

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.4060/2009

MODERN DENTAL COLLEGE & RES.CEN. & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MADHYA PRADESH & ORS. Respondent(s)
(With appln.(s) for directions, stay, exemption from filing cause
title, impleadment, intervention, clarification, exemption from
filing O.T., stay and office report)

WITH

C.A.No.2871/2007-(With appln. for directions and Office Report)

C.A.No.2872/2007-(With Office Report)

C.A.No.2873/2007-(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment
and Office Report)

C.A.No.2874/2007

C.A.No.4061/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4062/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4063/2009-(With Interim Relief)

C.A.No.4064/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4065/2009-(With Office Report)

SLP(C)No.28576/2009

SLP(C)Nos.29875-29876/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30058-30059/2009-(With appln.(s) for directions and
vacating stay and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30089-30090/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.686/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

Signature Not Verified

SLP(C)No.2203-2204/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

Digitally signed by ANITA

MALHOTRA

Date: 2016.02.25 16:34:34

IST

Reason: DSC of anita

malhotra, cm is used by sarita

purohit, cm for signing

SLP(C)No.16805/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8037/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8926/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.23925/2011-(Permission to place addl. Documents on

record and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.30793/2012-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.P.(C)Nos.1779-1789/2013-(Stay and Office Report)

R.P.(C)No.1956/2013 In T.C.(C)No.101/2012

SLP(C)No.4875/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33075/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33124/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.490/2014-(Directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.883/2013-(Directions and impleadment as party respondent and Office Report)

R.P.(C)Nos.2159-2268/2013 and R.P.(C)Nos.2048-2157/2013 in T.C.(C)Nos.98,99,100,101,102,103,104,105, 107, 108, 110, 111, 112, 113-114, 115-116, 117-118, 119, 120, 121-122, 123-124, 125-127, 128-130,131, 132-134, 135-137, 138-139, 142, 144 and 145/2012, T.C.(C)Nos. 1,2,3,4,5,7,8,9,10,11,12-13,14-15,16,17, 18,19,20,21-22,23-24,25,30,53,58,59,60,61,62,72,73,75,76,28-29, 31-32,33-36,37-38,39,40,41,42,43,44,45,46,47,48,49,63-65,66-69, 70-71,107 and 108/2013

Date : 23/02/2016 These appeals were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.K. AGRAWAL
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL
HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE R. BANUMATHI

For Appellant(s)/Petitioner(s)/Applicant(s) :

C.A.Nos.4060,4064,
4065 & TP(C)
1779-89
Mr. K.K. Venugopal,Sr.Adv.
Mr. H.P. Raval,Sr.Adv.
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Puneet Jain,Adv.
Mr. A.P. Shroti,Adv.
Ms. Divya Anand,Adv.
Ms. Pratibha Jain,AOR
Ms. Pragati Neekhra,AOR

2

I.A.No.83 in CA 4060
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan,Sr.Adv.
Ms. Pragati Neekhra,AOR
Mr. Suryanarayana Singh,Adv.
Mr. A.P. Shroti,Adv.

CA 2871,2872
2873,2874
Mr. Shibashish Misra,AOR

CA 4061
Mr. B.K. Satija,AOR

CA 4062
Mr. Manish Singhvi,Adv.
Mr. Prashant Kumar,Adv.
Mr. Joseph Pookkath,Adv.
For M/s. AP & J Chambers,AOR

CA 4063
Ms. Pragati Neekhra,AOR

SLP(C) 28576, 29875-76, Mr. Milind Kumar,AOR

30058-59, 30089-90,
2203-2204

SLP(C) 16805 Ms. Manjula Gupta,AOR

SLP(C) 8037 Mr. Amit Pawan,AOR

SLP(C) 8926 Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar,Adv.
Ms. Bina Madhavan,Adv.
Ms. Swati Vellodi,Adv.
For M/s. Lawyer's Knit & Co.,AOR

