

ù\2071

ITEM NO.51 COURT NO.8 SECTIONS. XVIA/IX/X/XI/XV/IVA/PIL(W)  
S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Transfer Case (Civil) No(s). 1/2010  
CENTRAL ARECANUT MARKETING COPN.& ORS. Petitioner(s)  
VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA Respondent(s)

WITH  
T.C.(C) No. 6/2010  
T.C.(C) Nos. 12-14/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 15/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 16/2014  
W.P.(C) No. 344/2011  
W.P.(C) No. 330/2011  
(With Interim Relief and Office Report)  
T.C.(C) No. 95/2012  
(With appln.(s) for impleadment)  
T.C.(C) No. 10/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 11/2014  
W.P.(C) No. 141/2011  
(With appln.(s) for permission to file additional documents and  
Office Report)  
W.P.(C) No. 354/2011  
(With appln.(s) for amendment of the petition and interim relief  
and Office Report)  
W.P.(C) No. 572/2013  
(With office report)  
W.P.(C) No. 289/2011  
(With appln.(s) for directions and intervention and Office Report)  
W.P.(C) No. 69/2011  
(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and Office Report)  
T.C.(C) No. 9/2014  
SLP(C) No. 16308/2007  
(With appln.(s) for directions and impleadment and interim  
directions and intervention and urging addl. grounds and Interim  
Relief and Office Report)

2  
SLP(C) Nos. 19467-19469/2007  
(With appln.(s) for clarification and clarification/direction and  
exemption from filing O.T., impleadment and permission to file  
affidavit and seeking permission to raise additional grounds and  
interim Relief and Office Report)  
SLP(C) No. 16314/2007  
(With appln.(s) for exemption from filing c/c of the impugned  
judgment and Interim Relief and Office Report)  
CONMT.PET.(C) No. 348/2011 In SLP(C) Nos. 19467-19469/2007  
SLP(C) No. 16317/2007  
(With appln.(s) for exemption from filing c/c of the impugned  
judgment and Interim Relief and Office Report)  
CONMT.PET.(C) No. 37/2012 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007  
CONMT.PET.(C) No. 288/2011 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007  
CONMT.PET.(C) No. 236/2011 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007  
(With Office Report)  
CONMT.PET.(C) No. 356/2011 In SLP(C) No. 16308/2007  
W.P.(C) No. 304/2011  
(With appln.(s) for Amendment of the petition and Office Report)  
T.C.(C) No. 4/2010  
T.C.(C) No. 18/2014  
SLP(C) Nos. 4165-4166/2013  
(With Office Report)  
T.P.(C) No. 144/2015  
T.C.(C) No. 21/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 22/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 8/2016  
T.C.(C) No. 7/2016  
T.C.(C) No. 6/2016  
T.C.(C) No. 5/2016

T.C.(C) No. 2/2010  
T.C.(C) No. 3/2010  
W.P.(C) No. 131/2011  
(With Office Report)  
SLP(C) No. 32162/2012  
(With Interim Relief and Office Report)  
W.P.(C) No. 147/2013  
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)

3

SLP(C) No. 32163/2012  
(With Office Report)  
T.C.(C) No. 5/2010  
T.C.(C) No. 25/2010  
(With appln.(s) for clarification and Stay)  
T.C.(C) No. 20/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 38/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 36/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 37/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 19/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 34/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 33/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 35/2014  
SLP(C) No. 28716/2012  
(With Interim Relief and Office Report)  
W.P.(C) No. 182/2011  
(With Office Report)  
T.P.(C) No. 143/2015  
T.P.(C) No. 98/2015  
(With Office Report)  
T.P.(C) No. 21/2015  
(With Office Report)  
T.P.(C) No. 1919/2014  
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)  
T.C.(C) No. 24/2014  
T.C.(C) No. 25/2014  
T.P.(C) No. 77/2015  
(With appln.(s) for ex-parte stay and Office Report)  
T.P.(C) No. 91/2015  
(With appln.(s) for ex-parte stay and Office Report)  
T.P.(C) No. 76/2015  
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)  
T.P.(C) No. 111/2015  
(With appln.(s) for stay and Office Report)  
Date : 23/09/2016 These matters were called on for hearing today.  
CORAM : HON&#39;BLE MR. JUSTICE V. GOPALA GOWDA  
HON&#39;BLE MR. JUSTICE ADARSH KUMAR GOEL  
Mr. Gopal Subramaniam, Sr. Adv. (A.C.)  
Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, Adv.  
Ms. Anusha Ramesh, Adv.  
Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, Adv.  
Mr. Pradeep Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Pavan Bhushan, Adv.  
Mr. Lalltaksh Joshi, Adv.  
Mr. Ranjith Singh, Adv.

