

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Petition(s) for Special Leave to Appeal (Civil) No(s).16308/2007

(From the judgement and order dated 29/08/2007 in CWP No.1966/2003 of The
HIGH COURT OF RAJASTHAN AT JAIPUR)

ANKUR GUTKHA

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

INDIAN ASTHAMA CARE SOCIETY & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln.(s) for directions and interim directions and intervention and
impleadment and urging addl.grounds and with prayer for interim relief and
office report)

With

SLP(C)No.16314/2007

(With appln.(s) for exemption from filing c/c of the impugned judgment and
with prayer for interim relief and office report)

SLP(C)No.16317/2007

(With appln.(s) for exemption from filing c/c of the impugned judgment and
with prayer for interim relief and office report)

SLP(C)No.19467-19469/2007

(With appln.(s) for directions and clarification and impleadment and
directions and exemption from filing O.T. and permission to file affidavit
and clarification/direction and seeking permission to raise grounds and
with prayer for interim relief and office report)

W.P.(C)No.131/2011(With office report)

W.P.(C)No.141/2011(With appln.(s) for permission to file addl.documents and
office report)

Conmt.Pet.(C)No.236/2011 In SLP(C) No.16308/2007(With office report)

W.P.(C)No.289/2011(With appln.(s) for directions and office report)

Conmt.Pet.(C)No.288/2011 In SLP(C) No.16308/2007

Conmt.Pet.(C)No.348/2011 In SLP(C) No.19467-19469/2007

Conmt.Pet.(C)No.356/2011 In SLP(C) No.16308/2007

W.P.(C)No.344/2011

W.P.(C)No.69/2011

(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and office report)

Contempt Petition) No.37/2012 in SLP 16308/2007

W.P.(C) No.182/2011(With office report)

W.P.(C) No.354/2011

(With appln.(s) for interim relief and office report)

W.P.(C) No.330/2011

(With appln.(s) for interim relief and office report)

W.P.(C) No. 304 of 2011

(with appln(s) for amendment of the petition and office report)

SLP(C) NO. 28716 of 2012

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

SLP(C) NO. 32162 of 2012

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

SLP(C) NO. 32163 of 2012

(With office report)

SLP(C) Nos. 4165-4166 of 2013

(With office report)

T.P.(C) NO. 1147-1152 of 2012

(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)

T.P.(C) NO. 1277 of 2012

(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)

T.P.(C) NO. 872 of 2013

(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)

W.P(C) NO. 147 of 2013

(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)

T.P.(C) NO. 1223 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1245 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1259 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1281 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1297 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1298 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1299 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
W.P(C) NO. 572 of 2013
(With office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1312 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1326 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1332 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)
T.P.(C) NO. 1344 of 2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and office report)

Date: 31/10/2013 These Petitions were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE G.S. SINGHVI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE C. NAGAPPAN

Amicus

Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Anubhav Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Satyakam, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Tewari, Adv.
Dr. Vikrant Vasudeva, Adv.
Mr. T.A. Rehman, Adv.
Mr. Jigar Patel, Adv.
Mr. Nishit Agrawal, Adv.

For Petitioner(s)

Mr. Ranjit Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Vivek Kohli, Adv.
Mr. N. Talwar, Adv.
Mrs. Shivambika Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Shwatank Tripathi, Adv.
Mr. Subramonium Prasad, AOR
Mr. Sudhir Chandra, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sanjai Kumar Pathak, AOR
Mr. B.S. Rajesh, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Jay Kishor Singh, AOR

Mr. K.C. Dua, AOR

Mr. Suraj Govindraaj, Adv.
Mr. Abhay A. Jena, Adv.
Ms. Bina Gupta, AOR
Mr. Ranjit Rauf, Adv.

Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury, AOR

Mr. Shiv Prakash Pandey, AOR

Mr. P.S. Sudheer, AOR

Ms. Aparna Jha, AOR

Mr. Arun K. Sinha, Adv.

Mr.Sumit Sinha, Adv.

Mr. D.N. Goburdhan, AOR
Mr.Prabal Bagchi, Adv.
Mr.Abhishek Agrawal, Adv.

Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR

Mr.Joseph Pookkai Adv.
Mr.Prashant Kumar, AOR

For Respondent(s)

Ms.Indira Jaising, ASG
Mr.Ranjit Kumar, Adv.
Ms.Sonakshi Malhan, Adv.
Ms.Sushma Suri, AOR

Mr.Ram Jethmalani, Sr.Adv.

Mr.Mukul Rohatgi, Sr.Adv.
Mr.Vivek Kohli, Adv.
Mr.N.Talwar, Adv.
Ms.Shivambika Sinha, Adv.
Mr.Venkata Subramoniam T.R., Adv.

