

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No(s).4056-4064/1999

MINERAL AREA DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY & ANR

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

M/S STEEL AUTHORITY OF INDIA & ANR ETC

Respondent(s)

WITH

T.P.(C) No. 722/2006 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 4745/2006 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 2055/2009 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 4990/2006 (IV-C)

T.P.(C) No. 951/2006 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 4991/2006 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 4992/2006 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 5599/2006 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 5649/2006 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 378/2007 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 665/2007 (IV-C)

SLP(C) No. 763/2007 (XII-A)

C.A. No. 1180/2007 (IV-C)

T.P.(C) No. 481/2007 (IV-C)

T.P.(C) No. 906/2007 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 6497/2008 (XV)

C.A. No. 6498/2008 (XV)

C.A. No. 3401/2008 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 3400/2008 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 3402/2008 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 6137/2008 (XV)
C.A. No. 8311/2011 (XV)
C.A. No. 4293/2012 (XV)
C.A. No. 4710-4721/1999 (XVII)
C.A. No. 5332/2002 (XII)
C.A. No. 1352/2005 (XII)
C.A. No. 1883/2006 (XI-A)
C.A. No. 2174/2009 (IV-C)
SLP(C) No. 15900/2007 (XII-A)
C.A. No. 5682/2007 (III-A)
C.A. No. 1295/2008 (III-A)
C.A. No. 3403/2008 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 7397/2008 (XV)
C.A. No. 96/2009 (XV)
C.A. No. 6499/2008 (XV)
C.A. No. 98/2009 (XV)
C.A. No. 97/2009 (XV)
SLP(C) No. 26160/2008 (XV)
T.P.(C) No. 613/2009 (XI)
T.P.(C) No. 626/2009 (XI)
C.A. No. 4479/2010 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 4478/2010 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 874/2013 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 3643/2011 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 8269-8271/2013 (XV)
C.A. No. 8268/2013 (XV)

C.A. No. 8267/2013 (XV)
C.A. No. 6135/2013 (XV)
C.A. No. 8272/2013 (XV)
W.P.(C) No. 1029/2019 (X)
SLP(C) No. 16028/2021 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 4286/2023 (XV)
C.A. No. 4722-4724/1999 (XVII)
C.A. No. 5329/2002 (XII)
C.A. No. 5333/2002 (XII)
C.A. No. 5335-5336/2002 (XII)
C.A. No. 7938/2019 (XVII)
C.A. No. 7936/2019 (XVII)
C.A. No. 7937/2019 (XVII)
C.A. No. 4993/2006 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 6221/2008 (XV)
C.A. No. 8273/2013 (XV)
C.A. No. 8274/2013 (XV)
C.A. No. 9458/2013 (IV-C)
C.A. No. 3869/2014 (III-A)
C.A. No. 2632/2013 (XV)
SLP(C) No. 18600/2013 (XV)
C.A. No. 14685/2015 (XV)
C.A. No. 4332/2013 (XV)
C.A. No. 6784/2014 (XV)
W.P.(C) No. 376/2015 (X)
C.A. No. 10082/2016 (XV)

C.A. No. 886/2017 (XV)

C.A. No. 4588/2017 (XV)

C.A. No. 205/2017 (XV)

W.P.(C) No. 512/2018 (X)

C.A. No. 5728-5729/2018 (IV-C)

C.A. No. 5250/2019 (XV)

W.P.(C) No. 729/2019 (X)

Date : 25-07-2024 These matters were called on for pronouncement of judgment today.