4

Counsel for the parties:  
Mr. C.S. Vaidyanathan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Nalin Talwar, Adv.  
Mr. Vivek Kohli, Adv.  
Mr. Avishkar Singhvi, Adv.  
Ms. Anubha Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Nikhil Mathur, Adv.  
Ms. Sanjana Mohanty, Adv.  
Ms. Sidharth Chowdhary, AOR  
Mr. Sudhir Chandra, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Anoop George Chowdhary, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Sanjai Kumar Pathak, AOR

Ms. Shashi Pathak, Adv.

Ms. A. Sumathi, AOR  
Mr. Shailesh Madyal, AOR  
Mr. Vipin Nair, AOR  
Mr. Subramonium Prasad, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Bina Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR

Mr. Subramonium Prasad, AOR  
Mr. Arun K. Sinha, AOR  
Mr. Joseph Pookkatt, Adv.  
Mr. Prashant Kumar, AOR

Mr. Ujjal Banerjee, Adv.  
Ms. Shabdita Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Jay Kishore Singh, AOR  
Mr. Satish Chandra, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Nagmohan Das, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Vikas Singh, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Mayank Pandey, Adv.  
Ms. Deepika Kalia, Adv.  
Ms. Shilpi Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Geeta Luthra, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Shivani Luthra Lohiya, Adv.  
Mr. Prateek Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. D. N. Goburdhan, AOR

5

UP Pollution Control Board Mr. Rishabh Sancheti, Adv.  
Ms. Padma Priya, Adv.  
Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR

Ms. Aparna Jha, AOR  
Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury, AOR  
Mr. K. C. Dua, AOR  
Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR  
Mr. Shiv Prakash Pandey, AOR

M/s Temple Law Firm, Advs.  
Mr. R. Gopalakrishnan, AOR  
Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR  
Ms. Ranjeeta Rohtagi, AOR  
Mr. Rakesh Dahiya, AOR

F.S.S.A.I. Mr. Mehmood Pracha, Adv.  
Mr. Shadan Farasat, AOR  
Mr. K. Rajeev, AOR

Mr. Nikhil Jain, AOR  
Mr. S. K. Verma, AOR  
Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR

Mr. Ujjwal Singh, Adv.

State of Bihar Mr. Rudreshwar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Samir Ali Khan, AOR  
Mr. Krishanakant Dubey, Adv.  
Mr. Vivek Vardhan, Adv.  
Ms. Sushma Suri, AOR

State of Karnataka Mr. K.N. Bhat, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR  
Mr. Parikshit P. Angadi, Adv.  
Mr. Lagnesh Mishra, Adv.

6

Mr. Pravin H. Parekh, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Lalit Chauhan, Adv.  
Mr. Sumit Goel, Adv.  
Mr. Abhishek Vinod Deshmukh, Adv.  
Ms. Rashi Gupta, Adv.

For M/s Parekh & Co., Advs.  
Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv.  
Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv.  
Ms. Akanksha Mehra, Adv.  
Mr. Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Piyush Dwivedi, Adv.  
Mr. Prateek Dhir, Adv.  
For M/s Lawyers & Knit & Co., Advs.  
M/s Nuli & Nuli, Advs.

Mr. Shreekant N. Terdal, AOR  
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare/  
MoEF Mr. R. Balasubramaniam, Adv.  
Mr. A.K. Panda, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Sadhna Sandhu, Adv.  
Mr. Ajay Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Aarti Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. G.S. Makker, AOR  
Mr. Alok Sangwan, Adv.  
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.  
Mr. Ranjit Singh, Adv.  
Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, Adv.  
Mr. D. S. Mahra, AOR  
Mr. P. S. Sudheer, AOR  
Ms. V. Mohana, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Shirin Khajuria, AOR  
Mr. Sajjan Poovaliya, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. C.U. Singh, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Ajay Agarwal, Adv.  
Ms. Kanika Gomber, Adv.  
Ms. Ruchika, Adv.  
Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR  
Ms. Bharti Tyagi, AOR  
Mr. Nitin S. Tambwekar, Adv.  
Mr. Seshatalpa Sai Bandaru, Adv.  
Chhattisgarh Environment Conservation Board Ms. Yogmaya Agnihotri, Adv.  
Ms. Purnima Bhat, Adv.

7

State of Chhattisgarh Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR  
Mr. A. Selvin Raja, Adv.  
Mr. Kundan Kumar Mishra, AOR  
State of Rajasthan Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, AAG  
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Prateek Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv.  
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR  
SDMC Mr. Rakesh Kumar, AOR

State of M.P. Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR  
Mr. Purushaindra K., Adv.  
Ms. Anuradha Mishra, Adv.  
Mr. Ashok Panigrahi, AOR  
Mr. Nikilesh Ramachandran, AOR  
Mr. P. V. Yogeswaran, AOR  
Mr. Ravi Kumar Tomar, AOR  
Ms. Shally Bhasin, AOR  
M.C.D. Mr. R.K. Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Virag Gupta, Adv.  
Mr. Aum Mangalassery, Adv.  
Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR  
Mr. Khwairakpam Nobin Singh, AOR  
Rajasthan State Pollution Control Board Mr. K.B. Rohatgi, AOR  
Mr. Mahesh Kasana, Adv.

