

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Civil Appeal No.4060/2009

MODERN DENTAL COLLEGE & RES.CEN. & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MADHYA PRADESH & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln.(s) for directions, stay, exemption from filing cause title, impleadment, intervention, clarification, exemption from filing O.T., stay and office report)

WITH

C.A.No.2871/2007-(With appln. for directions and Office Report)

C.A.No.2872/2007-(With Office Report)

C.A.No.2873/2007-(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and Office Report)

C.A.No.2874/2007

C.A.No.4061/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4062/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4063/2009-(With Interim Relief)

C.A.No.4064/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4065/2009-(With Office Report)

SLP(C)No.28576/2009

SLP(C)Nos.29875-29876/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30058-30059/2009-(With appln.(s) for directions and vacating stay and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30089-30090/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.686/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.2203-2204/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.16805/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8037/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)  
SLP(C)No.8926/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.23925/2011-(Permission to place addl. Documents on record and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.30793/2012-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.P. (C)Nos.1779-1789/2013-(Stay and Office Report)

R.P. (C)No.1956/2013 In T.C. (C)No.101/2012

SLP(C)No.4875/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33075/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33124/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

W.P. (C)No.490/2014-(Directions and Office Report)

W.P. (C)No.883/2013-(Directions and impleadment as party respondent and Office Report)

R.P. (C)Nos.2159-2268/2013 and R.P. (C)Nos.2048-2157/2013 in T.C. (C)Nos.98,99,100,101,102,103,104,105, 107, 108, 110, 111, 112, 113-114, 115-116, 117-118, 119, 120, 121-122, 123-124, 125-127, 128-130,131, 132-134, 135-137, 138-139, 142, 144 and 145/2012, T.C. (C)Nos. 1,2,3,4,5,7,8,9,10,11,12-13,14-15,16,17, 18,19,20,21-22,23-24,25,30,53,58,59,60,61,62,72,73,75,76,28-29, 31-32,33-36,37-38,39,40,41,42,43,44,45,46,47,48,49,63-65,66-69, 70-71,107 and 108/2013

Date : 23/02/2016 These appeals were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.K. AGRAWAL  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL  
HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE R. BANUMATHI

For Appellant(s)/Petitioner(s)/Applicant(s) :

C.A.Nos.4060,4064,  
4065 & TP(C)  
1779-89

Mr. K.K. Venugopal,Sr.Adv.  
Mr. H.P. Raval,Sr.Adv.  
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan,Sr.Adv.  
Mr. Puneet Jain,Adv.  
Mr. A.P. Shroti,Adv.  
Ms. Divya Anand,Adv.  
Ms. Pratibha Jain,AOR  
Ms. Pragati Neekhara,AOR

I.A.No.83 in CA 4060	Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, Sr. Adv. Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR Mr. Suryanarayana Singh, Adv. Mr. A.P. Shroti, Adv.
CA 2871, 2872 2873, 2874	Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR
CA 4061	Mr. B.K. Satija, AOR
CA 4062	Mr. Manish Singhvi, Adv. Mr. Prashant Kumar, Adv. Mr. Joseph Pookkath, Adv. For M/s. AP & J Chambers, AOR
CA 4063	Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR
SLP(C) 28576, 29875-76, 30058-59, 30089-90, 2203-2204	Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR
SLP(C) 16805	Ms. Manjula Gupta, AOR
SLP(C) 8037	Mr. Amit Pawan, AOR
SLP(C) 8926	Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv. Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv. Ms. Swati Vellodi, Adv. For M/s. Lawyer's Knit & Co., AOR
RP(C) 1956	Mr. Prashant Bhushan, AOR
SLP(C) 33075 & 33124	Mr. Pravin Satale, Adv. Mr. Rajiv Shankar Dvivedi, AOR
WP 490	Mr. Ajay Choudhary, AOR
WP 883	Mr. Vijay Kumar, AOR
For Respondent(s) Min. of Health	Ms. Pinki Anand, ASG Mr. Ajay Sharma, Adv. Mr. R.S. Nagar, Adv. Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv. Mr. S.S. Rawat, Adv. Ms. Rekha Pandey, Adv. Mr. Ajay Kr. Singh, Adv. Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv. Mr. D.S. Mahra, Adv.

