

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA
CIVIL ORIGINAL JURISDICTION

TRANSFER PETITION (CIVIL) NOS. 1779-1789 OF 2013

PEOPLES UNIVERSITY

... PETITIONER(S)

VS.

MANISHA SAGAR & ORS.

... RESPONDENT(S)

O R D E R

Heard the learned counsel.

In view of the withdrawal of I.A. Nos. 67-68 in Civil Appeal No. 4060 of 2009, learned counsel for the petitioner seeks permission to withdraw these petitions.

The Transfer Petitions are, accordingly, disposed of as withdrawn.

.....J.
[ANIL R. DAVE]

.....J.
[A.K. SIKRI]

.....J.
[R.K. AGRAWAL]

.....J.
[ADARSH KUMAR GOEL]

.....J.
[R. BANUMATHI]

Signature Not Verified New Delhi;
Digitally signed by ANITA
MALHOTRA
Date: 2016.03.29 14:08:18
16th March, 2016.
IST
Reason: DSC of ms anita
malhotra, cm is used by sarita
purohit, cm for signing

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.4060/2009

MODERN DENTAL COLLEGE & RES.CEN. & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MADHYA PRADESH & ORS. Respondent(s)
(With appln.(s) for directions, stay, exemption from filing cause
title, impleadment, intervention, clarification, exemption from
filing O.T., stay and office report)

WITH

C.A.No.2871/2007-(With appln. for directions and Office Report)

C.A.No.2872/2007-(With Office Report)

C.A.No.2873/2007-(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment
and Office Report)

C.A.No.2874/2007

C.A.No.4061/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4062/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4063/2009-(With Interim Relief)

C.A.No.4064/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4065/2009-(With Office Report)

SLP(C)No.28576/2009

SLP(C)Nos.29875-29876/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30058-30059/2009-(With appln.(s) for directions and
vacating stay and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30089-30090/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.686/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.2203-2204/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.16805/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

2

ac4060/09

SLP(C)No.8037/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8926/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.23925/2011-(With appln.(s) for permission to place
addl. Documents on record and Interim Relief and Office
Report)

SLP(C)No.30793/2012-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.P.(C)Nos.1779-1789/2013-(Stay and Office Report)

R.P.(C)No.1956/2013 In T.C.(C)No.101/2012

SLP(C)No.4875/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33075/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33124/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.490/2014-(Directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.883/2013-(Directions and impleadment as party respondent and Office Report)

R.P.(C) Nos.2159-2268/2013 and R.P.(C) Nos.2048-2157/2013 in
T.C.(C) Nos.98-105, 107-108, 110-139, 142, 144-145 of 2012 &
1-5, 7-25, 28-49, 53, 58-73, 75-76 & 107-108 of 2013

Date : 16/03/2016 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.K. AGRAWAL
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL
HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE R. BANUMATHI

Appellant(s)/Applicant(s)/Petitioner(s) :

C.A.Nos.4060 Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Puneet Jain, Adv.
Mr. Manu Maheshwari, Adv.
Ms. Ankita Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Chaya Kirti, Adv.
Mr. Apurv Taran Jain, Adv.
Mr. Kabir Ghosh, Adv.
For Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR

3

ac4060/09

I.A.No.83 in CA 4060 Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR
Mr. Amalpushp Shrotri, Adv.
Mr. Rohit Bhat, Adv.
Mr. Kabir Ghosh, Adv.

IAS 84 & 85 in CA 4060 Mr. R. Prabhakaran, Adv.
Mr. S. Beno Bencigar, Adv.
Ms. Maya Krishnan, Adv.
For Ms. Manju Jetley, Adv.

I.A.No.86 in CA 4060 Mr. Jasbir Singh Malik, Adv.
for Ms. Usha Nandini V., AOR

WP 883 Mr. Vijay Kumar, AOR

CA 4061 Mr. B. K. Satija, Adv.

CA 4063 & resp. Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR
in CA 2871

CA 4064 & 4065, TC(C) Mr. Puneet Jain, Adv.
1779-89 & res. For Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR
in SLP(C)30793, 4875

CA 2871, 2872, 2873, Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR
2874 & resp. in SLP

(C)16805 & WP(C)883

CA 4062	M/s. AP & J Chambers,AOR
SLP(C)28576,29875-76, 30058-59,30089-90, 2203-2204 & resp. in CA 2871,2872,2873,2874 SLP(C)16805 & WP(C)883	Mr. Milind Kumar,AOR
SLP(C) 16805	Ms. Manjula Gupta,AOR
SLP(C) 8037	Mr. Amit Pawan,AOR
SLP(C) 8926	M/s. Lawyer's Knit & Co.,AOR
RP(C) 1956	Mr. Prashant Bhushan,AOR
SLP(C)33075 & 33124	Mr. Rajiv Shankar Dvivedi,AOR
WP 490 & resp. in SLP(C)30089-90, 686	Mr. Ajay Choudhary,AOR

