

ITEM NO.40

COURT NO.4

SECTION PIL(W)

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(s) (Civil) No(s). 142/2006

VIPLAV SHARMA

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln.(s) for directions and modification of court's order and urgency and office report) (For Final Disposal)

WITH

W.P.(C) No. 349/2009

W.P.(C) No. 30/2010

(With appln.(s) for early hearing and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 152/2010

(With appln.(s) for directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 156/2010

(With appln.(s) for permission to file additional documents and permission to file synopsis and list of dates and directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 177/2010

(With appln.(s) for permission to file additional documents and permission to file synopsis and list of dates and directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 191/2010

(With Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 194/2010

(With Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 217/2010

(With appln.(s) for permission to file additional documents and permission to file rejoinder affidavit and permission and directions and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 119/2011

(With appln.(s) for stay and clarification of court's order and directions and Office Report)

Date : 19/02/2016 This petition was called on for hearing today.

CORAM : HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE DIPAK MISRA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SHIVA KIRTI SINGH

For Petitioner(s) Mr. Sanjay R., Adv.
Mr. S. Nithin, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I, AOR

WP 30/10 Mr. Amit Anand Tiwari, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Raghuvanshi, Adv.
Mr. Abhinandan Banerjee, Adv.

WP 152/10 Mr. R. Ayyam Perumal, AOR
Ms. Enakshi Mukhopadhyay, Adv.

WP 156/10 M/s. Lawyer S Knit & Co.

WP 191/10 Mr. R. Gopalakrishnan, AOR

WP 194/10 Mrs. Kriti Mishra, AOR

Mr. K.V. Vishwanathan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Raghavendra S. Srivatsa, AOR
Mr. Venkita Subramoniam, T.R., Adv.
Mr. Rahat Bansal, Adv.

For Respondent(s) Mr. Tushar Mehta, ASG
Mr. R. Balasubramaniam, Adv.
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Pranav Kumar, Adv.
Mr. M.P. Gupta, Adv.
Mr. R.R. Rajesh, Adv.
Ms. Binu Tamta., Adv.
Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Singh, Adv.
Mr. S.N. Terdal, Adv.
Mr. D.S. Mahra, Adv.
Mr. Prabhas Bajaj, Adv.
Mr. B.V. Balram Das, AOR

UGC Mr. Maninder Singh, ASG
Mr. Manoj Ranjan Sinha, Adv.
Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR

R.41 Mr. P.H. Parekh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Nitin T., Adv.
Ms. Himanjali Gautam, Adv.
For M/s. Parekh & Co.

WP 119/11 Dr. Rajeev Dhavan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Deepak Kanwar, Adv.
Mr. Sudhir Kumar Adv.
Mr. S. Vijay Kanth, Adv.
Mr. Ranjan Kumar Pandey, Adv.

Dr. Rajeev Dhavan, Adv.
Mr. Naveen R. Nath, Adv.
Mr. L.M. Bhat, Adv.

Mr. G. Ramakrishna Prasad, AOR

- R.23 Mr. A. Sharan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Vivek Singh, AOR
- Ms. Gunjan S. Jain, Adv.
Mr. Vivek O., Adv.
Mr. Vikas Soni, Adv.
For M/s. M.V. Kini & Associates
- R.24 Mr. R.S. Suri, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Pallavi Tayal Chadda, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Bauray, Adv.
Mr. Avinash Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR
- Jain University Mr. K.V. Viswanathan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Raghavendra S. Srivatsa, AOR
Mr. Rahat Bansal, Adv.
Mr. Amit A. Pai, Adv.
- Mr. P. Chidambaram, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv.
Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv.
Ms. Praseena Elizabeth Joseph, Adv.
Ms. Akanksha Mehra, Adv.
Ms. Shrinjan Khosla, Adv.
Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.
For M/s Lawyer's Knit & Co., Adv.
- MCI & AICTE Mr. Gaurav Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Anil Soni, Adv.
Mr. Dhawal Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Prateek Bhatia, Adv.
- Mr. Suyodhan Byrapaneni, Adv.
Mr. Mohd. Wasay Khan, Adv.
Ms. Filza Moonis, Adv.
Mr. Bharat J. Joshi, Adv.
Mr. G. Ramakrishna Prasad, AOR
- Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR
- Mr. V. Balaji, Adv.
Mr. MSM Asaithambi, Adv.
Mr. Atul Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Sripradha K., Adv.
Mr. Sahil Pahuja, Adv.
- Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR
- Mr. Anip Sachthey, AOR

Mr. P.N. Puri, AOR

Rajasthan Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Ishu Prayas, Adv.
Mr. Ruchi Kohli, Adv.

Mr. V. Prabhakar, Adv.
Mr. R. Chandrachud, AOR
Ms. Jyoti Parasher, Adv.

Mr. Mathai M. Paikaday, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shishir Pinaki, Adv.
Mr. Anas Shamnad, Adv.
Mr. Sanjay Jain, AOR

Mr. Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Adv.
Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR

Maharashtra Ms. Shubhada Phaltankar, Adv.
Mr. Nishant Kataneshwarkar, Adv.

