

ITEM NO.1504

COURT NO.1

SECTION III-A

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal Nos. 10866-10867/2010

M.SIDDIQ (D) THR. LRS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

MAHANT SURESH DAS & ORS. ETC.

Respondent(s)

WITH

C.A. No. 4768-4771/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 2636/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 821/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 4739/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 4905-4908/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 2215/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 4740/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 2894/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 6965/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 4192/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 5498/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 7226/2011 (III-A)
C.A. No. 8096/2011 (III-A)
Diary No(s). 22744/2017 (XI)

Date : 27-09-2018 This matter was called on for pronouncement of judgment today.

For Appellant(s)

Mr. C.S. Vaidyanathan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S.S. Shamsery, Adv.
Mr. P.K. Singh, Adv.
Ms. Aditi, Adv.
Mr. Anirudh Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep Singh, Adv.
Mr. Pranav Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Ashish Kumar Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Bhuvan Jayant, Adv.
Mr. Y. Lokesh, Adv.
Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran, AOR

Dr. Rajeev Dhavan, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Raju Ramachandran, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR
Mr. Shahid Nadeem Ansari, Adv.
Ms. Avani Bansal, Adv.
Mr. C. George Thomas, Adv.
Ms. Akriti Chaubey, Adv.
Ms. Qurratulain, Adv.
Ms. Tanya Shree, Adv.
Mr. Kunwar Aditya Singh, Adv.
Mr. Wasif Rahman Khan, Adv.
Mr. Ishwar Mohanty, Adv.
Ms. Hamsini Shankar, Adv.
Mr. Zain Maqbool, Adv.
Ms. Priyanshi Jaiswal, Adv.

Mr. Yusuf Hatim Muchhala, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Zafaryab Jilani, Adv.
Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR
Mr. C. George Thomas, Adv.
Ms. Akriti Chaubey, Adv.
Ms. Qurratulain, Adv.
Ms. Tanya Shree, Adv.
Mr. Kunwar Aditya Singh, Adv.

Mr. Shakil Ahmed Syed, AOR
Mr. Mohd. Parvez Dabas, Adv.
Mr. Uzmi Jameel Husain, Adv.
Mr. Pulkit Chandna, Adv.
Mr. M. Tayab Khan, Adv.
Mr. Mujeebuddin Khan, Adv.
Mr. Niaz Ahmed Farooqui, Adv.
Mr. Milan Laskar, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. M.R. Shamshad, AOR
Mr. Nizam Pasha, Adv.
Mr. Zaki Ahmad Khan, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Samaddar, Adv.
Ms. Sarah Haque, Adv.

Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR
Mr. Syed Mansoor Ali, Adv.
Mr. Zeeshan Rizvi, Adv.
Mr. M. Tayyab Khan, Adv.
Mr. Mujeebur Rehman, Adv.

Mr. Prakash Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Anuj Saxena, Adv.
Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR

Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, Adv.
Mr. D. Bharat Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Yash Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv.
Ms. Indira Bhakhar, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Singh, Adv.
Mr. Vineet Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. T. Bhaskar Gowtham, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

M/s. Fox Mandal & Co., AOR
Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AOR
Mr. Vishnu Shankar Jain, AOR
Mr. M.C. Dhingra, AOR
Mr. Sanjeev Malhotra, AOR

For Respondent(s)

Mr. Maninder Singh, ASG
Mr. Aman Sinha, Sr. Adv.
Mr. R. Balasubramanian, Adv.
Mr. B.V. Balram Das, AOR
Mr. B. Krishna Prasad, AOR

Mr. Tushar Mehta, ASG
Mr. Raghvendra Singh, Sr. Adv./A.G., U.P.
Mr. Madan Mohan Pandey, AAG, U.P.
Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, AAG, U.P.
Mr. Kamendra Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Tyagi, Adv.
Mr. Rajeev Kumar Dubey, Adv.
Mr. Aviral Saxena, Adv.
Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
Mr. Manan Popli, Adv.
Mr. Upendra Mishra, Adv.

Mr. C.S. Vaidyanathan, Sr. Adv.
Mr. S.S. Shamsery, Adv.
Mr. P.K. Singh, Adv.
Ms. Aditi, Adv.
Mr. Anirudh Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep Singh, Adv.
Mr. Pranav Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Ashish Kumar Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. Bhuvan Jayant, Adv.
Mr. Y. Lokesh, Adv.
Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran, AOR

Mr. S.P. Singh, Sr. Adv.

Mr. M.C. Dhingra, AOR

Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, Adv.
Ms. Vidyottama, Adv.
Mr. Sai Deepak, Adv.
Mr. Ravindra Lokhande, Adv.
Mr. Harshit Kaushik, Adv.
Mr. Abhishek Atrey, AOR

Mr. Bhakti Vardhan Singh, AOR
Mr. Yash Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Singh Jangra, Adv.
Mr. Sarthak Nayak, Adv.
Mr. Shridhar Pottaraju, Adv.
Ms. Ankita Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Prakash Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Pathak, Adv.
Mr. Tushar Thareja, Adv.
Mr. Sayooj Mohandas, Adv.
Mr. Praneet Pranav, Adv.

