/07)
Mr.K.Parasaran, Sr.Adv.(N.P.on 01/11/07)
Mr.Devadatt Kamat, Adv.
Mr. Hrishikesh Baruah, Adv.
Mr. Chinmoy Pradip Sharma, Adv.
Mr. T.S. Murthy, Adv.
Mr. Arunabh Patnaik, Adv.
Mr. Rohit Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Sparash Bhargav, Adv.
Ms. Sushma Suri ,Adv.

State of U.P. Mr. Shail Kumar Dwivedi, AAG.
Mr. Garvesh Kabra, Adv.
Mr. Shrish Kumar Misra, Adv.
Ms.Vandana Mishra, Adv.
Mr. S. Wasim A. Qadri, Adv.
Mr. Manoj Kumar Dwivedi, Adv.

6

UT of Pondichery Mr. V.G. Pragasan, Adv.
Mr. S. Joseph Aristotle, Adv.
Mr. S. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.

7

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO(s). 265 OF 2006

etc.etc.

State of T.N. Mr. K Parasaran, Sr. Adv.(N.P.on 1.11.07)
Mr. R. Viduthalai, Adv.Genl.(N.P.on 1.11.07)
Mr. V.G. Pragasan, Adv.
Mr. S. Joseph Aristotle, Adv.
Mr. S. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.

Mrs. Indra Jai Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Manoj Saxena, Adv.
Mr. Rajnish Kr. Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Shukla, Adv.
For Mr. T.V. George, Adv.

Mr.T.R. Andhyarujuna, Sr, Adv.(N.P.on 30&31/10/07)
Mr. G. Prakash, Adv.
Ms. Beena Parkash, Adv.

State of Mizoram Mr. K.N. Madhusoodhanan, Adv.
Mr. R.Sathish, Adv.

Mr. Ranjan Mukherjee, Adv.
Mr. S.C. Ghosh, Adv.

State of Assam Ms. Minakshi Sarma, Adv.
Mr.Riku Sarma, Adv.
For M/s. Corporate Law Group, Adv.

State of Manipur Mr. K.H. Nobin Singh, Adv.
Mr.Tarun Jamwal, Adv.
Mr.David Rao, Adv.
Mr. Biswajit Meitei, Adv.

State of Chhattisgarh Mr. Atul Jha, Adv.,
Mr. D.K. Sinha, Adv.

Mr. S.S. Shinde, Adv.
Mrs. Asha G. Nair, Adv.

NCT of Delhi Mr. Ashok Bhan, Adv.

Mr. Sunil Roy, Adv.
Mrs. Alka Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Aman Sinha, Adv.

8

Mrs. Kiran Bhardwaj, Adv.
Mrs. Anita Sahani, Adv.
For Mr. D.S. Mahra, Adv.

State of Raj. Mr. Aruneshwar Gupta, AAG
Mr. Naveen Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Shashwat Gupta, Adv.

9

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO(s). 265 OF

2006 etc.etc.

State of Sikkim Mr. Sonam P. Wangdi, AG,
Mr. A. Mariarputham, Adv.
Ms. Aruna Mathur, Adv.
For M/s. Arputham, Aruna & Co., Adv.

Dr. Kailash Chand, Adv.

State of W.B. Mr. Prashant Bhushan, Adv.

Mr. B.B. Singh, Adv.

Mr. Avijit Bhattacharjee, Adv.

Mrs. Anil Katiyar, Adv.

For U.G.C. Mr. Amitesh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Gopal Singh, Adv.
Mr. Vishwajit Singh, Adv.

Mrs. Jayshree Anand, AAG

Mr. K.K. Mahalik, Adv.

Mr. Kuldip Singh, Adv.

Mr. Arun K. Sinha, Adv.

State of Arunachal Pradesh Mr. Anil Shrivastav, Adv.
Mr. Ritu Raj, Adv.

Mr. K. Parasaran, Sr. Adv. (N.P. on 1.11.07)

Mr. A. Marriarputham, Adv.

Mr. A. Subba Rao, Adv.

Mr. D.L. Chidananda, Adv.

Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, Adv.

Mr. Ankit Singhal, Adv.

Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, Adv.

Mr. C.G. Solshe, Adv.

State of Orissa Mr. Janaranjan Das, Adv.
10

Mr. Swetaketu Mishra, Adv.

Ms. Kiran Suri, Adv.

Intervenor-in-person

etc.etc.

Mr. Manjit Singh, AAG, Haryana
Mr. T.V. George, Adv.

State of Karnataka Mr. Sanjay R. Hegde, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kr. Chawla, Adv.
Mr. Vikrant Yadav, Adv.