Mr. Sanchar Anand, Adv.
Mr. Anant K. Vatsya, Adv.
Mr. Devendra Singh, AOR

Dr. Ashish Kumar Sharma, Adv.

R.34 Mr. K.K. Mani, AOR
Ms. T. Archana, Adv.

Mr. Mohinder Jit Singh, AOR

Tamil Nadu Mr. M. Yogesh Kanna, Adv.
Mr. Jayant Patel, Adv.

AICTE Mr. Navin Prakash, AOR

Dr. MGR Med. Uni. Mr. G. Umapathy, Adv.
Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, Adv.
Mr. R. Mekhala
Mr. Gowthaman, AOR

Telangana For M/s Palwai Venkat Law Associates

Dr. S.K. Verma, AOR

Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR

Mr. Amit Kumar, AOR

Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR

Mr. A. Subba Rao, Adv.
Mr. K.L.D.S. Vinober, Adv.

Mr. B. Mohan, AOR

Mr. C.D. Singh, AOR

Ms. Sylona Mohapatra, AOR

Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mr. E.M.S. Anam, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Agrawal, AOR

Mr. G.N. Reddy, AOR

Mr. K.V. Mohan, AOR

R.40

Dr. Rajeev Dhavan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Lakshmi Raman Singh, AOR

R.19

Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S. Venkatesh, Adv.
Ms. Deepika Kalia, Adv.
Mr. Anuj P. Agarwala, Adv.
Mr. Shashank Khurana, Adv.
Mr. Kapish Seth, Adv.
Mr. Lakshmi Raman Singh, AOR

Mr. M.R. Shamshad, AOR
Mr. I.P. Singh, Adv.
Mr. Vaibhav Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Nikhilesh Ramachandran, AOR
Mr. Pawan Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Pashupati Nath Razdan, AOR

Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR

Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR

Mr. P. Vinay Kumar, AOR

Mr. Santosh Kumar Tripathi, AOR

Mr. S. Chandra Shekhar, AOR

Mrs. D. Bharathi Reddy, AOR

Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Mr. Shrish Kumar Misra, AOR

Mrs. Kirti Renu Mishra, AOR
Ms. Apurva Upmanyu, Adv.

Mr. S.N. Bhat, AOR

Mr. S. Thananjayan, AOR

Mr. V. Balachandran, AOR

Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR

Mr. Vishwajit Singh, AOR

Mr. V.N. Raghupathy, AOR

Ms. Anitha Shenoy, AOR

Mr. Ajay Kumar Misra, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, Adv.
Mr. Kumar Anurag Singh, Adv.
Ms. Anuradha D. Mishra, Adv.
M/s Anuradha & Associates

Ms. Charu Mathur, AOR

M/s Fox Mandal & Co.

Gujarat

Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR
Ms. Jesal Wahi, Adv.
Ms. Vinakshi Kadan, Adv.
Ms. Nigar Khan, Adv.
Ms. Puja Singh, Adv.

Ms. N. Annapoorani, AOR

Ms. Shubhangi Tuli, AOR

Ms. S. Usha Reddy, AOR

Ms. Sushma Suri, AOR

Mr. Arjun Harkauli, AOR

Mr. Bimlesh Kumar Singh, AOR

Haryana

Mr. Devender Kumar Saini, AAG Haryana
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR
Ms. Prerna Ajmani, Adv.

Mr. S.K. Arora, AOR

	Mr. Himanshu Gupta, AOR
PRIST, Vinayaka Mission	Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR
Himachal Pradesh	Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR
	Mr. Ashok K. Mahajan, AOR
W.P. (C) No.142/2006	Mr. Mahendra Jeet Singh Rupal, AOR
	Mr. Devender Singh, Adv.
	Mr. Anant K. Vatsya, Adv.
	Mr. Narsingh Narain Rai, Adv.
	Mr. Amitesh Kumar, Adv.
	Mr. Shashank Shekhar, Adv.
AP	Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, Adv.
	Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.
Puducherry	Mr. V.G. Pragasam, Adv.
	Mr. S. Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.
R.43	Mr. R. Ayyam Perumal, Adv.
	Ms. Anakshi Mukhopadhyay, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

On the last occasion, i.e., 08.09.2015, the Court, after referring to its earlier orders, had directed as follows :

"Having heard the learned counsel for the parties, it is directed that the NAAC shall not insist on 2010 Regulations and shall proceed forthwith and the universities are directed to send self appraisal format by filling it up appropriately sans the said undertaking, within a period of ten days. The NAAC shall take up the matter as expeditiously as possible, and should decide the grant of accreditation within a period of eight weeks therefrom. The deficiency shall be sent by e-mail to the Universities so that the process is expedited.

Needless to say, any action taken by the NAAC *in praesenti*, shall be subject to the result of the writ petition.

We have been told at the Bar that seven universities, who were granted time by the University Grants Commission to remove the defects, have already done so. If that is the position, they can submit an application before the NAAC to obtain the requisite form and can send the self-appraisal report. We do not intend to say anything on the said score. We hope that the authorities of NAAC shall act with quite promptitude and not seek further adjournment or extension of time."