RP(C) 1956 Mr. Prashant Bhushan,AOR

SLP(C) 33075 &
33124 Mr. Pravin Satale,Adv.
Mr. Rajiv Shankar Dvivedi,AOR

WP 490 Mr. Ajay Choudhary,AOR

WP 883 Mr. Vijay Kumar,AOR

For Respondent(s)
Min. of Health Ms. Pinki Anand,ASG
Mr. Ajay Sharma,Adv.
Mr. R.S. Nagar,Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma,Adv.
Mr. S.S. Rawat,Adv.
Ms. Rekha Pandey,Adv.
Mr. Ajay Kr. Singh,Adv.
Ms. Sunita Sharma,Adv.
Mr. D.S. Mahra,Adv.

3

State of M.P. Ms. Vibha Datta Makhija,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Mishra Saurabh,AOR
Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav,Adv.
Mr. Ankit Kr. Lal,Adv.

For MCI Mr. Vikas Singh,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Sharma,AOR
Ms. Deepika Kalia,Adv .
Mr. Dhawal Mohan,Adv.
Mr. Prateek Bhatia,Adv.
Mr. Vara Gaur,Adv.

State of UP Mr. P.N. Misra,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Kumar Singh,Adv.
Mr. Abhishth Kumar,AOR

State of Chhattisgarh Mr. C.D. Singh,AOR
Ms. Sakshi Kakkar,Adv.

State of Odisha Mr. Pawan Upadhyay,Adv.
Mr. Sarvjit Pratap Singh,Adv.
Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay,AOR

Govt. of Puducherry Mr. V.G. Pragasam,AOR
Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian,Adv.

For CBSE Mr. Tara Chandra Sharma,AOR
Ms. Neelam Sharma,Adv.
Ms. Pankhuri Shrivastava,Adv.
Mr. Rupesh Kumar,Adv.

Manipal Univ. Mr. L.R. Singh,AOR

CMC Vellor Mr. E.R. Kumar,Adv.

For M/s. P.H. Parekh & Co.,Adv.

RP(C) 2159-2268

Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Ashwarya Sinha,AOR

RP(C) 2159-2268

Mr. Subramonium Prasad,Sr.Adv.
Mr. B. Balaji,AOR
Mr. Muthuvel Palani,Adv.

CA 2871

Mr. H.P. Raval,Sr.Adv.
Mr. S.K. Das,Adv.
Mr. S. Misra,Adv.
Mr. Ajay Choudhary,Adv.

TP(C) 1779-80 &
SLP(C)4875

Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta,AOR
Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman,Adv.

4

Ms. Deepshikha Bharti,Adv.

CA 4060

Mr. Jasbir Singh Mullick,Adv.
Ms. Usha Nandini V.,AOR

RP(C) 2159

Mr. C.S.N. Mohan Rao,AOR
Mr. A. Ramesh,Adv.
Mr. Lokesh Kumar Sharma,Adv.
Mr. Syed Ahmad Nagoi,Adv.
Ms. Shilpi Gupta,Adv.

CA 2873, SLP(C)30058-59

Dr. Sumant Bhardwaj,Adv.
Ms. Mridula Ray Bharadwaj,AOR
Mr. Vikas Negi,Adv.

Mr. Sanjay K. Agrawal,AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha,AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain,AOR

Mr. R.C. Kohli,AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji,AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey,AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar,AOR

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal,AOR

Ms. Punam Kumari,AOR

Mr. Prem Sunder Jha,AOR

Mr. C.K. Sucharita,AOR

Ms. Charu Mathur,AOR

Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi,AOR

Dr. Sushil Balwada,AOR

Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I,AOR

Mr. K.K. Mani,AOR

Mr. Ramesh Babu M.R.,AOR

Mr. Ravindra Keshavrao Adsure,AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned senior counsel, appearing on behalf of the appellants, started his arguments at 10.40 a.m. and was on his legs when the Court rose for the day.