State of M.P.	Ms. Vibha Datta Makhija, Sr. Adv. Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav, Adv. Mr. Ankit Kr. Lal, Adv.
For MCI	Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv. Mr. Gaurav Sharma, AOR Ms. Deepika Kalia, Adv. Mr. Dhawal Mohan, Adv. Mr. Prateek Bhatia, Adv. Mr. Vara Gaur, Adv.
State of UP	Mr. P.N. Misra, Sr. Adv. Mr. Abhishek Kumar Singh, Adv. Mr. Abhishth Kumar, AOR
State of Chhattisgarh	Mr. C.D. Singh, AOR Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, Adv.
State of Odisha	Mr. Pawan Upadhyay, Adv. Mr. Sarvjit Pratap Singh, Adv. Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR
Govt. of Puducherry	Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.
For CBSE	Mr. Tara Chandra Sharma, AOR Ms. Neelam Sharma, Adv. Ms. Pankhuri Shrivastava, Adv. Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Adv.
Manipal Univ.	Mr. L.R. Singh, AOR
CMC Vellor	Mr. E.R. Kumar, Adv. For M/s. P.H. Parekh & Co., Advs.
RP(C) 2159-2268	Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv. Mr. Ashwarya Sinha, AOR
RP(C) 2159-2268	Mr. Subramonium Prasad, Sr. Adv. Mr. B. Balaji, AOR Mr. Muthuvel Palani, Adv.
CA 2871	Mr. H.P. Raval, Sr. Adv. Mr. S.K. Das, Adv. Mr. S. Misra, Adv. Mr. Ajay Choudhary, Adv.
TP(C) 1779-80 & SLP(C) 4875	Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv.

Ms. Deepshikha Bharti, Adv.

CA 4060 Mr. Jasbir Singh Mullick, Adv.  
Ms. Usha Nandini V., AOR

RP(C) 2159 Mr. C.S.N. Mohan Rao, AOR  
Mr. A. Ramesh, Adv.  
Mr. Lokesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Syed Ahmad Nagoi, Adv.  
Ms. Shilpi Gupta, Adv.

CA 2873, SLP(C) 30058-59 Dr. Sumant Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Mridula Ray Bharadwaj, AOR  
Mr. Vikas Negi, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay K. Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. R.C. Kohli, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar, AOR

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, AOR

Ms. Punam Kumari, AOR

Mr. Prem Sunder Jha, AOR

Mr. C.K. Sucharita, AOR

Ms. Charu Mathur, AOR

Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR

Dr. Sushil Balwada, AOR

Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I, AOR

Mr. K.K. Mani, AOR

Mr. Ramesh Babu M.R., AOR

Mr. Ravindra Keshavrao Adsure, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned senior counsel, appearing on behalf of the appellants, started his arguments at 10.40 a.m. and was on his legs when the Court rose for the day.

The matters remained Part-heard.

List the matters tomorrow, i.e., on 24<sup>th</sup> February, 2016, as Part-heard.

(Sarita Purohit)  
Court Master

(Sneh Bala Mehra)  
Assistant Registrar

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.4060/2009

MODERN DENTAL COLLEGE &amp; RES.CEN. &amp; ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MADHYA PRADESH &amp; ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln.(s) for directions, stay, exemption from filing cause title, impleadment, intervention, clarification, exemption from filing O.T., stay and office report)

WITH

C.A.No.2871/2007-(With appln. for directions and Office Report)

C.A.No.2872/2007-(With Office Report)

C.A.No.2873/2007-(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and Office Report)

C.A.No.2874/2007

C.A.No.4061/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4062/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4063/2009-(With Interim Relief)

C.A.No.4064/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4065/2009-(With Office Report)

SLP(C)No.28576/2009

SLP(C)Nos.29875-29876/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30058-30059/2009-(With appln.(s) for directions and vacating stay and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30089-30090/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.686/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.2203-2204/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.16805/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8037/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8926/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.23925/2011-(Permission to place addl. Documents on record and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.30793/2012-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.P. (C)Nos.1779-1789/2013-(Stay and Office Report)

R.P. (C)No.1956/2013 In T.C. (C)No.101/2012

SLP(C)No.4875/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33075/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33124/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

W.P. (C)No.490/2014-(Directions and Office Report)

W.P. (C)No.883/2013-(Directions and impleadment as party respondent and Office Report)

R.P. (C)Nos.2159-2268/2013 and R.P. (C)Nos.2048-2157/2013 in T.C. (C)Nos.98,99,100,101,102,103,104,105, 107, 108, 110, 111, 112, 113-114, 115-116, 117-118, 119, 120, 121-122, 123-124, 125-127, 128-130,131, 132-134, 135-137, 138-139, 142, 144 and 145/2012, T.C. (C)Nos. 1,2,3,4,5,7,8,9,10,11,12-13,14-15,16,17, 18,19,20,21-22,23-24,25,30,53,58,59,60,61,62,72,73,75,76,28-29, 31-32,33-36,37-38,39,40,41,42,43,44,45,46,47,48,49,63-65,66-69, 70-71,107 and 108/2013

Date : 23/02/2016 These appeals were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.K. AGRAWAL  
HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE R. BANUMATHI  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL

For Appellant(s)/Petitioner(s)/Applicant(s) :

