

(PH)

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) NO.183 OF 2003

BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LTD.& ANR.

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln(s) for directions and exemption from filing O.T.,stay and recalling the court's order and impleading party and amendment of petition and directions)

WITH W.P(C) NO. 144 of 2004

(With appln(s) for stay)

(With office report)

W.P(C) NO. 145 of 2004

W.P(C) NO. 149 of 2004

(With appln(s) for ex-Parte stay)

S.L.P.(C) NO. 15442 of 2005

(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

S.L.P.(C) NO. 15443 of 2005

(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

S.L.P.(C) NO. 15444 of 2005

(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

S.L.P.(C) NO. 15451 of 2005

(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

S.L.P.(C) NO. 15452 of 2005

(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15453 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15454 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15455 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15456 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15457 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

:2:

S.L.P.(C) NO. 15458 of 2005
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15459 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15460 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15461 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)
(With prayer for interim relief and office report)
S.L.P.(C) NO. 15462 of 2005
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

S.L.P.(C) NO. 15464 of 2005

(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

W.P(C) NO. 162 of 2005

W.P(C) NO. 223 of 2003

(With appln(s) for stay)

(With office report)

W.P(C) NO. 227 of 2003

(With appln(s) for stay)

(With office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 2408 of 2002

(With office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 2471 of 2005

(With appln(s) for ex-Parte stay,permission to place addl. documents on record)

(With office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 2517-2518 of 2004

(With office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 3086 of 2004

(With appln.for to seek interlocutory order restraining the respondents for levying coercive action for

recovery of claims)

Civil Appeal NO. 3329-3330 of 2002

(With office report)

CONMT.PET.(C) NO. 365 of 2004

(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T.)

W.P(C) NO. 372 of 2003

(With appln(s) for ex-Parte stay)

(With office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 4278-4288 of 2002

(With appln(s) for permission)

(With office report)

W.P(C) NO. 450 of 2003

(With appln(s) for ex-Parte stay)

(With office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 5337-5338 of 2001

(With office report)

S.L.P.(C) NO. 5447 of 2003

(with appln.for restraining the respondents for levying coercive steps)

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

:3:

S.L.P.(C) NO. 6301 of 2004

(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP)

(With office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 6323-6325 of 1999

(With office report)

SLP(C)No. 17281/2005

(With appln. for c/d in filing SLP and with prayer for interim relief)

SLP(C)Nos. 17286-17288/2005

(With appln. for c/d in filing SLP and with prayer for interim relief and office report)

SLP(C)No. 22569/2005

(With appln. for exem. form filing OT and with prayer for interim relief and office report)

W.P.(C)No. 468/2005

Date: 24/11/2005 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MRS. JUSTICE RUMA PAL

HON'BLE DR. JUSTICE AR. LAKSHMANAN

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE DALVEER BHANDARI

For appearing parties:Mr.Harish N. Salve,Sr.Adv.

For BSNL: Mr. K.Parasaran,Sr.Adv.

Mr. Maninder Singh,Adv.

Ms. Pratibha M.Singh,Adv.

Mr. S.Fernanades,Adv.

Mr. Tejveer Singh,adv.

Mr. Y.Handoo,adv.
Ms. Aprajita Singh,Adv.
Ms. Meenakshi Grover,Adv.
Mr. Ankur Talwar,Adv.
Mr. Saurabh Misra,Adv.

Mr. A.M.Singhvi,Sr.Adv.
Ms. Ritu Bhalla,Adv.
Mr. K.S.Nagra,adv.for
M/s SA Shroff & Co.

Mr. HN Salve,Sr.Adv.
Mr. C.S.Vaidyanathan,Sr.adv.
Mr. N.Venkataramani,Adv.
Mr. M.Saffique,adv.

Mr. S.Nandakumar,adv.
Mr. Dalip Kapoor,adv.
Mr. M.Bajpai,Adv.
Ms. Rakhi Ray,adv.
Ms. Bina Gupta,Adv.