Mr. S.S. Shamsbery, Adv.
Mr. D. Bharat Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Yash Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv.
Ms. Indira Bhakhar, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Singh, Adv.
Mr. Vineet Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Santosh Kumar, Adv.
Mr. T. Bhaskar Gowtham, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

Ms. Sucheta Joshi, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Sood, Adv.
Mr. Ankit Raj, Adv.
Mr. R.K. Rajvanshi, Adv.
Mr. Harshvardhan Singh Rathore, Adv.
Mr. Nachiketa Joshi, AOR

Mr. Fuzail Ahmad Ayyubi, AOR
Mr. Abdul Qadir, Adv.
Mr. Ibad Mushtaq, Adv.
Mr. Kauser Husain, Adv.

Mr. Saurabh Shyam Shamsbery, Adv.
Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv.
Mr. Avdhesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Rajendra Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Rita Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Deepshikha Bharati, Adv.
Mr. Nisarg Chaudhary, Adv.

Mr. Puneet Sheoran, Adv.
Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

Mr. Manoj Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Shweta Bharti, Adv.
Mr. Shantanu, Adv.
Mr. Anil Kumar Tiwari, Adv.
Mr. Amit Pawan, AOR

Mr. Ajit Singh Pundir, AOR
Mr. Arijeet Singh, Adv.
Mr. D.V. Singh, Adv.

Ms. Swarupama Chaturvedi, AOR
Mr. B.N. Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Devika Gulati, Adv.
Ms. Vaishali Verma, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Bansal, Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Yadava, Adv.
Ms. Veena Bansal, Adv.
Mr. B.K. Satija, AOR

Mr. P.V. Yogeswaran, AOR
Mr. Ashish K. Upadhyay, Adv.
Mr. V. Susheatha, Adv.
Mr. Buvan, Adv.

Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain, AOR
Mr. Karunesh Kumar Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Yasswyi Mishra, Adv.
Ms. Rachna Gandhi, Adv.

Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR
Mr. Chandra Shekhar Suman, Adv.
Mr. Avdhesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms. Rita Gupta, Adv.
Ms. Deepshikha Bharati, Adv.
Mr. Rajendra Kr. Singh, Adv.
Ms. Harsha, Adv.
Mr. Puneet Shoran, Adv.
Mr. Nisarg Chaudhary, Adv.
Mr. R.K. Rajwanshi, Adv.

Ms. Swarupama Chaturvedi, AOR
Mr. Anish Kumar Gupta, Adv.
Mr. B.N. Dubey, Adv.
Ms. Devika Gulati, Adv.
Mr. Kumar Gaurav, Adv.
Mr. Robin Khokhar, Adv.

Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv.

Mr. Pankaj Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr. Pawan Kumar Shukla, Adv.
Mr. Shiv Kumar Tiwari, Adv.
Mr. Yash Pal Dhingra, AOR

Mr. Barun Kumar Sinha, Adv.
Mrs. Pratibha Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Birendra Kumar Choudhary, Adv.
Mr. Arun Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Swatantra Rai, Adv.
Mr. B.K. Satija, AOR

Mr. Bhavanishankar V. Gadnis, Adv.
Mr. Vishwanath B. Gadnis, Adv.
Mr. Amit Pawan, AOR
Mr. Radni V. Gadnis, Adv.

Mr. Bhavanishankar V. Gadnis, Adv.
Mr. Vishwanath B. Gadnis, Adv.
Mr. Ashok Shrivastava, Adv.
Mr. Radni V. Gadnis, Adv.

Mr. Syed Shahid Hussain Rizvi, AOR
Mr. M.R. Shamshad, AOR
Mr. Md. Shahid Anwar, AOR
Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR
Mr. Shakil Ahmed Syed, AOR
Mr. Syed Mehdi Imam, AOR
Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR
M/s. Fox Mandal & Co., AOR
Mr. Mohd. Irshad Hanif, AOR
Mr. Lakshmi Raman Singh, AOR

Hon'ble Mr. Justice Ashok Bhushan pronounced the judgment on behalf of Hon'ble the Chief Justice and himself. In view of the signed reportable judgment, no case has been made out to refer the Constitution Bench judgment of this Court in *Dr. M. Ismail Faruqi and Ors. vs. Union of India and Ors., (1994) 6 SCC 360* for reconsideration.

Hon'ble Mr. Justice S. Abdul Nazeer pronounced separate judgment, disagreeing with the view expressed by

Hon'ble the Chief Justice and Hon'ble Mr. Justice Ashok Bhushan, and referred the issues to a larger Bench.

In view of the majority opinion, the appeals which are awaiting consideration by this Court for quite a long period, be now listed in week commencing 29th October, 2018 for hearing.

(Deepak Guglani)
Court Master

(H.S. Parasher)
Assistant Registrar
(signed reportable judgments are placed on the file)