Mr.Ranjit Kumar, Sr.Adv.
Mr.Vivek Kohli, Adv.
Mr.N.Talwar, Adv.
Ms.Shivambika Sinha, Adv.
Mr.Shwetank Tripathi, Adv.
Mr.Subramonium Prasad, Adv.

Mr.Mukul Rohatgi, Sr.Adv.
Mr.Saurabh Kirpal, Adv.
Mr.Sanjay Aggarwal, Adv.
Ms.Ranjeeta Rohatgi, Adv.

Mr.R.S.Suri, Sr.Adv.
Mr.Rahul Malhotra, Adv.
Ms.Simar Suri, Adv.
Mr.Varun Chopra, Adv.

Mr.V.A.Mohta, Sr.Adv.
Mr.Shashibhushan P.Adgaonkar, Adv.
Mr.Nakuk Mohta, Adv.
Mr.Nilkanta Nayak, Adv.
Mr.Ashok Kumar Gupta-II, Adv.

Mr.Vishwanathan Shetty, Sr.Adv.
Mr.K.N.Bhat, Sr.Adv.
Mr.Basava Prabhu S.Patil, Sr.Adv.
Mr.S.Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv.
Ms.Bina Madhavan, Adv.
Ms.Praseena E.Joseph, Adv.

Mr.K.N.Bhat, Sr.Adv.
Mr.V.N.Raghupathy, AOR
Mr.Anantanarayana M.G., Adv.

Mr.Ashok Kumar Panda, Sr.Adv.
Mr.Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR
Mr.Satyabrata Panda, Adv.
Mr.Lingaraj Sarangi, Adv.

Mr.B.Balaji, Adv.
Mr.Rakesh Sharma, Adv.
Mr.Anand Sathiyaseelan, Adv.

For Intervenor

Mr.Prashant Bhushan, Adv.
Mr.Pranav Sachdeva, Adv.

Mr.Yasir Rauf, Adv.
Ms.Priyanka Mathur, Adv.
Mr.S.N.Terdal, Adv.

Mr.Jitendra Mohan Sharma, Adv.
Mr.Pahlad Singh Sharma, Adv.
Mr.Sameer Singh, Adv.
Mr.Nitin Singh, Adv.

Mr.A.Mariarputham, Adv.Genl.
Mrs.Aruna Mathur, Adv.
Mr.Yusuf, Adv.

Mr.Manjit Singh, AAG
Mr.Tarjit Singh, Adv.
Mr.Vinay Kuhar, Adv.
Mr.Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR

Mr.Balasubramaniam, Adv.
Mr.K.V.Jagdishvaran, Adv.
Ms.G.Indira, Adv.

Mr.Vishnu Behari Tewari, Adv.
Mr.Raj Kishor Choudhary, Adv.
Mr.Pamarty Venkataramana, Adv.
Mr.Shivam Sharma, Adv.
Mr.Ravi Kumar Tomar, Adv.

For State of Goa

Ms.Bansuri Swaraj, Adv.
Dr.Monika Gusain, AOR

For State of U.P.

Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AAG
Mr.Ashutosh Kr.Sharma, Adv.
Mr.Gaurav Dhingra, Adv.

Ms.K.Enatoli Sema, Adv.

Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran,AOR

Mr.Shubham Bhalla, Adv.
Mr.Ritesh Khatri,Adv.

Dr.R.R.Deshpande, AOR

Mr.Kudan Kumar Mishra, Adv.
Mr.Arik Taloh, Adv.

Ms.Krishna Sarma, AAG
Mr.Riku Sarma, Adv.
Mr.Navnit Kumar, Adv.

Mr.Anil Kumar Jha, AOR
Mr.Anip Sachthey, Adv.
Mr.Saakaar Sardana, Adv.

Mr.Ravi Kumar Tomar, AOR

Mr.N.Ganpathy, AOR

Mr.Ashok Kumar Gupta II, AOR

Mr.Prashant Bhushan, Adv.
Mr.Pranav Sachdeva, Adv.

Mr.S.Aravindh, Adv.

Mr.Laxmi Narayan, Adv.
Mr.Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR

Mrs.Shally Bhasin Maheshwari, AOR

Mr.Vikas Mehta, AOR

Mr.Shiv Prakash Pandey, AOR

Mr.Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR

Ms.Praveena Gautam, AOR

Mr.Ajay Arora, Adv.
Mr.Kapil, Adv.
Mr.Praveen Swarup, AOR

Mr.K.B.Rohatgi, Adv.
Mr.Mahesh Kasana, Adv.
Ms.Aparna Rohatgi Jain, Adv.

