

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Transfer Case (Civil) No(s). 1/2010

CENTRAL ARECANUT MARKETING CORPN.& ORS.

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA

Respondent(s)

WITH

T.C.(C) No. 6/2010

T.C.(C) Nos. 12-14/2014

T.C.(C) No. 15/2014

T.C.(C) No. 16/2014

W.P.(C) No. 344/2011

W.P.(C) No. 330/2011

(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.C.(C) No. 95/2012

(With appln.(s) for impleadment and intervention)

T.C.(C) No. 10/2014

T.C.(C) No. 11/2014

W.P.(C) No. 141/2011

(With appln.(s) for permission to file additional documents and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 354/2011

(With appln.(s) for amendment of the petition and interim relief and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 572/2013

(With office report)

W.P.(C) No. 289/2011

(With appln.(s) for directions and intervention and Office Report)

W.P.(C) No. 69/2011

(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and Office Report)

T.C.(C) No. 9/2014

SLP(C) No. 16308/2007

(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and interim directions and intervention and urging addl. grounds and Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C) Nos. 19467-19469/2007

(With appln.(s) for clarification and clarification/direction and exemption from filing O.T., impleadment and permission to file affidavit and seeking permission to raise additional grounds and interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 16314/2007

(With appln.(s) for exemption from filing c/c of the impugned judgment and Interim Relief and Office Report)

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

CONMT.PET.(C) No. 348/2011 In SLP(C) Nos. 19467-19469/2007

SLP(C) No. 16317/2007

(With appln.(s) for exemption from filing c/c of the impugned judgment and Interim Relief and Office Report)

CONMT.PET.(C) No. 37/2012 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007

CONMT.PET.(C) No. 288/2011 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007

CONMT.PET.(C) No. 236/2011 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007

(With Office Report)

CONMT.PET.(C) No. 356/2011 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007

W.P.(C) No. 304/2011

(With appln.(s) for Amendment of the petition and Office Report)

T.C.(C) No. 4/2010

T.C.(C) No. 18/2014

SLP(C) Nos. 4165-4166/2013

(With Office Report)

T.P.(C) No. 144/2015

(With Office Report)

T.C.(C) No. 21/2014

T.C.(C) No. 22/2014

T.C.(C) No. 8/2016

T.C.(C) No. 7/2016

T.C.(C) No. 6/2016
T.C.(C) No. 5/2016
T.C.(C) No. 2/2010
T.C.(C) No. 3/2010
W.P.(C) No. 131/2011
(With Office Report)
SLP(C) No. 32162/2012
(With Interim Relief and Office Report)
W.P.(C) No. 147/2013
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)
SLP(C) No. 32163/2012
(With Office Report)
T.C.(C) No. 5/2010
T.C.(C) No. 25/2010
(With appln.(s) for clarification and Stay)
T.C.(C) No. 20/2014
T.C.(C) No. 38/2014
T.C.(C) No. 36/2014
T.C.(C) No. 37/2014
T.C.(C) No. 19/2014
T.C.(C) No. 34/2014
T.C.(C) No. 33/2014
T.C.(C) No. 35/2014

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

3

SLP(C) No. 28716/2012
(With Interim Relief and Office Report)
W.P.(C) No. 182/2011
(With Office Report)
T.P.(C) No. 143/2015
(With Office Report)
T.P.(C) No. 98/2015
(With Office Report)
T.P.(C) No. 21/2015
(With Office Report)
T.P.(C) No. 1919/2014
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)
T.C.(C) No. 24/2014
T.C.(C) No. 25/2014
T.P.(C) No. 77/2015
(With appln.(s) for ex-parte stay and Office Report)
T.P.(C) No. 91/2015
(With appln.(s) for ex-parte stay and Office Report)
T.P.(C) No. 76/2015
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)
T.P.(C) No. 111/2015
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)

Date : 16/09/2016 These petitions were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE V. GOPALA GOWDA
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL

Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, Sr. Adv. (A.C.)

Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, Adv.

Mr. Pradeep Singh, Adv.

Ms. Anusha Ramesh, Adv.