-4-

Mr. H.N.Salve,Sr.adv.
Mr. K.R.Sasiprabhu,adv.
Mr. C.S.Vaidyanathan,Sr.adv.
Mr. S.K.Virmani,Adv.
Ms. Bina Gupta,adv.
Ms. Rakhi Ray,adv.
Mr. Lakshmikumaran,adv.
Ms. Bina Gupta,adv.
Ms. Rakhi Ray,adv.
Mr. K.Parasaran,Sr.Adv.

Mr. H.N.Salve, Sr. Adv.

Mr. K.K.Mani, Adv.

Mr. N.Prasad, adv.

Mr. K.B.Sandeep, adv.

Mr. Gopal Singh, Adv.

Mr. R.Biswas, Adv.

Mr. Aruneshwar Gupta ,Adv

Mr. Ashok Mathur ,Adv

Mr. B.B. Singh ,Adv.

Mr. Kumar Rajesh Singh, Adv.

Ms. Kamini Jaiswal ,Adv.(NP)

Mr. P.N. Ramalingam ,Adv

Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain ,Adv.

Mr. A.P.Dhamija, adv.

Mr. Ram Niwas, adv.

Mr. B.K.Sharma, adv.

Mrs. D.B.Reddy, adv.

Mr. S.R.Hegde, Adv.

Mr. Anil K.Mishra, Adv.

Mr. A.Rohan Singh, Adv.

Mr. R.Mukherjee, Adv.

Mr. M.K.Giri, adv.

Mr. B.R.Jad, adv.

Mr. D.A.Dave, Sr. Adv.

M/s. P.D.Tyagi, R.K.Dwivedi, Ajay Chaudhary,

B.Singh,T.Dhamani,N.Goyal,P.Singh and A.Bansal,adv.

For Reliance Mr. K.Parasaran,Sr.Adv.

Information Mr. V.Balaji,Ms.M.Kumari and

Mr. K.R.Sasiprabhu,adv.

Mr. G.Prabhakar,adv.

Mr. S.Prasad,adv.

Mr. J.K.Bhatia,adv.

Ms. Kavita Wadia,adv.

Mr. Prakash Srivastava,adv.

State of Nagaland: Mr.U.Hazarika,Adv.

Mr.Satya Mitra,Adv.

Ms.Sumita Hazarika,Adv.

State of U.P.: Mr. Ashok H.Desai,Sr.Adv.

Mr. Sunil Gupta,Sr,Adv.

Mr. Ravi P.Mehrotra,Adv.

Mr. Garvesh Kabra,Adv.

Mr. Vivek Vishnoi,Adv.

Mr. P.Kalra,adv.

State of Rajasthan: Mr.Aruneshwar Gupta,AAG

Mr.Naveen Kumar,Adv.

Govt.of Pondicherry: Mr.V.G.Pragasam,Adv.

State of Assam: Mr.V.K.Sidharthan,Adv.

Mr.Riku Sarma,Adv.for

M/s Corporate Law Group

State of M.P.: Ms.Vibha Datta Makhija,Adv.

Mr.Vishwajit Singh,Adv.

For all U.Ts. Mr.S.Wasim A.Qadri,Adv.

Mr.D.S. Mahara ,Adv .

Mr.A.K.Panda ,Sr.Adv .

Mr.Sanjeev K.Pabbi ,Adv .

Ms.Shikha Roy ,Adv .

Mr.S.K.Sabharwal ,Adv .

-6-

Mr. Ashok H.Desai ,Sr.Adv .

Mr. Sunil Gupta ,Sr.Adv .

M/s. K.Gulati ,K.Mishra ,
R.K.Dubey and R.Singh ,adv .

Mr. Anil Shrivastava ,aDv .

Mr. S.Shrivastava ,adv .

Mr. Ajay Siwach ,adv .

Mr. T.V.George ,adv .

For MTNL

Mr. C.S.Vaidyanathan ,Sr.Adv .

Mr. P.Tripathi ,Sr.Adv .

M/s. V.K.Rao ,Madhu Sikri and
Ravi Sikri ,Adv .

For State of H.P.

Mr. J.S.Attri ,adv .

Ms. Shivani Thakur ,adv .

For Kerala

Mr. T.L.V.Iyer ,Sr.Adv .

Mr. Ramesh Babu M.R.Adv .

Mr. V.Lakshmi Kumaran ,adv .

Mr. Alok Yadav ,adv .