For Appellant(s) Mr. Arvind P. Datar, Sr. Adv.
Mrs. Prabha Swami, AOR
Mr. Nikhil Swami, Adv.
Ms. Divya Swami, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mrs. Kirti Renu Mishra, AOR
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Eklavya Dwivedi, Adv.
Mrs. Apurva Upmanyu, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Tapesk Kumar Singh, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, AOR
Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sukant Vikram, Adv.
Mr. Eklavya Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Bharadwaj, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Bhardwaj, Adv.
Mr. Amarjeet Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, A.S.G.
Mr. Uddyam Mukherjee, AOR
Mr. Swapnil Pattanayak, Adv.
Ms. Manisha Chava, Adv.
Mr. Agnibha Chatterjee, Adv.
Ms. Shagun Thakur, Adv.
Ms. Bln Shivani, Adv.
Mr. Abhijeet Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rustam Singh Chauhan, Adv.
Ms. Sthavi Asthana, Adv.
Mr. Ashwin Joseph, Adv.
Ms. Poornima Singh, Adv.
Mr. Annirudh Singh, Adv.
Ms. Shreya Jain, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, A.S.G.
Mr. Gp. Capt. Karan Singh Bhati, AOR
Mr. Hemendra Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Chitragda Rastravara, Adv.
Mr. Abhijeet Singh, Adv.
Mr. Anirudh Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aishwary Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Dhananjai Shekhwat, Adv.
Mr. Shiv Autar Singh Sengar, Adv.
Mr. Dashrath Singh, Adv.
Mr. Yogeshwar Krishna, Adv.
Ms. Anjali Sexena, Adv.

Mr. S.K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ashok Grover, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Praveen Kumar, AOR
Mr. Kumar Ajit Singh, Adv.
Ms. Sunaina Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Karuppaiah Meyyappan, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Kalaiyarsan, Adv.

Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ashwarya Sinha, AOR
Ms. Priyanka Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Malhotra, Adv.

Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR

Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR

Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, AOR
Ms. Purna Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. Ram Lal Roy, AOR
Mr. Shiv Singh Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Ninad Laud, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Saigal, Adv.
Mr. Anshuman Srivastava, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Chirag Nayak, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Agrawala,, Adv.
Mr. M.S. Ananth, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
Mr. Zubin Dash, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Saraswat, Adv.
Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Abhimanyu Bhandari, Adv.
Mr. Naveen Kumar, AOR
Ms. Roohe Dua, Adv.
Ms. Stuti Bisht, Adv.
Mr. Nitesh Bhandari, Adv.
Mr. Arav Pandit, Adv.
Mr. Harshit Khanduja, Adv.
Mr. Prabhat Kumar Rai, Adv.
Ms. Dhankshi Gandhi, Adv.
Ms. Nidhi Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sahib Kochhar, Adv.
Mr. Shourajeet Chakravarty, Adv.
Mr. Randeep Sachdeva, Adv.
Ms. Aprajita Bhardwaj, Adv.
Ms. Shreya Arora, Adv.
Mr. Maitreya, Adv.

Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR
Mr. Shantwanu Singh, Adv.
Mr. Megh Shyam Bhangle, Adv.
Mr. Raj Kishor Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Pragya Singh, Adv.
Mr. Sunny Singh, Adv.
Mr. Akshay Singh, Adv.

Mr. Kunal Verma, AOR

Mr. H. D. Thanvi, Adv.
Mr. Nikhil Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Achal Singh Bule, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Matoliya, AOR

Mr. K. V. Mohan, AOR
Mr. K.V. Balakrishnan, Adv.
Mr. R.k. Raghavan, Adv.

Ms. Sumita Hazarika, AOR
Mrs. Sheela Goel, AOR

Mr. T. G. Narayanan Nair, AOR
Mr. Shibu Devasia Olickal, Adv.
Ms. Samyuktha H Nair, Adv.

Mr. Shantanu Sagar, AOR
Mr. Prabhat Ranjan Raj, Adv.
Mr. Shashwat Anand, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Gunjesh Ranjan, Adv.
Mr. Vaibhav Jain, Adv.
Mrs. Divya Mishra, Adv.

Mr. U.A. Rana, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Mehta, Adv.
M/S. Gagrat And Co, AOR

Mr. S. K. Verma, AOR

Mr. Sanjay Kumar Tyagi, AOR

Ms. Manjeet Kirpal, AOR

Mr. P. V. Yogeswaran, AOR

Mrs. Vanita Bhargava, Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Juneja, Adv.
Mr. Sanjeev Kumar Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Bhargava, Adv.
Ms. Monika Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aakash Bajaj, Adv.
Ms. Muskan Narang, Adv.
Ms. Prerona Banerjee, Adv.
Ms. Nandita Chauhan, Adv.
Mr. Avirat Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Tijil Thakur, Adv.
Ms. Aarushi Yadav, Adv.
M/S. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Mr. Neeraj Kumar Gupta, AOR
Mr. Ranjeet Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Kumar Verma, Adv.
Mr. Nitin Singh, Adv.
Mr. Akshaya Agarwal, Adv.

Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR
Mr. Pawan R Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Sarvjit Pratap Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sarad Kumar Singhania, AOR

Mr. P. S. Sudheer, AOR
Mr. Ninad Laud, Adv.
Mr. Dhananjya Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Zubin Dash, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Maheshwari, Adv.
Ms. Anne Mathew, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Sood, Adv.
Ms. Miranda Solaman, Adv.
Ms. Nivedita Sudheer, Adv.
Ms. Sunaina Phul, Adv.

Mr. Shailendra Swarup, AOR
Ms. Bindu Saxena, Adv.
Ms. Aparajita Swarup, Adv.

Mr. Surender Kumar Gupta, AOR
Ms. Muskan Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Nandini Sen Mukherjee, AOR

Mr. Sumit Teterrwal, AOR

For Respondent(s) Mr. R. Venkataramani, Attorney General for India
Mr. Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General
Mr. S.K. Bagaria, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR
Mr. Kaushik Choudhury, Adv.
Mr. Shaantanu Jain, Adv.
Ms. Anusha Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Deepanshu Jain, Adv.
Mr. Achintya Kumar Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Kumar Ajit Singh, Adv.
Mr. Manish Jain, Adv.
Ms. Rashika Swarup, Adv.
Mr. Saksham Garg, Adv.
Mr. Jyotirmoy Chatterjee, Adv.
Mr. Sachin Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Kanika Kalaiyarasan, Adv.
Mr. Raman Chitwan Singh, Adv.
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR
Mr. Prashat Rawat, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Tapes Kumar Singh, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Sansriti Pathak, AOR
Mr. Eklavya Dwivedi, Adv.
Mr. Sukant Vikram, Adv.
Mr. Prashant Bhardwaj, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.
Mr. Amarjeet Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Vijay Hansaria, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Jain, Adv.
Ms. Abha Jain, AOR
Ms. Kavya Jhavar, Adv.
Mr. Pawanshree Agarwal, Adv.
Ms. Sneha Kalita, Adv.
Mr. Abhinav Hansaria, Adv.
Ms. Nandini Rai, Adv.
Mr. Jaivir Singh, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, A.S.G.
Mr. Gp. Capt. Karan Singh Bhati, AOR
Mr. Nithin Chowdary Pavuluri, Adv.
Ms. Poornima Singh, Adv.

Ms. Manisha Chava, Adv.
Ms. Shagun Thakur, Adv.
Ms. Bln Shivani, Adv.
Mr. Rustam Singh Chauhan, Adv.
Ms. Sthavi Asthana, Adv.
Mr. Ashwin Joseph, Adv.
Ms. Shreya Jain, Adv.
Ms. Shivika Mehra, Adv.
Ms. Anupriya Srivastava, Adv.
Ms. Anuradha Arputam, Adv.
Mr. Akshaj Singh, Adv.
Ms. Radhika Misra, Adv.
Mr. Sunit Chaudhary, Adv.
Mr. Vasu Vats, Adv.
Ms. Riddhi Jad, Adv.
Mr. Abhinav Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Harish N Salve, Sr. Adv.
Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR
Mr. Jaydeep Patel, Adv.
Mr. S. Mahesh Sahasranaman, Adv.
Ms. Shilpa Balani, Adv.
Mr. Vishnu Sharma A S, Adv.
Mr. Tushar Bhardwaj, Adv.
Mr. Manan Shishodia, Adv.
Mr. Prakhar Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Arvind P. Datar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rahul Unnikrishnan, Adv.
Mr. Kumar Visalaksh, Adv.
Mr. Udit Jain, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Vikas, AOR

Mr. Tapesk Kumar Singh, AAG, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rajiv Shanker Dvivedi, Adv.
Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR
Mr. Beenu Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Venkat Narayan, Adv.