Mr. Pavan Bhushan, Adv.

Mr. Amit Krishnan, Adv.

Ms. Akanksha, Adv.

Mr. Ranjit, Adv.

Counsel for the parties :

Mr. C.S. Vaidyanathan, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Nalin Talwar, Adv.

Ms. Anubha Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sidharth Chowdhary, AOR

Mr. Sudhir Chandra, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Sanjai Kumar Pathak, AOR

Ms. Shashi Pathak, Adv.

Ms. A. Sumathi, AOR
Mr. Subramonium Prasad, Sr. Adv.

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.
Ms. Mansha Anand, Adv.
Ms. Aishwarya Kaushiq, Adv.

4

Mr. Ranjit B. Raut,

Ms. Bina Gupta, AOR
Ms. Surbhi Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. V. Shekhar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Anant Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Sooho P., at
Mr. Nishant Anand, Adv.

Mr. R.S. Suri, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Simar Suri, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Bauray, Adv.
Mr. Varun Chopra, Adv.
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR

Mr. Subramonium Prasad, AOR
Mr. Pinaki Mishra, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Vivek Kohli, Adv.
Mr. Nikhil Mathur, Adv.
Mr. Arun K. Sinha, AOR

Mr. Prashant Kumar, AOR
Mr. Rakesh Diwedi, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ujjal Banerjee, Adv.
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Anish Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Jay Kishor Singh, AOR

Delhi Study Group Ms. Geeta Luthra, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Shivani Luthra Lohiya, Adv.

Mr. D. N. Goburdhan, AOR

Mr. Prateek Yadav, Adv.

UP Pollution Mr. Pradeep Misra, Adv.

Control Board Ms. Indu Misra, Adv.

Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR
Mr. Prashant Bhushan, Adv.
Ms. Aparna Jha, AOR

Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury, AOR
Mr. K. C. Dua, AOR
Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

5

Mr. Shiv Prakash Pandey, AOR
M/s Temple Law Firm, Advs.

Mr. R. Gopalakrishnan, AOR
Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR
Ms. Ranjeeta Rohtagi, AOR
Mr. Rakesh Dahiya, AOR

F.S.S.A.I. Mr. Mehmood P., Adv.

Mr. Shadan Farasat, AOR
Mr. Mansoor Ali, Adv.

Mr. K. Rajeev, AOR

Mr. Nikhil Jain, AOR
Mr. S. K. Verma, AOR
Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR

State of Bihar Mr. Rudreshwar Singh, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Jha, Adv.

Mr. Samir Ali Khan, AOR

Mr. Vivek Vardhan, Adv.

Mr. Krishnakant Dubey, Adv.

Ms. Madhavi Divan, Adv.

Ms. Sushma Suri, AOR

State of Karnataka Mr. K.N. Bhat, Sr. Adv.

Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR

Mr. Parikshit P. Angadi, Adv.

Dhariwal Industries Mr. Lalit Chauhan, Adv.
Limited Mr. Sumit Goel, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Vinod Deshmukh, Adv.
Ms. Rashi Gupta, Adv.
For M/s Parekh & Co.
Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv.
Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv.
Ms. Akanksha Mehra, Adv.
Mr. Mrityungai Singh, Adv.
Mr. Piyush Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Prateek Dhir, Adv.
For M/s Lawyers' Knit & Co.

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.
M/s Nuli & Nuli, Advs.

6

Mr. Shreekant N. Terdal, AOR
Ministry of Health Mr. A.K. Panda, Sr. Adv.
& Family Welfare/ Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv.
MoEF Ms. Madhvi Diwan, Adv.
Mr. R.K. Rathore, Adv.
Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv.
Mr. R. Balasubramanium, Adv.
Mr. R. Bala
Mr. G.S. Makkar, Adv.
Ms. Sadhna Sandhu, Adv.
Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, Adv.
Mr. Ranjit Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Shashank Singh, Adv.
Mr. D. S. Mahra, AOR
Mr. P. S. Sudheer, AOR
Ms. Shirin Khajuria, AOR

