

~C1

ITEM NO.701

COURT NO.1

SECTION XVI

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.37/1992

ABHIRAM SINGH

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

C.D. COMMACHEN (DEAD) BY LRS.& ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln.(s) for impleadment and intervention and office report)

WITH

C.A. No. 8339/1995

(With appln.(s) for impleadment and intervention and office report)

Date : 25/10/2016 These appeals were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE MADAN B. LOKUR

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE S.A. BOBDE

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE UDAY UMESH LALIT

HON'BLE DR. JUSTICE D.Y. CHANDRACHUD

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE L. NAGESWARA RAO

For Appellant(s) Mr. Arvind P. Datar, Sr. Adv.

(CA NO.37/1992) Mr. Abhay Anand Jena, Adv.

Ms. Bina Gupta, AOR

Mr. Ranjit B. Raut, Adv.

Ms. Surbhi Kapoor, Adv.

Mr. Sarthak Mehrotra, Adv.

(CA No.8339/1995) Mr. Anoop G. Choudhari, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Mohit Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Sumeeta Chaudhari, Adv.

Mrs. Shiraz Contractor Patodia, AOR

For Respondent(s)/

Applicant(s)

(CA No.37/1992) Mr. B.A. Desai, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Kapil Sibbal, Sr. Adv. (for R-5)

Mr. Salman Khurshid, Sr. Adv. (for R-3)

Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR

Mr. Imtiaz Ahmed, Adv.

Mr. Antony R. Julian, Adv.

Ms. Gitanjali Kapur, Adv.

Mr. Aadil Singh Boparai, Adv.

Mr. Arpit Shukla, Adv.

2

Mr. Koshy John, Adv.

Mr. Nizam Pasha, Adv.

Ms. Anusha Nagarajan, Adv.

Mr. Adit Pujari, Adv.

Mr. Raghav Tankha, Adv.

Ms. Neha Sangwan, Adv.

Ms. Kumud Lata Das, Adv.

Mr. Ravi Aggarwal, Adv.

(I.A.No.11) Mr. Mohd. Shahid Hussain, Adv.

Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR

(I.A.No.13) Mr. A.N.S. Nadkarni, ASG

Mr. Nishant R. Katneshwarkar, AOR.

Mr. Salvador Santosh Rebello, Adv.

Mr. Arpit Rai, Adv.

(I.A.No.14) Ms. Indira Jaising, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR.

Ms. Payal Bahl, Adv.

Ms. Rajshree Bhatnagar, Adv.

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Mayank Sapra, Adv.

Ms. Mehek Dev, Adv.

Mr. Rohit Ghosh, Adv.

Ms. Josita Rai, Adv.

(I.A. No.15) Mr. C.S. Vaidyanathan, Sr.Adv.
Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR
(I.A. No.16) Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. M.N. Krishnamani, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Merusagar Samantary, AOR
Ms. Viddusshi, Adv.
Mr. Pushpender Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sayooj Mohandas, Adv.
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Pranav Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Shood, Adv.
Mr. Vikramjit Banerji, Adv.
Mr. Bhaskar Goutam, Adv.
Mr. Bhaktivardan, Adv.
(I.A. No.17) Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, AOR
Ms. Ankita Chaudhary, Adv.
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.
(I.A. No.18) Ms. Swarupama Chaturvedi, AOR
Mr. B.N. Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Kumar Gaurav, Adv.
Mr. R.K. Singh, Adv.

3

(I.A. No.19) Mr. Prakash Kumar Singh, AOR
(I.A. No.20) Mr. Tushar Mehta, ASG
Ms. Aishwarya Bhatia, Adv.
Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR
(I.A. No.21) Mr. R.P. Goyal, AOR
(I.A. No.22) Mr. Sanjay R. Hegde, Sr. Adv.
Mr. P.V. Dinesh, AOR
Ms. Sindhu T.P., Adv.
Mr. Bineesh K., Adv.
Mr. S. Nithin, Adv.
Mr. Pranjal Kishore, Adv.
Mr. Atul Vinod Shankar, Adv.
Mr. R. Beniwal, Adv.
Mr. Soli J. Sorabjee, Sr. Adv.
Dr. Manish Singhvi, Adv.
Mr. Atul Jha, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep Jha, Adv.
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, Adv.

(C.A.No.8339/1995) Mr. Shyam Divan, Sr.Adv.
Mr. Udayaditya Banerjee, Adv.
Mrs. Samiksha Godiyal, Adv.
Mr. Akshay Puranik, Adv.
Mr. Vikramjit Banerjee, Adv.