C.A.Nos.4060,4064,  
4065 & TP(C)  
1779-89

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. H.P. Raval, Sr. Adv.  
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Puneet Jain, Adv.  
Mr. A.P. Shroti, Adv.  
Ms. Divya Anand, Adv.  
Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR  
Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR

I.A.No.83 in CA 4060	Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, Sr. Adv. Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR Mr. Suryanarayana Singh, Adv. Mr. A.P. Shroti, Adv.
CA 2871, 2872 2873, 2874	Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR
CA 4061	Mr. B.K. Satija, AOR
CA 4062	Mr. Manish Singhvi, Adv. Mr. Prashant Kumar, Adv. Mr. Joseph Pookkath, Adv. For M/s. AP & J Chambers, AOR
CA 4063	Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR
SLP(C) 28576, 29875-76, 30058-59, 30089-90, 2203-2204	Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR
SLP(C) 16805	Ms. Manjula Gupta, AOR
SLP(C) 8037	Mr. Amit Pawan, AOR
SLP(C) 8926	Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv. Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv. Ms. Swati Vellodi, Adv. For M/s. Lawyer's Knit & Co., AOR
RP(C) 1956	Mr. Prashant Bhushan, AOR
SLP(C) 33075 & 33124	Mr. Pravin Satale, Adv. Mr. Rajiv Shankar Dvivedi, AOR
WP 490	Mr. Ajay Choudhary, AOR
WP 883	Mr. Vijay Kumar, AOR
For Respondent(s) Min. of Health	Ms. Pinki Anand, ASG Mr. Ajay Sharma, Adv. Mr. R.S. Nagar, Adv. Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv. Mr. S.S. Rawat, Adv. Ms. Rekha Pandey, Adv. Mr. Ajay Kr. Singh, Adv. Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv. Mr. D.S. Mahra, Adv.

State of M.P.	Ms. Vibha Datta Makhija, Sr. Adv. Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav, Adv. Mr. Ankit Kr. Lal, Adv.
For MCI	Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv. Mr. Gaurav Sharma, AOR Ms. Deepika Kalia, Adv. Mr. Dhawal Mohan, Adv. Mr. Prateek Bhatia, Adv. Mr. Vara Gaur, Adv.
State of UP	Mr. P.N. Misra, Sr. Adv. Mr. Abhishek Kumar Singh, Adv. Mr. Abhish Kumar, AOR
State of Chhattisgarh	Mr. C.D. Singh, AOR Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, Adv.
State of Odisha	Mr. Pawan Upadhyay, Adv. Mr. Sarvjit Pratap Singh, Adv. Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR
Govt. of Puducherry	Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.
For CBSE	Mr. Tara Chandra Sharma, AOR Ms. Neelam Sharma, Adv. Ms. Pankhuri Shrivastava, Adv. Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Adv.
Manipal Univ.	Mr. L.R. Singh, AOR
CMC Vellor	Mr. E.R. Kumar, Adv. For M/s. P.H. Parekh & Co., Advs.
RP(C) 2159-2268	Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv. Ms. Ashwarya Sinha, AOR
RP(C) 2159-2268	Mr. Subramonium Prasad, Sr. Adv. Mr. B. Balaji, AOR Mr. Muthuvel Palani, Adv.
CA 2871	Mr. H.P. Raval, Sr. Adv. Mr. S.K. Das, Adv. Mr. S. Misra, Adv. Mr. Ajay Choudhary, Adv.
TP(C) 1779-80 & SLP(C) 4875	Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv. Ms. Deepshikha Bharti, Adv.

CA 4060 Mr. Jasbir Singh Mullick, Adv.  
Ms. Usha Nandini V., AOR

RP(C) 2159 Mr. C.S.N. Mohan Rao, AOR  
Mr. A. Ramesh, Adv.  
Mr. Lokesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Syed Ahmad Nagoi, Adv.  
Ms. Shilpi Gupta, Adv.

CA 2873, SLP(C) 30058-59 Dr. Sumant Bhardwaj, Adv.  
Ms. Mridula Ray Bharadwaj, AOR  
Mr. Vikas Negi, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay K. Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. R.C. Kohli, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar, AOR

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, AOR

Ms. Punam Kumari, AOR

Mr. Prem Sunder Jha, AOR

Mr. C.K. Sucharita, AOR

Ms. Charu Mathur, AOR

Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR

Dr. Sushil Balwada, AOR

Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I, AOR

Mr. K.K. Mani, AOR

Mr. Ramesh Babu M.R., AOR

Mr. Ravindra Keshavrao Adsure, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned senior counsel, appearing on behalf of the appellants, started his arguments at 10.40 a.m. and was on his legs when the Court rose for the day.

The matters remained Part-heard.

List the matters tomorrow, i.e., on 24<sup>th</sup> February, 2016, as Part-heard.

(Sarita Purohit)  
Court Master

(Sneh Bala Mehra)  
Assistant Registrar