The matters remained Part-heard.

List the matters tomorrow, i.e., on 24th February, 2016, as Part-heard.

(Sarita Purohit)
Court Master

(Sneh Bala Mehra)
Assistant Registrar

ITEM NO.501 COURT NO.2 SECTION XVI/X/IVA/XVIA/IX

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.4060/2009

MODERN DENTAL COLLEGE & RES.CEN. & ORS. Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MADHYA PRADESH & ORS. Respondent(s)
(With appln.(s) for directions, stay, exemption from filing cause title, impleadment, intervention, clarification, exemption from filing O.T., stay and office report)

WITH

C.A.No.2871/2007-(With appln. for directions and Office Report)

C.A.No.2872/2007-(With Office Report)

C.A.No.2873/2007-(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and Office Report)

C.A.No.2874/2007

C.A.No.4061/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4062/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4063/2009-(With Interim Relief)

C.A.No.4064/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4065/2009-(With Office Report)

SLP(C)No.28576/2009

SLP(C)Nos.29875-29876/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30058-30059/2009-(With appln.(s) for directions and vacating stay and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30089-30090/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.686/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.2203-2204/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.16805/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8037/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

7

SLP(C)No.8926/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.23925/2011-(Permission to place addl. Documents on record and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.30793/2012-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.P.(C)Nos.1779-1789/2013-(Stay and Office Report)

R.P.(C)No.1956/2013 In T.C.(C)No.101/2012

SLP(C)No.4875/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33075/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33124/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.490/2014-(Directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.883/2013-(Directions and impleadment as party respondent and Office Report)

R.P.(C)Nos.2159-2268/2013 and R.P.(C)Nos.2048-2157/2013 in T.C.(C)Nos.98,99,100,101,102,103,104,105, 107, 108, 110, 111, 112, 113-114, 115-116, 117-118, 119, 120, 121-122, 123-124, 125-127, 128-130,131, 132-134, 135-137, 138-139, 142, 144 and 145/2012, T.C.(C)Nos. 1,2,3,4,5,7,8,9,10,11,12-13,14-15,16,17, 18,19,20,21-22,23-24,25,30,53,58,59,60,61,62,72,73,75,76,28-29, 31-32,33-36,37-38,39,40,41,42,43,44,45,46,47,48,49,63-65,66-69, 70-71,107 and 108/2013

Date : 23/02/2016 These appeals were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.K. AGRAWAL
HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE R. BANUMATHI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL

For Appellant(s)/Petitioner(s)/Applicant(s) :

C.A.Nos.4060,4064,
4065 & TP(C)
1779-89
Mr. K.K. Venugopal,Sr.Adv.
Mr. H.P. Raval,Sr.Adv.
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Puneet Jain,Adv.
Mr. A.P. Shroti,Adv.
Ms. Divya Anand,Adv.
Ms. Pratibha Jain,AOR
Ms. Pragati Neekhra,AOR

8

I.A.No.83 in CA 4060
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan,Sr.Adv.
Ms. Pragati Neekhra,AOR

	Mr. Suryanarayana Singh,Adv.
	Mr. A.P. Shroti,Adv.
CA 2871,2872 2873,2874	Mr. Shibashish Misra,AOR
CA 4061	Mr. B.K. Satija,AOR
CA 4062	Mr. Manish Singhvi,Adv. Mr. Prashant Kumar,Adv. Mr. Joseph Pookkath,Adv. For M/s. AP & J Chambers,AOR
CA 4063	Ms. Pragati Neekhara,AOR
SLP(C) 28576, 29875-76, 30058-59, 30089-90, 2203-2204	Mr. Milind Kumar,AOR
SLP(C) 16805	Ms. Manjula Gupta,AOR
SLP(C) 8037	Mr. Amit Pawan,AOR
SLP(C) 8926	Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar,Adv. Ms. Bina Madhavan,Adv. Ms. Swati Vellodi,Adv. For M/s. Lawyer's Knit & Co.,AOR
RP(C) 1956	Mr. Prashant Bhushan,AOR
SLP(C) 33075 & 33124	Mr. Pravin Satale,Adv. Mr. Rajiv Shankar Dvivedi,AOR
WP 490	Mr. Ajay Choudhary,AOR
WP 883	Mr. Vijay Kumar,AOR
For Respondent(s) Min. of Health	Ms. Pinki Anand,ASG Mr. Ajay Sharma,Adv. Mr. R.S. Nagar,Adv. Mr. Amit Sharma,Adv. Mr. S.S. Rawat,Adv. Ms. Rekha Pandey,Adv. Mr. Ajay Kr. Singh,Adv. Ms. Sunita Sharma,Adv. Mr. D.S. Mahra,Adv.