Mr.P.Parmeswaran, AOR

Mr.Saptam Biswajit Meitei, Adv.
Mr.Khwairakpam Nobin Singh, AOR

Mr.Rudreshwar Singh, Adv.
Mr.Samir Ali Khan, Adv.

Mr.Rohit K.Singh, Adv.
Mr.Alok Kumar, AOR

Mr.Pradeep Misra, AOR

Mr.Sunil Fernandes, AOR

Mr.Vijay Panjwani, AOR

Mr.L.C.Agrawala, AOR

Mr.Jagjit Singh Chhabra, AOR

Mr.Mukesh Verma, Adv.
Mr.Pawan Kumar Shukla, Adv.
Mr.Yash Pal Dhingra, AOR

Mr.Surya Kant, AOR

Mr.Nikhil Nayyar, AOR

Mr.Tapesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Kumar Anurag Singh, Adv.
Mohd.Waquas, Adv.

Mr.Pragyan Sharma, Adv.
Ms.Heshu Kayina, Adv.

Mr.Anil Shrivastav, Adv.
Mr.Rituraj Biswas, Adv.

Mr.Gopal Singh, Adv.
Mr.Ritu Raj Biswas, Adv.

Ms.C.K.Sucharita, AOR

Mr.M.Yogesh Kanna, Adv.
Ms.Vanita Chandrakant Giri, Adv.
Mr.A.Shanta Kumar, Adv.

Mr.M.Shoeb Alam, Adv.
Ms.Hemantika Wahi, AOR
Mr.Apoorv Kurup, Adv.
Mr.Aniruddha P.Mayee, AOR
Mr.Charudatta Mahindarkar, Adv.
Mr.Suryanarayana Singh, AAG
Ms.Pragati Neekra, AOR
Mr.Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR
Mr.Amit Agrawal, Adv.
Mr.V.G.Pragasam, Adv.
Mr.S.J.Aristotle, Adv.
Mr.Praburamasubramanian, Adv.
Ms.Shalini Chandra, Adv.
Ms.Swati Chandra, Adv.
Mr.Sudanshu Saran, Adv.
Mr.Ramesh Babu M.R., AOR
Ms.Yogmaya Agnihotri, Adv.
Ms.Purnima Bhat, AOR
Mr.Aditya Singh, Adv.
Mr.Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR
Ms.Sandhya Goswami, AOR
Mr.Ritesh Kumar, AOR
Mr.Milind Kumar, AOR
Ms.Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR
Mr.Pahlad Singh Sharma, AOR
Mr.B.D.Sharma, AOR
Mr.Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR
Ms.Meera Mathur, AOR
Mr.Abhay Kumar, AOR
Ms.Mridula Ray Bhardwaj, AOR
Mr.Ameen Jauhar, Adv.
Mr.Dheeraj Nair, AOR
Mr.Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR
Ms.A.Sumathi, AOR
Ms.Vanshaja Shukla, Adv.
Mr.Mishra Saurabh, Adv.
Mr.G.V.Chandrashekar, Adv.
Mr.N.K.Verma, Adv.
Ms.Anjana Chandrashekar, Adv.

UPON hearing counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

At the threshold of further hearing of the matters, Shri Rakesh Dwivedi, learned senior counsel appearing for the petitioner in WP(C)No.289 of 2011 made a request that he may be allowed to address the Court.

As requested by Shri Dwivedi, we took up WP(C)No.289 of 2011. After going through the prayer made in the writ petition filed in the name of public interest litigation, we enquired from the learned senior counsel as to how relief in terms of prayer 'b' can be granted without hearing those who are likely to be affected by acceptance of the prayer made in the writ petition. Thereupon, Shri Dwivedi made a request that his client may be granted leave to implead all or at least some of the persons who are likely to be affected by acceptance of the prayer made in the writ petition.

The request of the learned senior counsel is accepted.

Put up as soon as an application for impleadment of the necessary parties is filed.

Liberty is also given to the petitioner to correct the description of the parties already impleaded.

All the IAs for intervention and impleadment are allowed.

Learned counsel for the impleaded parties are allowed two weeks' time to file their affidavits.

At the commencement of hearing, Shri Ranjit Kumar, learned senior counsel appearing for some of the parties requested that in view of the direction given by Hon'ble the Chief Justice of

India, the transfer petitions have been listed before this Bench and the same may be disposed of before other issues are taken up. However, as the learned counsel for the petitioner in the transfer petitions is not ready and seeks time on the ground that he was unaware of the fact that the matter will be taken up today, the transfer petitions are adjourned to 01.11.2013.

List the other cases on 13.11.2013.

(Satish K.Yadav)
Court Master

(Phoolan Wati Arora)
Court Master