Mr. C.U. Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ajay Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. Dhaval Mehrotra, Adv.
Mr. Rishi K.S. Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Vaibhav C., Adv.
Ms. Kanika G., Adv.
Ms. Ruchika, Adv.
Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR
Mr. Pankaj Bhatia, Adv.
Mr. Nipun Goel, Adv.
Ms. Bharti Tyagi, AOR
Chhatisgarh Environment Ms. Yogmaya Agnihotri, Adv.
Conservation Board Ms. Purnima Bhat, Adv.
State of Chhattisgarh Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR
Mr. A. Selvin Raja, Adv.
Mr. Kundan Kumar Mishra, AOR
State of Rajasthan Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Prateek Yadav, Adv.

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

7

Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR
Mr. Rakesh Kumar, AOR
State of M.P. Mr. Purushaindra Kaurav, AAG
Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR
Mr. Ashok Panigrahi, AOR
Mr. Nikilesh Ramachandran, AOR
Mr. P. V. Yogeswaran, AOR
Mr. Ravi Kumar Tomar, AOR
Ms. Shally Bhasin, AOR
M.C.D. Mr. Ajay Arora, Adv.

Mr. Virag Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Lokendra Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR
Mr. Khwairakpam Nobin Singh, AOR
Mr. K.B. Rohtagi, AOR
State of U.P. Mr. Gaurav Dhingra, AOR
Mr. Aviral Saxena, Adv.
Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.
Mr. Vikrant Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR
Mr. L.C. Agrawala, AOR
Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, AOR
State of Jharkhand
Mr. Tapesesh Kumar Singh, AOR
Mr. Mohd. Waquas, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.
State of Tamil Nadu Mr. B. Balaji, AOR

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

8

Mr. Muthuvel Palani, Adv.
Mr. A. Aravind, Adv.
Mr. T.N. Rama Rao, Adv.
Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. T. Veera Reddy, Adv.
Ms. C.K. Sucharita, AOR
Mr. M. Yogesh Kanna, AOR
Ms. Nithya, Adv.
Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR
Mr. P.P. Rao, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Harish V. Shankar, Adv.
Ms. Nisha Mohandas, Adv.
State of Uttarakhand Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR
Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv.
Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv.
Mr. Yash Pal Dhingra, AOR

Mr. Ritesh Kumar, AOR
Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR
UT of Andaman & Mr. K. V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.
Nicobar Admn. Ms. G. Indira, AOR
State of Rajasthan Gp. Capt. Karan Singh Bhati, Adv.
Mehul Singh, Adv.
Ms. Tanuja Patra, Adv.
Mr. T. Gopal, Adv.
Mr. Dilip Kumar Nayak, Adv.
Ms. Anshul Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Heena Khan, Adv.
Ms. Eshitha Kapur, Adv.
Mr. Amit Verma, Adv.
For Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR

Mr. Venkita Subramoniam T.R., AOR
Mr. Basava Prabhu S. Patil, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shailesh Madiyal, AOR
Ms. Shivani Srivastava, Adv.
Mr. Chinmay Deshpandey, Adv.

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

9

Mr. Kaushik Poddar, AOR
Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AOR
Mr. N. Ganpathy, AOR
Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR
Ms. Praveen Gautam, AOR
Ms. Praveena Gautam, AOR
Ms. Ruby Singh Ahuja, Adv.
Mr. Karan Dev Chopra, Adv.
Mr. Manik Karanjawala, Adv.

For M/s. Karanjawala & Co.
Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR
Mr. Avijit Bhattacharjee, AOR
Mr. Pradeep Misra, AOR
Mr. T. Mahipal, Adv.
Mr. Suraj Singh, Adv.
Mr. Nitin S. Tambwekar, Adv.
Mr. Seshatalpa Sai Bandaru, Adv.
Mr. Vijay Panjwani, AOR
Mr. Jagjit Singh Chhabra, AOR
Mr. Surya Kant, AOR
SPCB (Odisha) Mr. Ashok Kumar Panda, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR
Mr. Satyabrata Panda, Adv.
Mr. Manoranjan Paikaray, Adv.
Mr. Krishnayan Sen, AOR
Mr. Uddyam Mukherjee, Adv.
State of Arunachal Pradesh Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR
Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.
State of Tripura Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR
Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.
Ms. Varsha Poddar, Adv.
Mr. K.B. Rohatgi, AOR