State of H.P. Mr. J.S. Attri, AAG

State of Bihar Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv. (N.P. on 01/11/07)
Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.
Mr. Mohit Kumar Shah, Adv.
Mr. Gopal Singh, Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Liberhan, Adv.
Mr. Shantanu Krishna, Adv.
Mr. Amit Singh, Adv.
Ms. Mukti Chaudhry, Adv.
Ms. Pritika Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Anant Prakash, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Chaudhary, Adv.

State of Tripura Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.
Mr. Gopal Singh, Adv.

State of Nagaland Mr. U. Hazarika, Adv.
Mr. Satya Mitra, Adv.
Ms. Sumita Hazarika, Adv.

Intervenor in Mr. V.K. Biju, Adv.
W.P.(C) No. 269/06 Mr. D.K. Garg, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Garg, Adv.

State of M.P. Mr. Vikas Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. B.S. Banthia, Adv.
Mr. S. Chandra Shekhar, Adv.

In W.P.(C) Nos. 425 &
428/07 Mr. Shiva Pujan Singh, Adv.
Mr. Prabhash Kumar Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Ramji Prasad Kushwaha, Adv.

12

Respnt/Intervenor Mr. Ravivarma Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. K. Balu, Adv.
Mr. R. Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Rojipura, Adv.
Mr. E.C. Vidyasagar, Adv.

13

tc.etc.

For Intervenor in Mr. Ram Jethmalani, Sr. Adv. (N.P. on 01/11/07)
W.P.(C) No. 313/07 Ms. Lataa Krishnamurti, Adv. (N.P. 1/11/07)
Mr. Saurabh Ajay Gupta, Adv.
Mr. S. Srinivasan, Adv.
Mr. Ritu Raj Singh, Adv.

Mr.Vivek B.O., Adv.
Mr.Ranbir Yadav, Adv.
Ms.Madhusmita Bora, Adv.
Mr.S.Balaji, Adv.
Mr.S.R.Sharma, Adv.

For JD(U)

Mr.Ranjeet Kumar, Sr.Adv.(N.P.on 1.11.07)
Mr.E.C.Vidyasagar, Adv.
Mr.Mohit Kumar Shah, Adv.
Mr.Kamal Gupta, Adv.

UPON hearing counsel the Court made the following
ORDER

Mr. Ram Jethmalani, learned senior counsel for the intervenor in W.P.(C)No.313/07 started his arguments at 11.15 a.m. and concluded at 2.30 p.m. Thereafter Mr.Ranjit Kumar, learned senior counsel addressed the Court on behalf of JD(U)party and adopted the arguments of Mr.Ram Jethmalani, learned senior counsel. Thereafter Mr.Rakesh Dwivedi, learned senior counsel for the State of Bihar addressed the Court upto 3.05 p.m. Thereafter Mr.Prashant Bhushan, learned counsel appearing for State of West Bengal adopted the arguments of Mr.G.E.Vahanvati, learned Solicitor General of India. Thereafter Mr.Ashok Bhan, learned counsel for the NCT of Delhi addressed upto 3.25 p.m. It was thereafter Mr.Ravi Varma Kumar, learned senior counsel for the intervenor/PMK party started his arguments and was on his legs, when the Court rose for the day, leaving the matter part-heard.

(R.K.DHAWAN)
COURT MASTER

(G.V.RAMANA)
COURT MASTER
14

(VEERA VERMA)
COURT MASTER

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO(s). 265 OF 2006 etc.etc.

31.10.2007: Coram & appearance as above
101(PH)

Mr.Ravi Varma Kumar, learned senior counsel for the Intervenor/PMK party resumed his arguments at 11.20 a.m. and concluded at 12.15 p.m. Thereafter Mr. Shiv Pujan Singh, learned counsel for the petitioner in W.P.(C) No.425/2007 started his arguments and concluded at 12.30 p.m. Thereafter Mr. P.P. Rao, learned senior counsel, in rejoinder started his arguments and concluded at 3.05 p.m. Thereafter Dr.Rajiv Dhawan, learned senior counsel started his arguments in rejoinder and was on his legs, when the Court rose for the day, leaving the matter part-heard.

(R.K.DHAWAN)
COURT MASTER

(G.V. RAMANA)
COURT MASTER

(VEERA VERMA)
COURT MASTER

01.11.2007: Coram & appearance as above
101(PH)

Dr.Rajiv Dhawan, learned senior counsel resumed his arguments at 11.20 a.m. and concluded at 12.10 p.m. Thereafter Mr.Harish Salve, learned senior counsel started his arguments in rejoinder and concluded at 3.20 p.m. Thereafter Mr.K.K.Venugopal, learned senior counsel argued till 4.15 p.m., when the Court rose for the day. Arguments concluded. Judgment reserved.

Parties are at liberty to file written submissions, if any, within a week.

(G.V.RAMANA)
COURT MASTER

(USHA BHARDWAJ) (CHARANJEET KAUR) (VEERA VERMA)
COURT MASTER COURT MASTER COURT MASTER