Mr. Maninder Singh, learned Additional Solicitor General appearing for the University Grant Commission and National Assessment and Accreditation Council (NAAC), submitted that in pursuance of the order passed by this Court, the NAAC has made an evaluation and put it on the internet. The assessment report submitted by the NAAC reads as follows :

"National Assessment And Accreditation Council

List of Deemed to be Universities Recommended for Accreditation by NAAC in its 71st meeting of Executive Committee (16th November 2015).

The following Thirty Eight (38) Deemed to be Universities have been assessed and accredited by NAAC in compliance with the order dated 8.9.2015 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in Writ Petition (Civil) No.142 of 2006. The Accreditation outcome of NAAC is subject to the result of the Writ Petition.

No.	Name of the Institution	State	CGPA	Grade
1	Vignan's Foundation for Science, Technology and Research, Vadlamudi	Andhra Pradesh	3.02	A
2	Sumandeep Vidyapeeth Vadodara	Gujarat	3.53	A
3	Lingaya's University, Faridabad	Haryana	2.42	B
4	Maharshi Markandeshwar	Haryana	3.06	A

	University, Mullana-Ambala			
5	Manav Rachna International University, Faridabad	Haryana	3.05	A
6	BLDE University, Vijayapur	Karnataka	2.90	B
7	Christ University, Bangalore	Karnataka	2.85	B
8	Jain University, Bangalore	Karnataka	2.63	B
9	Sri Devaraj Urs Academy of Higher Education and Research, Kolar	Karnatak	2.66	B
10	Sri Siddhartha Academy of Higher Education, Tumkur	Karnataka	3.01	A
11	Yenepoya University, Mangalore	Karnataka	3.14	A
12	Krishna Institute of Medical Science, Karad	Maharashtra	3.20	A
13*	Tilak Maharashtra Vidyapeeth, Pune	Maharashtra	2.13	B
14*	Siksha 'O' Anusandhan University, Bhubaneshwar	Orissa	3.35	A
15	Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth, Pondicherry	Pondicherry	3.11	A
16	Institute of Advanced Studies in Education, Sardarshahar	Rajasthan	2.50	B
17*	Janardan Rai Nagar Rajasthan Vidyapeeth, Udaipur	Rajasthan	2.84	B
18	Academy of Maritime Education and Training (AMET), Chennai	Tamil Nadu	2.42	B
19*	Bharath Institute of Higher Education and	Tamil Nadu	3.20	A

	Research (University), Chennai			
20*	Chettinad Academy of Research and Education, Chennai	Tamil Nadu	3.10	A
21*	Dr. M.G.R. Educational and Research Institute, Chennai	Tamil Nadu	2.94	B
22*	Kalasalingam Academy of Research and Education, Srivilliputhur	Tamil Nadu	3.11	A
23	Karpagam Academy of Higher Education, Coimbatore	Tamil Nadu	2.10	B
24	Meenakshi Academy of Higher Education and Research, Chennai	Tamil Nadu	2.41	B
25	Noorul Islam Centre for Higher Education, Thuckalay	Tamil Nadu	3.06	A
26*	Periyar Maniammai Institute of Science and Technology, Thanjavur	Tamil Nadu	2.66	B
27	Ponnaiyah Ramajayam Institute of Science & Technology, Thanjavur	Tamil Nadu	2.95	B
28	Saveetha Institute of Medical and Technical Sciences, Chennai	Tamil Nadu	3.02	A
29	St. Peter's Institute of Higher Education and Research, Chennai	Tamil Nadu	2.52	B
30	Vels Institute of Science, Technology and Advanced Studies (Vistas), Chennai	Tamil Nadu	2.58	B
31	Vel Tech Rangarajan Dr Sagunthala R&D	Tamil Nadu	3.17	A

	Institute of Science and Technology, Chennai			
32	Vinayaka Mission's Research Foundation, Salem	Tamil Nadu	2.73	B
33	Graphic Era University, Dehradun	Uttarakhand	3.23	A
34*	Gurukula Kangri Vishwavidyalaya, Haridwar	Uttarakhand	3.13	A
35	Jaypee Institute of Information Technology, Noida	Uttar Pradesh	2.90	B
36	Nehru Gram Bharti University, Allahabad	Uttar Pradesh	1.51	C
37	Santosh University, Ghaziabad	Uttar Pradesh	2.56	B
38	Shobhit Institute of Engineering and Technology, Meerut	Uttar Pradesh	2.12	B

*2nd Cycle"

As advised at present, we are inclined to direct that the accreditation given by the NAAC shall come into effect. Liberty is granted to the petitioners as well as to the universities who are not satisfied with the accreditation given by the NAAC to file objections. It is also open to the Union of India to put forth its stand in respect of the NAAC assessment.

Let the matter be listed on 19.04.2016.

(Gulshan Kumar Arora)
Court Master

(H.S. Parasher)
Court Master