Mr. Rajesh Kumar ,adv .

State of W.Bengal :

Mr.Rakesh Dwivedi ,Sr.Adv .

Mr.Dayan Krishnan ,Adv .

Mr.Avijit Bhattacharjee ,Adv .

Mr.Sumit Purkayastha,Adv.

State of Punjab: Ms. Kiran Suri,adv.
Mr. Sanjay Jain,adv.

For State of Orissa: Mr. A.K.Ganguli,Sr.adv.
Ms. K.Mishra,adv.

For UOI: Mr. G.E.Vahanavati,SGI.
Mr. P.P.Malhotra,ASG.
Mr. Rajiv Dutta,Sr.adv.
Mr. WAS Qadri,adv.
Mr. R.Singh,adv.
Mr. V.K.Verma,adv.

State of Maharashtra: Mr. V.N.Raghupathy,adv.
Mr. R.K.Adsure,adv.

-7-

State of Gujarat: Ms.Hemtika Wahi,Adv.
Ms.Sadhana Sandhu,Adv.

State of U.P.: Mr. Ashok H.Desai,Sr.adv.
Mr.R.P.Mehrotra,Adv.
Mr.Garvesh Kabra,adv.
Mr.T.R.Andhyarujina,Sr.Adv.
Ms.Kiran Bhardwaj,Adv.
Mr.K.Batra,Adv.
Mr. H.C.Bhatia,adv.
Mrs.Anil Katiyar,adv.

State of Jharkhand: Ms. Pinky Anand,Sr.Std.Counsel
Mr. D.N.Goburdhan,adv.
Mr. Rajesh Pathak,adv.
Mr. R.P.Mehrotra,adv.

State of Manipur: Mr.KH Nobin Singh,Adv.

Mr.K.Parasaran,Sr.Adv.

Mr.KR Sasiprabhu,Adv.

Mr.V.Balaji,Adv.

State of A.P.: Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi,Sr.Adv.

Mr.Manoj Saxena,Adv.

Mr.Amit Meharia,Adv.

Mr.D.Borkakati,Adv.

Mr.M.P. Meharia,Adv.

State of Sikkim: Mr.A.Mariarputham,Adv.

Ms.Aruna Mathur,Adv.

Ms.Vimla Sinha,Adv.

Mr.Pradeep Misra,Adv.

For Chhattisgarh: Ms.Suparna Srivastava,Adv.

Ms.Deepti Singh,Adv.

Mr.Rajesh Srivastava,Adv.

State of W.Bengal: Mr.Rakesh Dwivedi,Sr.Adv.

Mr.Dayan Krishnan,Adv.

Mr.Gautam Narayan,Adv.

Mr.Avijit Bhattacharjee,Adv.

-8-

State of Punjab: Mr.Sarup Singh,AAG

Mr.Arun K.Sinha,Adv.

Mr.Dhruv Mehta,Adv.

Mr.Harshvardhan Jha,for

Mr. Y.S.Deora,adv.

M/s K.L. Mehta & Co.

State of T.Nadu:

Mr. S.Balakrishnan, Sr.adv.

Mr.S.Prasad, Adv.

Mr.R.S.Srivatsa, adv.

Mr.Abhay Kumar, adv.

IA.No.14 in

Mr.S.Ganesh, Sr.Adv.

WP(C)183/03 for

Mr.S.Sukumaran, Adv.

Intervenor:

Mr.A.Deb Kumar, Adv.

Mr.K.Rajeev, Adv.

Mr.CD Singh, Adv.

Mr.Gunratan Pandey, Adv.

Ms.Kiran Suvarna, Adv.

Ms.D.Bharati Reddy, Adv.

Mr.P.Vinay Kumar, Adv.

Ms.Sneha Bhaskaran, Adv.

Mr.P.Venugopal, Adv.

Mr.Harshad V.Hameed, Adv.for

M/s K. John & Co.

UPON hearing counsel the Court made the following

O R D E R

resumed his

Mr. Sunil Gupta, learned senior counsel

arguments at 10.305 a.m. and was on his legs when the Court rose for the day. The matters remained part-heard.

(Kanwal Singh)

(Suman Wadhwa)

Court Master

Court Master