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

Ms. Ruchira Goel, AOR

Mr. Abhishek Gupta, AOR

Mr. Amit Anand Tiwari, Sr. A.A.G.
Mr. Sabarish Subramanian, AOR
Mr. C. Kranthi Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Devyani Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Vishnu Unnikrishnan, Adv.
Ms. Tanvi Anand, Adv.
Ms. Saushriya Havelia A, Adv.
Mr. Naman Dwivedi, Adv.

Mr. Danish Saifi, Adv.
Ms. Arjoo Rawat, Adv.
Mr. Sarathraj B, Adv.

Ms. Nilofar Khan, AOR

Mr. G. N. Reddy, AOR

Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR
Mr. Vishal Meghwal, Adv.
Dr. Charu Mathur, Adv.
Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, Adv.
Mrs. Abhinandini Sharma, Adv.
Mr. B.s. Rajesh Agrajit, Adv.
Mr. Abhijeet Shah, Adv.
Mr. Harsha Vinoy, Adv.
Ms. Priya Nagar, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Goswami, Adv.
Mr. Aakash Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Jyoti Rana, Adv.

Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, A.A.G.
Ms. Abhinandini Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, Adv.
Ms. Shalini Singh, Adv.
Mr. Deepak Verma, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Amogh Bansal, Adv.
Mr. Saurabh Rajpal, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR

Mr. T. Harish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Ajay Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. R.P. Aggarwal, Adv.
Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR

Mr. Saurabh Mishra, A.A.G.
Ms. Ankita Choudhary, A.A.G.
Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR
Mr. Sandeep Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Karan Bishnoi, Adv.

Mr. Sunil Roy, AOR

Ms. Ritika Gambhir Kohli, AOR
Mr. Omar Ahmad, Adv.
Mr. Vikram Shah, Adv.
Mr. Tuhin Dey, Adv.
Mr. Nikhil Kohli, Adv.
Mr. Kushank Garg, Adv.

Ms. Kritika Khurana, Adv.
Ms. Shrishti Jeswani, Adv.

Mr. Arjun Garg, AOR

M/S. Ars Associates, AOR

Mr. V. K. Verma, AOR

Mr. Praveen Kumar, AOR

Mr. Ajit Kumar Sinha, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, AOR

Mrs. Manik Karanjawala, AOR

Ms. Ankita Sharma, AOR
Mr. Arjun D Singh, Adv.
Mr. Apurv Kurup, A.A.G.

Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR

Mr. Prafull N Bharat, Adv. Gen./Sr. Adv.
Mr. Bishwajit Dubey, A.A.G.
Mr. Atul Jha, A.A.G.
Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, D.A.G.
Mr. Praneet Pranav, D.A.G.
Mr. Vinayak Sharma, Standing Counsel, Adv.
Mr. Apoorv Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Ravinder Kumar Yadav, AOR
Mr. Vinay Mohan Sharma, Adv.
Mrs. Prabhleen Apoorv Shukla, Adv.
Ms. Kritika Yadav, Adv.

Ms. Devina Sehgal, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR

Mr. K. Parameshwar, A.A.G.
Mr. Rajeev Kumar Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Kamendra Mishra, AOR

Mr. Santosh Krishnan, AOR
Mr. Abhish Kumar, AOR
Mr. Ramendra Mohan Patnaik, AOR
Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR
Ms. Punam Kumari, AOR

Ms. Mrinal Gopal Elker, AOR
Mr. Saurabh Singh, Adv.

Mr. Rohit K. Singh, AOR

Mr. Pritam Biswas, Adv.
Mr. Prakhar Srivastava, Adv.
Ms. Pratibha Malviya, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR
Ms. Manjula Gupta, AOR
Mr. Harsh Parashar, AOR

Ms. Pragati Neekhra, AOR
Mr. Aditya Bhanu Neekhra, Adv.
Mr. Atul Dong, Adv.
Mr. Aniket Patel, Adv.

Mr. Prem Sunder Jha, AOR

Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Agrawala,, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Saigal, Adv.
Mr. M.S. Ananth, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Saraswat, Adv.
Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Kedar Nath Tripathy, AOR

Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR

Mrs. Vanita Bhargava, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Bhargava, Adv.
M/S. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Mr. Rutwik Panda, AOR
Ms. Nikhar Berry, Adv.
Ms. Anshu Malik, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Malhotra, AOR

Mr. Parijat Kishore, AOR

Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR
Mr. Ameet Singh, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Swarup, Adv.
Ms. Pareena Swarup, Adv.
Mr. Ravi Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Devesh Maurya, Adv.
Mr. K.p. Singh, Adv.
Ms. Payal Swarup, Adv.
Mr. Nityanand Mahato, Adv.