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc. 10
Mr. Mahesh Kasana, Adv.
Ms. Aparna Rohatgi Jain, Adv.
Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR
Mr. Samir Ali Khan, AOR
M/s Corporate Law Group, Advs.
Gujarat Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR
Ms. Puja Singh, Adv.
Ms. Aagam Kaur, Adv.
Ms. Mamta Singh, Adv.
State of H.P. Mr. Suryanarayana Singh, AAG
Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR
Govt. of Puducherry Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR
Mr. S. Prabhu Ramasubramanian, Adv.
Chhattisgarh Environment Ms. Yogmaya Agnihotri, Adv.
Conservation Board Ms. Purnima Bhat Kak, AOR
Ms. Sandhya Goswami, AOR
State of Sikkim Ms. Aruna Mathur, Adv.
Mr. Yusuf Khan, Adv.
Mr. Avneesh Arputham, Adv.
Ms. Anuradha Arputham, Adv.
for M/s Arputham Aruna & Co.
Agra Nagar Nigam Mr. Jitendra Mohan Sharma, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ajit Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Pahlad Singh Sharma, AOR
Mr. Sandeep Singh, Adv.
Mr. M.K. Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Bansode, Adv.
Ms. Shalini Chandra, AOR

State of Nagaland Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR
Mr. Edward Belho, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran, AOR
Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR
Mr. B.D. Sharma, AOR
Ms. Meera Mathur, AOR

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc. 11
Mr. Abhay Kumar, AOR
Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR
Mr. M.T. George, AOR
Mr. Jitendra Mohan Sharma, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Shweta Jain, Adv.
Mr. Ajit Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Pahlad Singh Sharma, AOR

Ms. Madhvi Diwan, Adv.

Ms. Nidhi Khanna, Adv.

Mr. B. Krishna Prasad, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Agrawal, AOR

State of Maharashtra Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, AOR

Mr. Arpit Rai, Adv.

For intervenor Mr. Rajiv Dhawan, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Manish Goswami, Adv.

Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR

For M/s. Map & Map

Mr. K.N. Bhat, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR

Ms. Priyanjali Yadav, Adv.

Ms. Indu Malhotra, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Vandana Anand, Adv.

Mr. Dheeraj Nair, AOR

State of Kerala Mr. G. Prakash, AOR

Mr. Jishnu M.L., Adv.

Ms. Priyanka Prakash, Adv.

Ms. Beena Prakash, Adv.

Mr. Manu Srinath, Adv.

State of Manipur Mr. Sapam Bishwajit, Adv.

Mr. Naresh Kumar Gaur, Adv.

Mr. M. Ghanashyam, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR

Mr. M. Shoebalam, AOR

For Intervenor Mr. V.A. Mohta, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Shashibhushan P. Adgaonkar, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Kumar Gupta II, AOR

Mr. Nilkanth Nayak, Adv.

Mr. Rana Sandeep Busa, Adv.

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

12

Dr. R.R. Deshpande, Adv.

Mr. Yuvaraj Baburao Gaikwad, Adv.

State of Haryana Mr. Alok Sangwan, AAG

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

In the second category of cases under the Food Safety and Standards Act, 2006 and Regulations framed thereunder, challenging prohibitory orders in the transferred cases, heard the arguments of Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, learned senior counsel (amicus curiae) in part.

List for further hearing on 20.09.2016 as part heard (1st Case).

(S. K. RAKHEJA) (VINOD KUMAR JHA) (MALA KUMARI SHARMA)
COURT MASTER AR-cum-PS COURT MASTER

T.C. (C) No. 1/2010 etc.

13

Prevention of Food Adulteration Act, 1954

Food Safety & Standards Act, 2006

The Cigarettes and Other Tobacco Products (Prohibition of Advertisement and Regulation of Trade and Commerce, Production, Supply and Distribution) Act, 2003

The Tobacco Board Act, 1975

The Industries Development and Regulation Act, 1951