Mr. Nachiketa Joshi, AOR

Ms. Sucheta Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Ritwiz Rishabh, Adv.
Mr. Vadrevu Pattabhi Ram, Adv.
For Applicant(s) Mr. Tushar Mehta, ASG
(I.A.No.7) Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav, AAG
Mr. Anuradha Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Arjun Garg, AOR
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
Mr. Manish Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Ishan Nagar, Adv.
Mr. C.D. Singh, Adv.
Ms. Sylona Mohapatra, Adv.
(I.A.NO.6) Prof. Bhim Singh, Sr.Adv.
Mr. Ajay Kumar Singh, AOR
Mr. Durg Vijay Singh, Adv.
Mr. Balwant Singh, Adv.
Mr. Ram Shiromani Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Prakash Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Sheenu Chauhan, Adv.
Mr. Sujeet Kumar Singh, Adv.

4
(I.A. No.8) Mr. Tushar Mehta, ASG
Ms. Aishwarya Bhatia, Adv.
Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR
Mr. Pankaj Pandey, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

Mr. Shyam Divan, learned senior counsel appearing for the respondent in C.A. No.8339 of 1995 resumed his arguments at 10.30 a.m. and concluded at 12.30 p.m. Then, Mr. Anoop G. Chaudhuri, learned senior counsel appearing for the appellant in C.A. No.8339 of 1995 started his submissions and concluded at 3.00 p.m. Thereafter, Mr. B.A. Desai, learned senior counsel appearing for the respondents in C.A. No.37 of 1992 started his submissions and was on his legs when the Court rose for the day leaving the matters part-heard.

List the matters tomorrow (26.10.2016) as part-heard matters.

* * * * *

ITEM NO.701 COURT NO.1 SECTION XVI
S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.37/1992
ABHIRAM SINGH

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

C.D. COMMACHEN (DEAD) BY LRS.& ORS. Respondent(s)
(With appln.(s) for impleadment and intervention and officer report)

5

WITH
C.A. No. 8339/1995
(With appln.(s) for impleadment and intervention and office report)

Date : 26/10/2016 These appeals were called on for hearing today.

CORAM & APPEARANCE: SAME AS ABOVE

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

Mr. B.A. Desai, learned senior counsel resumed his submissions at 10.30 a.m. and concluded at 11.25 p.m. Then, Mr. Kapil Sibal, learned senior counsel appearing for Respondent No.5 in C.A. No.37 of 1992 started his submissions and concluded at 4.00 p.m.

List the matters tomorrow (27.10.2016) as part-heard matters.

* * * * *

ITEM NO.701 COURT NO.1 SECTION XVI
S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No.37/1992
ABHIRAM SINGH

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

C.D. COMMACHEN (DEAD) BY LRS.& ORS. Respondent(s)
(With appln.(s) for impleadment and intervention and office report)

WITH
C.A. No. 8339/1995
(With appln.(s) for impleadment and intervention and office report)

Date : 27/10/2016 These appeals were called on for hearing today.

CORAM & APPEARANCE: SAME AS ABOVE

6

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

Mr. Salman Khurshid, learned senior counsel appearing for Respondent No.3 in C.A. No.37 of 1992 started his submissions at 10.30 a.m. and concluded at 12.10 p.m. Then, Ms. Indira Jaising, learned senior counsel appearing for the applicant in I.A. No.14 started her

submissions and concluded at 2.30 p.m. Thereafter, Mr. Tushar Mehta, learned Additional Solicitor General appearing for applicant(s) in I.A. No.20 in C.A. No.37 of 1992 and I.A. Nos.7 and 8 in C.A. No.8339 of 1995 made his submissions up to 3.05 p.m. Then, Mr. C.S. Vaidyanathan, learned senior counsel appearing for the applicant in I.A. No.15, Mr. A.N.S. Nadkarni, learned Additional Solicitor General appearing for applicant in I.A. No.13 and Mr. Sanjay R. Hegde, learned senior counsel appearing for applicant in I.A. No.22 made their submissions for a few minutes.

Mr. Arvind P. Datar, learned senior counsel made his reply submissions up to 3.50 p.m. Then, Mr. K.K. Venugopal, learned senior counsel appearing for the applicant in I.A. No.16 made his submissions for a few minutes. Thereafter, Mr. Shyam Divan, learned senior counsel concluded his reply submissions at 4.10 p.m.

Arguments concluded.

Judgment reserved.

7

Applications for impleadment and intervention are allowed.

Written submissions, if any, be filed within one week.

(Charanjeet Kaur) (Shashi Sareen) (Sanjay Kumar-I)

AR-cum-PS AR-cum-PS AR-cum-PS

(Mahabir Singh) (Tapan K. Chakraborty) (Veena Khera)

Court Master Court Master Court Master

(Meenakshi Kohli) (Ashok Raj Singh)

Court Master Court Master