Mr. Gopal Prasad, AOR

Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Mr. Kartik Seth, Adv.
Ms. Maithili Moondra, Adv.
Mr. Prashanth Dixit, Adv.
Mr. Raghav Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Mahesh Bhati, Adv.
Mr. Saurabh Chaturvedi, Adv.
Mr. Chiranjeev Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Pushkin Tandon, Adv.
M/S. Chambers Of Kartik Seth, AOR

Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Agrawala,, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Saigal, Adv.
Mr. M.s. Ananth, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Saraswat, Adv.
Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

M/S. Trilegal Advocates On Record, AOR

Mr. Sudipta Bhattacharjee, Adv.
Mr. Onkar, Adv.
Mr. Rajat Mittal, AOR
Mr. Arjyadeep Roy, Adv.
Mr. Suprateek Neogi, Adv.

Mr. Vivek Sharma, AOR
Dr. Vijay Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Anand Varma, AOR
Ms. Apoorva Pandey, Adv.
Ms. Adyasha Nanda, Adv.

Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv.
Mr. Rishi Agrawala,, Adv.
Mr. Ankur Saigal, Adv.
Mr. M.S. Ananth, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
Mr. Himanshu Saraswat, Adv.
Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR
Mr. Ameet Siingh, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Swarup, Adv.
Ms. Pareena Swarup, Adv.
Mr. Ravi Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Devesh Maurya, Adv.
Mr. K.P. Singh, Adv.
Ms. Payal Swarup, Adv.
Mr. Nityanand Mahato, Adv.

Mr. Akshat Shrivastava, AOR

Mr. Manish Kumar Saran, AOR

Ms. Anuradha Dutt, Adv.

Ms. Fereshte D. Sethna, Adv.

Ms. Suman Yadav, Adv.

Ms. Priyanka M.P., Adv.

Mr. Haaris Fazili, Adv.

Mr. Kunal Dutt, Adv.

Mr. Yash Mittal, Adv.

Mr. Raghav Dutt, Adv.

Ms. B. Vijayalakshmi Menon, AOR

Mr. S.P. Singh, Sr. Adv.

Sheenu Chauhan, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Malhotra, Adv.

Ms. Prerna Singh, Adv.

Mr. Guntur Pramod Kumar, AOR

Mr. Keshav Singh, Adv.

Mr. Samarath Luthra, Adv.

Mr. Dhruv Yadav, Adv.

Mr. MKS Menon Adv.

Ms. Usha Nandini, AOR

Mr. Biju P Raman, Adv.

Mr. Shashank Menon, Adv.

Mr. Amit Mital, Adv.

Mr. John Thomas Arakal, Adv.

- 1 Hon'ble Dr Justice Dhananjaya Y Chandrachud, Chief Justice of India pronounced the judgment on behalf of himself, Hon'ble Mr Justice Hrishikesh Roy, Hon'ble Mr Justice Abhay S Oka, Hon'ble Mr Justice J B Pardiwala, Hon'ble Mr Justice Manoj Misra, Hon'ble Mr Justice Ujjal Bhuyan, Hon'ble Mr Justice Satish Chandra Sharma and Hon'ble Mr Justice Augustine George Masih.
- 2 Hon'ble Ms Justice B V Nagarathna pronounced a separate dissenting judgment.
- 3 The Reference is answered in terms of the majority judgment pronounced by Hon'ble the Chief Justice of India.

- 4 The Registry is directed to obtain administrative directions from the Chief Justice of India for placing the matters before an appropriate Bench.
- 5 Counsel for the appellants submitted that the judgment may be given prospective effect. Since this suggestion has come after the pronouncement of the judgment, list the matters on 31 July 2024 before this Bench for considering the suggestion.

(SANJAY KUMAR-I)
ADDITIONAL REGISTRAR

(SAROJ KUMARI GAUR)
ASSISTANT REGISTRAR