9

State of M.P.	Ms. Vibha Datta Makhija,Sr.Adv. Mr. Mishra Saurabh,AOR Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav,Adv. Mr. Ankit Kr. Lal,Adv.
For MCI	Mr. Vikas Singh,Sr.Adv. Mr. Gaurav Sharma,AOR Ms. Deepika Kalia,Adv . Mr. Dhawal Mohan,Adv. Mr. Prateek Bhatia,Adv. Mr. Vara Gaur,Adv.
State of UP	Mr. P.N. Misra,Sr.Adv. Mr. Abhishek Kumar Singh,Adv. Mr. Abhishth Kumar,AOR
State of Chhattisgarh	Mr. C.D. Singh,AOR

Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, Adv.

State of Odisha

Mr. Pawan Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Sarvjit Pratap Singh, Adv.
Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR

Govt. of Puducherry

Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR
Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.

For CBSE

Mr. Tara Chandra Sharma, AOR
Ms. Neelam Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Pankhuri Shrivastava, Adv.
Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Adv.

Manipal Univ.

Mr. L.R. Singh, AOR

CMC Vellor

Mr. E.R. Kumar, Adv.
For M/s. P.H. Parekh & Co., Advs.

RP(C) 2159-2268

Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Ashwarya Sinha, AOR

RP(C) 2159-2268

Mr. Subramonium Prasad, Sr. Adv.
Mr. B. Balaji, AOR
Mr. Muthuvel Palani, Adv.

CA 2871

Mr. H.P. Raval, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S.K. Das, Adv.
Mr. S. Misra, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Choudhary, Adv.

TP(C) 1779-80 &
SLP(C) 4875

Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR
Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv.
Ms. Deepshikha Bharti, Adv.

10

CA 4060

Mr. Jasbir Singh Mullick, Adv.
Ms. Usha Nandini V., AOR

RP(C) 2159

Mr. C.S.N. Mohan Rao, AOR
Mr. A. Ramesh, Adv.
Mr. Lokesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Syed Ahmad Nagoi, Adv.
Ms. Shilpi Gupta, Adv.

CA 2873, SLP(C) 30058-59

Dr. Sumant Bhardwaj, Adv.
Ms. Mridula Ray Bharadwaj, AOR
Mr. Vikas Negi, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay K. Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. R.C. Kohli, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar, AOR

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, AOR

Ms. Punam Kumari, AOR

Mr. Prem Sunder Jha, AOR

Mr. C.K. Sucharita,AOR
Ms. Charu Mathur,AOR
Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi,AOR
Dr. Sushil Balwada,AOR
Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I,AOR
Mr. K.K. Mani,AOR
Mr. Ramesh Babu M.R.,AOR
Mr. Ravindra Keshavrao Adsure,AOR

11

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned senior counsel, appearing on behalf of the appellants, started his arguments at 10.40 a.m. and was on his legs when the Court rose for the day.

The matters remained Part-heard.

List the matters tomorrow, i.e., on 24th February, 2016, as Part-heard.

(Sarita Purohit)
Court Master

(Sneh Bala Mehra)
Assistant Registrar

12