

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA
CIVIL ORIGINAL JURISDICTION

TRANSFER PETITION (CIVIL)NOS.1779-1789 OF 2013

PEOPLES UNIVERSITY ... PETITIONER(S)

VS.

MANISHA SAGAR & ORS. ... RESPONDENT(S)

O R D E R

Heard the learned counsel.

In view of the withdrawal of I.A. Nos. 67-68 in Civil Appeal No.4060 of 2009, learned counsel for the petitioner seeks permission to withdraw these petitions.

The Transfer Petitions are, accordingly, disposed of as withdrawn.

.....J.
[ANIL R. DAVE]

.....J.
[A.K. SIKRI]

.....J.
[R.K. AGRAWAL]

.....J.
[ADARSH KUMAR GOEL]

.....J.
[R.BANUMATHI]

Signature Not Verified New Delhi;
Digitally signed by ANITA
MALHOTRA
Date: 2016.03.29 14:08:18
16th March, 2016.

IST
Reason: DSC of ms anita
malhotra, cm is used by sarita
purohit, cm for signing

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.4060/2009

MODERN DENTAL COLLEGE & RES.CEN. & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

STATE OF MADHYA PRADESH & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln.(s) for directions, stay, exemption from filing cause title, impleadment, intervention, clarification, exemption from filing O.T., stay and office report)

WITH

C.A.No.2871/2007-(With appln. for directions and Office Report)

C.A.No.2872/2007-(With Office Report)

C.A.No.2873/2007-(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and Office Report)

C.A.No.2874/2007

C.A.No.4061/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4062/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4063/2009-(With Interim Relief)

C.A.No.4064/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

C.A.No.4065/2009-(With Office Report)

SLP(C)No.28576/2009

SLP(C)Nos.29875-29876/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30058-30059/2009-(With appln.(s) for directions and vacating stay and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)Nos.30089-30090/2009-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.686/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.2203-2204/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.16805/2010-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

2

ac4060/09

SLP(C)No.8037/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.8926/2011-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.23925/2011-(With appln.(s) for permission to place addl. Documents on record and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.30793/2012-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.P.(C)Nos.1779-1789/2013-(Stay and Office Report)

R.P.(C)No.1956/2013 In T.C.(C)No.101/2012

SLP(C)No.4875/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33075/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C)No.33124/2013-(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.490/2014-(Directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C)No.883/2013-(Directions and impleadment as party respondent and Office Report)

R.P.(C) Nos.2159-2268/2013 and R.P.(C) Nos.2048-2157/2013 in T.C.(C) Nos.98-105, 107-108, 110-139, 142, 144-145 of 2012 & 1-5, 7-25, 28-49, 53, 58-73, 75-76 & 107-108 of 2013

Date : 16/03/2016 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE R.K. AGRAWAL
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL
HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE R. BANUMATHI

Appellant(s)/Applicant(s)/Petitioner(s) :

C.A.Nos.4060 Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Puneet Jain, Adv.
Mr. Manu Maheshwari, Adv.
Ms. Ankita Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Chaya Kirti, Adv.
Mr. Apurv Taran Jain, Adv.
Mr. Kabir Ghosh, Adv.
For Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR

3

ac4060/09

I.A.No.83 in CA 4060 Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR
Mr. Amalpushp Shrotri, Adv.
Mr. Rohit Bhat, Adv.
Mr. Kabir Ghosh, Adv.

IAS 84 & 85 in CA 4060 Mr. R. Prabhakaran, Adv.
Mr. S. Beno Bencigar, Adv.
Ms. Maya Krishnan, Adv.
For Ms. Manju Jetley, Adv.

I.A.No.86 in CA 4060 Mr. Jasbir Singh Malik, Adv.
for Ms. Usha Nandini V., AOR

WP 883 Mr. Vijay Kumar, AOR

CA 4061 Mr. B. K. Satija, Adv.

CA 4063 & resp. Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR
in CA 2871

CA 4064 & 4065, TC(C) Mr. Puneet Jain, Adv.
1779-89 & res. For Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR
in SLP(C)30793, 4875

CA 2871, 2872, 2873, Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR
2874 & resp. in SLP

(C)16805 & WP(C)883

CA 4062 M/s. AP & J Chambers,AOR

SLP(C)28576,29875-76, Mr. Milind Kumar,AOR
30058-59,30089-90,
2203-2204 & resp. in
CA 2871,2872,2873,2874
SLP(C)16805 & WP(C)883

SLP(C) 16805 Ms. Manjula Gupta,AOR

SLP(C) 8037 Mr. Amit Pawan,AOR

SLP(C) 8926 M/s. Lawyer's Knit & Co.,AOR

RP(C) 1956 Mr. Prashant Bhushan,AOR

SLP(C)33075 & 33124 Mr. Rajiv Shankar Dvivedi,AOR

WP 490 & resp. in Mr. Ajay Choudhary,AOR
SLP(C)30089-90, 686

4

ac4060/09

For Respondent(s) Ms. Pinky Anand,ASG
UOI Mr. Ajay Sharma,Adv.
Mr. R.S. Nagar,Adv.
Ms. Rekha Pandey,Adv.
Ms. Sunita Sharma,Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma,Adv.
Mr. R.K. Rathore,Adv.
Mr. S.S. Rawat,Adv.
Mr. Ajay Kumar Singh,Adv.
Mr. M.P. Gupta,Adv.
Mr. Karan Seth,Adv.
Mr. Sanchit Kumar,Adv.
Mr. Rishabh Jain,Adv.
Mr. R.R. Rajesh,Adv.
For Mr. D.S. Mahra,AOR

For MCI Mr. Vikas Singh,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Sharma,AOR
Ms. Deepika Kalia,Adv.
Mr. Dhawal Mohan,Adv.
Mr. Prateek Bhatia,Adv.
Ms. Amandeep Kaur,Adv.
Mr. Kapeesh Seth,Adv.
Mr. Vara Gaur,Adv.