Mr. Mahesh Kasana, Adv.

State of U.P. Mr. Gaurav Dhingra, AOR

Mr. Aviral Saxena, Adv.  
State of J & K Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR

Mr. L.C. Agrawala, AOR  
For M/s. Equity Lex Associates, Advs.  
Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, AOR

8

State of Jharkhand Mr. Tapeshe Kumar Singh, AOR  
Mr. Mohd. Waquas, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.

State of Tamil Nadu Mr. B. Balaji, AOR  
Mr. Muthuvel, Adv.  
Mr. A. Arvind, Adv.  
Mr. T.N. Rama Rao, Adv.  
Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. T. Veera Reddy, Adv.  
Ms. C.K. Sucharita, AOR

State of Tamil Nadu Mr. M. Yogesh Kanna, AOR  
Ms. Nithya, Adv.  
Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR

State of Haryana Mr. Alok Sangwan, AAG  
Mr. Devashish Bharuka, Adv.  
Ms. Anu Tyagi, Adv.  
Mr. Ravi Bharuka, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR

State of Uttarakhand Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR

Uttarakhand Environment Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv.  
Pollution Control Board Mr. Pawan Kumar Shukla, Adv.  
Mr. Yash Pal Dhingra, AOR

Mr. Ritesh Kumar, AOR  
Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR

UT of Andaman & Mr. K. V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.

Nicobar Admn. Ms. G. Indira, AOR  
State of Rajasthan Gp. Capt. Karan Singh Bhati, Adv.

Ms. Mehul Singh, Adv.  
Mr. T. Gopal, Adv.  
Mr. Adarsh Kumar Tiwari, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Verma, Adv.  
Mr. Dilip Kumar Nayak, Adv.  
Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR

Mr. Venkita Subramoniam T.R., AOR  
Mr. Basava Prabhu S. Patil, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Shailesh Madiyal, AOR  
Ms. Shivani Srivastava, Adv.  
Mr. Chinmay, Adv.

9

Mr. Kaushik Poddar, AOR

Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AOR  
Mr. N. Ganpathy, AOR  
Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR  
Ms. Praveena Gautam, AOR

M/s. Karanjawala & Co.  
Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR  
Mr. Avijit Bhattacharjee, AOR  
CPCB Mr. Vijay Panjwani, AOR  
Mr. Jagjit Singh Chhabra, AOR  
Mr. Surya Kant, AOR

Odisha SPCB Mr. Ashok Kumar Panda, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR  
Mr. Manoranjan Paikaray, Adv.

State of Odisha Mr. Krishnayan Sen, AOR

Mr. Uddyam Mukherjee, Adv.  
State of Arunachal Pradesh Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR

State of Tripura Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR  
Mr. Rituraj Biswas, Adv.  
Ms. Varsha Poddar, Adv.  
Mr. K.B. Rohatgi, AOR  
Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR  
M/s Corporate Law Group, Advs.  
State of Gujarat Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR  
State of H.P. Mr. Suryanarayana Singh, Sr. AAG  
Ms. Pragati Neekhara, AOR  
Govt. of Puducherry Mr. V.G. Pragasam, AOR  
Mr. S. Prabhu Ramasubramanian, Adv.  
Chhattisgarh Environment Ms. Purnima Bhat Kak, AOR  
Conservation Board

10  
Ms. Sandhya Goswami, AOR

State of Sikkim Ms. Aruna Mathur, Adv.  
Mr. Yusuf Khan, Adv.  
Mr. Avneesh Arputham, Adv.  
Ms. Anuradha Arputham, Adv.  
for M/s Arputham Aruna & Co.  
Agra Nagar Nigam Mr. Pahlad Singh Sharma, AOR  
  
Ms. Shalini Chandra, AOR

State of Nagaland Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR  
Mr. Edward Belho, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. K. Luikang Michael, Adv.  
Mr. Z.H. Issac Haiding, Adv.  
Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran, AOR  
Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR  
Mr. B.D. Sharma, AOR  
Ms. Meera Mathur, AOR  
Mr. Abhay Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR  
Mr. M.T. George, AOR  
Mr. Pahlad Singh Sharma, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Agrawal, AOR  
Dr. A.M. Singhvi, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Vivek Kohli, Adv.  
Mr. Nalin Talwar, Adv.  
Ms. Anubha Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Avishkar Singhvi, Adv.  
Ms. Sanjana Mohanty, Adv.  
Mr. Nikhil Mathur, Adv.