4

ac4060/09

For Respondent(s) UOI	Ms. Pinky Anand,ASG Mr. Ajay Sharma,Adv. Mr. R.S. Nagar,Adv. Ms. Rekha Pandey,Adv. Ms. Sunita Sharma,Adv. Mr. Amit Sharma,Adv. Mr. R.K. Rathore,Adv. Mr. S.S. Rawat,Adv. Mr. Ajay Kumar Singh,Adv. Mr. M.P. Gupta,Adv. Mr. Karan Seth,Adv. Mr. Sanchit Kumar,Adv. Mr. Rishabh Jain,Adv. Mr. R.R. Rajesh,Adv. For Mr. D.S. Mahra,AOR
For MCI	Mr. Vikas Singh,Sr.Adv. Mr. Gaurav Sharma,AOR Ms. Deepika Kalia,Adv. Mr. Dhawal Mohan,Adv. Mr. Prateek Bhatia,Adv. Ms. Amandeep Kaur,Adv. Mr. Kapeesh Seth,Adv. Mr. Vara Gaur,Adv.
RP(C) 2159-2268 & TC(C) 1 & 3	Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha,Sr.Adv. Mr. Ashwarya Sinha,AOR
State of M.P.	Ms. Vibha Datta Makhija,Sr.Adv. Mr. Mishra Saurabh,AOR Mr. Ankit Kumar Lal,Adv. Ms. Disha Vaish,Adv.
AFRC	Mr. R.C. Kohli,AOR
CA 2873 & SLP(C) 20058-59	Ms. Mridula Ray Bharadwaj,AOR Mr. Ajit Kumar Gupta,Adv.
State of Odisha	Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay,AOR
State of UP	Mr. P.N. Misra,Sr.Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Abhishth Kumar, AOR

State of Chhattisgarh Mr. C.D. Singh, AOR (AAG)
Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, Adv.
Ms. Sylona Mohapatra, Adv.

State of Rajasthan Mr. S.S. Shamschery, Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
for Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

5

ac4060/09

Govt. of Puducherry Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR
Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.

For CBSE Ms. Neelam Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Sharma, Adv.
for Mr. Tara Chandra Sharma, AOR

Christian Med. Coll. Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Krishna Srinivasan, Adv.
Mr. E.R. Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Geethi Aara, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
Mr. Anurag Tripathi, Adv.
For M/s. P.H. Parekh, AOR

Manipal Univ. Mr. L.R. Singh, AOR

CMC Ludhiana Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, Adv.

CA 2871 Mr. Ajay Choudhary, AOR

RP(C) 2159-2268 &
RP(C) 1956 Mr. C.S.N. Mohan Rao, AOR
Mr. A. Ramesh, Adv.
Mr. Lokesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Syed Ahmad Naqvi, Adv.
Ms. Shilpi Gupta, Adv.

RP(C) 2159-2268 Mr. V. Giri, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Subramonium Prasad, Sr. Adv.
Mr. B. Balaji, AOR
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.

TP(C) 1779-80 &
SLP(C) 4875 Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR
Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv.
Ms. Deepshikha Bharti, Adv.
Ms. Rita Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, Adv.
Mr. Arpit Rai, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay K. Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar, AOR

6

ac4060/09

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal,AOR
Ms. Punam Kumari,AOR
Mr. Prem Sunder Jha,AOR
Mr. C.K. Sucharita,AOR
Ms. Charu Mathur,AOR
Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi,AOR
Mr. Suresh Chandra Tripathy,AOR
Dr. Sushil Balwada,AOR
Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I,AOR
Mr. K.K. Mani,AOR
Mr. Ramesh Babu M.R.,AOR
Mr. Ravindra Keshavrao Adsure,AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

C.A.Nos.4060,4061,4062,4063,4064 & 4065 of 2009 :
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, learned senior counsel, resumed
his arguments from 10.45 a.m. to 11.15 a.m. Then, Mr.
Saurabh Mishra, learned counsel, made his submissions
till 11.15 a.m. Then, Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned senior
counsel, addressed the Court from 11.30 to 12.50 p.m.
Then, Mr. Vikas Singh made his submissions for few
minutes. Thereafter, Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, resumed his
arguments and concluded at 4.00 p.m.
Hearing concluded.
Judgment reserved.

I.A Nos.67-68 in C.A.No.4060 of 2009 :
The learned counsel appearing for the applicants
seeks permission to withdraw these applications as on the
same subject he had already approached the High Court.

Permission is granted.
The applications are accordingly disposed of as
withdrawn.

I.A.No.83/2015 in C.A.No.4060 of 2009 &
List this application tomorrow, i.e., on 17th March,
2016, for orders.

I.A Nos.87 & 88 of 2016 in C.A.No.4060/2009 :
Ms. Pragati Neekhara, learned counsel appearing for
the applicants, has fairly submitted that these
applications are premature, therefore, seeks permission
to withdraw these applications with a liberty to approach
the appropriate forum at an appropriate time.
Permission is granted.
The applications are accordingly disposed of as

withdrawn.

C.A.Nos.2871, 2872, 2873 & 2874 of 2007, SLP(C)Nos. 28576, 29875-76, 30058-59, 30089-90 of 2009, 686, 2203-4, & 16805 of 2010, 8037, 8926 & 23925 of 2011 and 33075 & 33124 of 2013 and W.P.Nos.490/2014 & 883/2013 :

De-tagged.

S.L.P.(Civil) No.30793 of 2012 :

As the present special leave petition has been filed against the interim order, we are not inclined to entertain the petition particularly when the issue has become infructuous. The special leave petition is accordingly dismissed as such.

Transfer Petition (Civil) No.1779-1789 of 2013

The transfer Petitions are disposed of as withdrawn in terms of the signed order.

8

ac4060/09

S.L.P.(Civil)No.4875 of 2013

By efflux of time, this petition has become infuctuous. The special leave petition is dismissed as such.

R.P.No.1956/2013 in T.C.(C)No.101/2012 and R.P.(C) Nos.2159-2268/2013 & 2048-2157/2013 in T.C.(C)Nos.98-105, 107-108, 110-139, 142, 144-145 of 2012 & 1-5, 7-25, 28-49, 53, 58-73, 75-76 & 107-108 of 2013 :

List these matters tomorrow, i.e, on 17 th March, 2016.

(Anita Malhotra
Court Master

(Sarita Purohit)
Court Master

(Sneh Bala Mehra)
Assistant Registrar

(Signed order in TP(C)Nos.1779-1789/2013 is placed on the file)

9