RP(C) 2159-2268 & Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha,Sr.Adv.
TC(C) 1 & 3 Mr. Ashwarya Sinha,AOR

State of M.P. Ms. Vibha Datta Makhija,Sr.Adv.
Mr. Mishra Saurabh,AOR
Mr. Ankit Kumar Lal,Adv.
Ms. Disha Vaish,Adv.

AFRC Mr. R.C. Kohli,AOR

CA 2873 & SLP(C) Ms. Mridula Ray Bharadwaj,AOR
20058-59 Mr. Ajit Kumar Gupta,Adv.

State of Odisha Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay,AOR

State of UP Mr. P.N. Misra,Sr.Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Abhishth Kumar, AOR

State of Chhattisgarh Mr. C.D. Singh, AOR (AAG)
Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, Adv.
Ms. Sylona Mohapatra, Adv.

State of Rajasthan Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
for Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

5

ac4060/09

Govt. of Puducherry Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR
Mr. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.

For CBSE Ms. Neelam Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Sharma, Adv.
for Mr. Tara Chandra Sharma, AOR

Christian Med. Coll. Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Krishna Srinivasan, Adv.
Mr. E.R. Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Geethi Aara, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
Mr. Anurag Tripathi, Adv.
For M/s. P.H. Parekh, AOR

Manipal Univ. Mr. L.R. Singh, AOR

CMC Ludhiana Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, Adv.

CA 2871 Mr. Ajay Choudhary, AOR

RP(C) 2159-2268 & Mr. C.S.N. Mohan Rao, AOR
RP(C) 1956 Mr. A. Ramesh, Adv.
Mr. Lokesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Syed Ahmad Naqvi, Adv.
Ms. Shilpi Gupta, Adv.

RP(C) 2159-2268 Mr. V. Giri, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Subramonium Prasad, Sr. Adv.
Mr. B. Balaji, AOR
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.

TP(C) 1779-80 & Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR
SLP(C) 4875 Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv.
Ms. Deepshikha Bharti, Adv.
Ms. Rita Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, Adv.
Mr. Arpit Rai, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay K. Agrawal, AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar, AOR

6

ac4060/09

Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, AOR
Ms. Punam Kumari, AOR
Mr. Prem Sunder Jha, AOR
Mr. C.K. Sucharita, AOR
Ms. Charu Mathur, AOR
Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR
Mr. Suresh Chandra Tripathy, AOR
Dr. Sushil Balwada, AOR
Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I, AOR
Mr. K.K. Mani, AOR
Mr. Ramesh Babu M.R., AOR
Mr. Ravindra Keshavrao Adsure, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

C.A.Nos.4060,4061,4062,4063,4064 & 4065 of 2009 :

Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, learned senior counsel, resumed his arguments from 10.45 a.m. to 11.15 a.m. Then, Mr. Saurabh Mishra, learned counsel, made his submissions till 11.15 a.m. Then, Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned senior counsel, addressed the Court from 11.30 to 12.50 p.m. Then, Mr. Vikas Singh made his submissions for few minutes. Thereafter, Dr. Rajeev Dhawan, resumed his arguments and concluded at 4.00 p.m.

Hearing concluded.
Judgment reserved.

I.A Nos.67-68 in C.A.No.4060 of 2009 :

The learned counsel appearing for the applicants seeks permission to withdraw these applications as on the same subject he had already approached the High Court.

7

ac4060/09

Permission is granted.

The applications are accordingly disposed of as withdrawn.

I.A.No.83/2015 in C.A.No.4060 of 2009 &

List this application tomorrow, i.e., on 17th March, 2016, for orders.

I.A Nos.87 & 88 of 2016 in C.A.No.4060/2009 :

Ms. Pragati Neekhara, learned counsel appearing for the applicants, has fairly submitted that these applications are premature, therefore, seeks permission to withdraw these applications with a liberty to approach the appropriate forum at an appropriate time.

Permission is granted.

The applications are accordingly disposed of as

withdrawn.

C.A.Nos.2871, 2872, 2873 & 2874 of 2007, SLP(C)Nos. 28576, 29875-76, 30058-59, 30089-90 of 2009, 686, 2203-4, & 16805 of 2010, 8037, 8926 & 23925 of 2011 and 33075 & 33124 of 2013 and W.P.Nos.490/2014 & 883/2013 :

De-tagged.

S.L.P.(Civil) No.30793 of 2012 :

As the present special leave petition has been filed against the interim order, we are not inclined to entertain the petition particularly when the issue has become infructuous. The special leave petition is accordingly dismissed as such.

Transfer Petition (Civil) No.1779-1789 of 2013

The transfer Petitions are disposed of as withdrawn in terms of the signed order.

8

ac4060/09

S.L.P.(Civil)No.4875 of 2013

By efflux of time, this petition has become infructuous. The special leave petition is dismissed as such.

R.P.No.1956/2013 in T.C.(C)No.101/2012 and R.P.(C) Nos.2159-2268/2013 & 2048-2157/2013 in T.C.(C)Nos.98-105, 107-108, 110-139, 142, 144-145 of 2012 & 1-5, 7-25, 28-49, 53, 58-73, 75-76 & 107-108 of 2013 :

List these matters tomorrow, i.e, on 17 th March, 2016.

(Anita Malhotra
Court Master

(Sarita Purohit)
Court Master

(Sneh Bala Mehra)
Assistant Registrar

(Signed order in TP(C)Nos.1779-1789/2013 is placed on the file)

9