State of Maharashtra Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, AOR  
Ms. Madhavi Divan, Adv.  
Ms. Nidhi Khanna, Adv.  
  
Mr. B. Krishna Prasad, AOR

11  
Mr. K.N. Bhat, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Priyanjali Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR

State of Kerala Mr. G. Prakash, AOR  
Mr. Jishnu M.L., Adv.  
Ms. Priyanka Prakash, Adv.  
Ms. Beena Prakash, Adv.  
Mr. Manu Srinath, Adv.  
State of Manipur Mr. Sapam Bishwajit Meitei, Adv.  
Mr. Naresh Kumar Gaur, Adv.

Ms. Linthoingambi Thongam, Adv.  
Mr. M. Ghanshyam, Adv.  
Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR  
For Intervenor Mr. Rajiv Dhawan, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Manish Goswami, Adv.  
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR  
For Intervenor Mr. Ashok Kumar Gupta II, AOR  
For Intervenor Ms. Indu Malhotra, Sr. Adv.  
Ms. Vandana Anand, Adv.  
Mr. Dheeraj Nair, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

These matters have been heard inter alia on 1.9.2016, 7.9.2016, 15.9.2016, 16.9.2016, 20.9.2016 and 21.9.2016. In the course of submissions by the learned counsel, it has been stated today that longer time will be required in completing the hearing as more submissions are to be made by many learned counsel representing the parties. Thus, it may not be possible to conclude the hearing so as to enable this Bench to decide the matter within the time available. In view of submission of the learned counsel for the parties and the learned Amicus Curiae, we direct that the matters be now listed for hearing on 9.11.2016 as first case.

12

At this stage, learned Amicus Curiae has invited the attention of the Court to the Order dated 3.4.2013 passed by this Court. The relevant part of the said order reads as follows:

â- SMS. Indira Jaising, learned Additional Solicitor General invited the Court's attention to notifications issued by the Government of 23 States and the Administrators of 5 Union Territories for imposing complete ban on Gutkha and Pan Masala with tobacco and/or nicotine and then stated that notwithstanding the ban, the manufacturers have devised a subterfuge for selling Gutkha and Pan Masala in separate pouches and in this manner the ban is being flouted.

Ms. Indira Jaising also placed before the Court xerox copy of D.O.No.P.16012/12/11-Part I dated 27.08.2012 sent by the Special Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India to the Chief Secretaries of all the States except the States of Madhya Pradesh, Kerala, Bihar Rajasthan, Maharashtra, Haryana, Chhatisgarh and Jharkhand and submitted that the Court may call upon the remaining States and Union Territories to issue necessary notifications.

In view of the statement made by the learned Additional Solicitor General, we order issue of notice to the Chief Secretaries of the States and the Administrators of the Union Territories which have so far not issued notification in terms of 2006 Act to apprise this court with the reasons as to why they have not taken action pursuant to letter dated 27.08.2012.

We also direct the Secretaries, Health Department of all the 23 States and 5 Union Territories to file their affidavits within four weeks on the issue of total compliance of the ban imposed on manufacturing and sale of Gutkha and Pan

Masala with tobacco and/or nicotine.â- \235

Learned Amicus Curiae has also invited our attention to paragraph 21 of the Written Submissions on behalf of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India, in S.L.P. (C) No. 16308 of 2007, which reads as follows:

13

â S 21. It is most respectfully submitted that to circumvent the ban on the sale of gutkha, the manufacturers are selling pan masala (without tobacco) with flavoured chewing tobacco in separate sachets but often conjoint and sold together by the same vendors from the same premises, so that consumers can buy the pan masala and flavoured chewing tobacco and mix them both and consume the same. Hence, instead of the earlier â Sready to consume mixesâ \235, chewing tobacco companies are selling gutkha in twin packs to be mixed as oneâ \235

Learned Amicus Curiae has also pointed out that this Court has not granted any stay of Regulation 2.3.4 of the Food Safety and Standards (Prohibition & Restrictions on Sales) Regulations, 2011 and the concerned authorities are duty bound to enforce the said regulation framed under Section 92 read with Section 26 of the Food Safety & Standards Act, 2006.

In view of the above, the concerned statutory authorities are directed to comply with the above mandate of law. We also direct the Secretaries, Health Department of all the States and Union Territories to file their affidavits before the next date of hearing on the issue of total compliance of the ban imposed on manufacturing and sale of Gutkha and Pan Masala with tobacco and/or nicotine.

(S. K. RAKHEJA)

COURT MASTER (MALA KUMARI SHARMA)

COURT MASTER