

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA
CIVIL APPELLATE JURISDICTION

CIVIL APPEAL NO. 2543 OF 2006

C.C.E., MUMBAI

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

M/S. MAHINDRA & MAHINDRA LTD.

Respondent(s)

WITH

CIVIL APPEAL NO. 957 OF 2010

O R D E R

There is a conflict of opinion between two Benches of the Customs Excise and Service Tax Appellate Tribunal (hereinafter referred to as 'the Tribunal')

In Appeal No.E/394/01, the Tribunal passed an order on 19th July, 2005 holding that the vehicles manufactured by the assessee falls under Entry 87.02.00 of the Central Excise Tariff Act, 1985 (hereinafter referred to as 'the Act')

However, in Appeal No. E/2053/05, decided on 7th December, 2009, the Tribunal has taken the view that the

vehicles manufactured by the assessee falls under

Entry 87.03.00 of the Act.
Digitally signed by Meenakshi Kohli

Date: 2014.08.29
16:18:04 IST
Reason:

Since two Benches of the same strength of Members have taken two conflicting views, we are of the opinion that

judicial discipline requires that instead of disagreeing with the view taken by the first Bench, the appropriate course for the second Bench would have been to refer the matter to a larger Bench. This is the basic requirement of judicial discipline. Since this has not been done, we set aside both orders and remand both the appeals back to the Tribunal and request its President to constitute a larger Bench of three Members to decide the issue whether the vehicles manufactured by the assessee falls under Entry 87.02.00 or 87.03.00 of the Act.

We make it clear that we have not expressed any view on the merits of the case and all contentions are open to both the parties in support of their respective stand.

The interim order passed by this Court on 8th February, 2010 in C.A. No. 957 of 2010 will continue till the disposal of the appeals by the Tribunal.

Since the matters pertain, inter alia, to Classification List of 1992, we request the Tribunal to make an effort to expedite the hearing of the appeals.

Appeals are disposed of. No costs.

.....J
(MADAN B. LOKUR)

.....J
(C. NAGAPPAN)

NEW DELHI
AUGUST 27, 2014
3

4

ITEM NO.102	COURT NO.11	SECTION III
S U P R E M E C O U R T O F		I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS		
Civil Appeal No(s).	2543/2006	
C.C.E., MUMBAI		Appellant(s)
VERSUS		
M/S. MAHINDRA & MAHINDRA LTD.		Respondent(s)
(with appln. (s) for permission to file addl. documents and office report)		

